

Delegated Report		Analysis sheet		Expiry Date:	31/08/2018
		N/A / attached		Consultation Expiry Date:	02/09/2018
Officer			Application Number(s)		
Laura Hazelton			2018/3205/P		
Application Address			Drawing Numbers		
Flat 1 21 Elsworthy Road London NW3 3DS			Please refer to decision notice		
PO 3/4	Area Team Signature	C&UD	Authorised Officer Signature		
Proposal(s)					
Extension of existing 2 storey rear bay window by additional 2m and erection of new balcony with railings and steps to garden at upper ground level.					
Recommendation(s):		Refuse planning permission			
Application Type:		Full Planning Permission			

Conditions or Reasons for Refusal:	Refer to Draft Decision Notice					
Informatives:						
Consultations						
Adjoining Occupiers:			No. of responses	01	No. of objections	01
			No. electronic	00		
Summary of consultation responses:	<p>A site notice was displayed from 03/08/2018 until 27/08/2018 and a press advert was placed on 09/08/2018.</p> <p>One objection was received from the owner of Flat 2, 21 Elsworthy Road, with concerns regarding the effect the proposed development would have on the ability to adapt and enjoy flat 2 as laid out.</p>					
CAAC/Local groups comments:	<p>One objection was received from the Elsworthy Residents Association:</p> <p><i>The application seeks to extend an extension that was finally granted in 1998 following three years of applications, revisions, withdrawn plans etc. The size and accommodation of the original house has already been substantially enlarged. In addition, permission was granted in 2007 for a garden pavilion that provides further living space.</i></p> <p><i>The introduction of two rooflights over the dining room will be the source of light pollution for the flats above and possibly neighbours.</i></p> <p><i>The proposed addition is visible, like the rest of the house, during winter months at least, from Primrose Hill.</i></p> <p>One objection was received from the Elsworthy Conservation Area Advisory Committee:</p> <p><i>We wish to confirm the submission of the ERA, and agree with the contents of the objections.</i></p>					

Site Description

The application building is a 4 storey semi-detached property divided into flats on the south side of Elsworthy Road. The lower ground and ground floor maisonette, which is the subject of the current application, benefits from a large rear garden backing onto (with direct access to) Primrose Hill, an area of designated Open Space.

The application site is not listed but is located within the Elsworthy Conservation Area and is described as making a positive contribution to the area within the conservation area statement.

Relevant History

21 Elsworthy Road (application site)

2007/1190/P - Erection of a pavilion in the rear garden for use ancillary to the ground floor flat. Granted 18/05/2007.

PE9700289R1 - Amendment to a planning permission granted on 7th March 1997 (Ref PE9606073R1) by the erection of a two storey rear extension instead of a single storey rear extension. Refused 08/08/1997, allowed at appeal 02/01/1998.

PE9606073R1 - Conversion to provide one maisonette on the lower ground and ground floor levels, one flat on the first floor and one maisonette on the upper floors and the erection of a single storey extension at rear lower ground level, a two storey side extension plus two storey extension on the existing side addition and the installation of dormer windows to the front, side and rear roof slopes. Granted 07/03/1997.

9500270 - The erection of an additional storey on the existing side extension, a metal external staircase and a dormer window on side elevation. Granted 25/05/1995.

Relevant policies

National Planning Policy Framework 2018

The London Plan March 2016

Draft London Plan 2018

Camden Local Plan 2017

Policy A1 Managing the impact of development

Policy D1 Design

Policy D2 Heritage

Camden Planning Guidance

CPG1 Design (July 2015, updated March 2018)

CPG Amenity (March 2018)

Elsworthy Conservation Area Appraisal and Management Strategy 2009

Assessment

1.0 Proposal

1.1 Planning permission is sought for the extension of the existing two storey rear bay window by an additional 2m, to increase it from 3.2m deep to 5.2m deep. The extension would be constructed of matching brickwork and the existing rear timber windows and doors would be re-used. The proposals include the installation of two new timber sash windows to the side elevation at lower ground and upper ground floor level and the creation of a new lantern rooflight above to match the existing in this location.

2.0 Assessment

2.1 The principle considerations in the determination of this application are as follows:

- Design (the impact of the proposal on the special character of the host building and wider Elsworthy Conservation Area),
- Amenity (impact on neighbouring amenity in terms of daylight/sunlight, outlook, noise and privacy).

3.0 Design

3.1 The Council's design policies are aimed at achieving the highest standard of design in all developments, including where alterations and extensions are proposed. Policy D1 of the Local Plan requires development to be of the highest architectural and urban design quality, which improves the function, appearance and character of the area; and Policy D2 states that the Council will preserve, and where appropriate, enhance Camden's rich and diverse heritage assets and their settings, including conservation areas and listed buildings. Camden's Development Policies Document is supported by CPG1 (Design) and the Elsworthy Conservation Area Statement.

3.2 Section 72(1) of the Planning (Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas) Act 1990 ("the Listed Buildings Act") is relevant, which requires that special attention be paid to the desirability of preserving or enhancing the character or appearance of a Conservation Area when considering applications relating to land or buildings within that Area.

3.3 The proposals involve the extension of the existing two storey bay window (previously extended by the erection of an extra storey at upper ground floor level (allowed at appeal on 25/05/1995). The extension would follow the same design, proportions and fenestration but would increase the depth of the bay window from 3.2m to 5.2m. It would be constructed of matching brickwork and the existing timber windows would be reused. A new lantern rooflight would be installed above to match the size and design of the existing rooflight in this location.

3.4 Although the detailed design of the proposed extension is considered acceptable as it would effectively replicate the existing bay window, the proposed increase in depth is not supported. The projection would no longer appear as a traditional bay window, but would be disproportionately long, appearing more like a wing than a bay window. The extension would not appear as a subordinate and subservient addition to the host building, causing harm to its original proportions and character. CPG1 (Design) advises that rear extensions should be designed to be secondary to the building being extended, in terms of location, form, scale, proportions, dimensions and detailing; and that they should respect and preserve the original design and proportions of the building, including its architectural period and style. In this instance, the proposed extension would overwhelm the host building and would not respect the existing proportions or architectural style.

3.5 Likewise, section 12 of the Elsworthy Conservation Area Statement emphasises that new development within the conservation area should show special consideration to the elevational treatment, scale, bulk and massing of buildings and respect the traditional forms of the conservation area. It highlights that extensions that negatively affect the scale, symmetry or relative dominance of parts of existing buildings can have a detrimental impact on the character and appearance of the area. Extensions should be subsidiary to the existing building and not detract from its character by becoming over-dominant. The proposed extension would not comply with this guidance and would represent an over-dominant form of development.

3.6 Furthermore, the rear of the application site backs directly onto Primrose Hill, where there are clear views of the application building and the wider terrace. The Elsworthy Conservation Area Statement highlights the importance of the views from the summit:

The highest point in the vicinity is the summit of Primrose Hill, one of London's royal parks, which has spectacular panoramic views of the capital over Regent's Park to the south-west, and over the Elsworthy Conservation Area to the north and north-west. In the foreground, there are views of the backs of properties along Elsworthy Road and Avenue Road.

3.7 It goes on describe how the properties in Elsworthy Terrace and parts of Elsworthy Road directly back onto Primrose Hill, which although outside the Conservation Area is a Royal Park and Metropolitan Open Land and a Site of Nature Conservation Importance as defined in the London Borough of Camden Replacement Unitary Development Plan June 2006. The integral visual relationship with the complementary, open rural aspect of Primrose Hill is a marked characteristic of the Conservation Area. Any rear extensions or harmful alterations in the locations cited will be strongly discouraged.

3.8 The Conservation Area Statement also notes that there are many interesting examples of historic rear elevations within the conservation area and that the original historic pattern of rear elevations within a street or group of buildings is an integral part of the character and appearance of the Conservation Area. As such, rear extensions will not be acceptable where they would compromise the special character.

3.9 Aside from the mansion block adjacent to the site (nos.17-19), the majority of the properties within the surrounding terrace still feature their original two storey bay windows. The application site is the only property that has extended this window. It is noted that a two storey extension has been erected to the rear of no.15 (adjacent to the bay window feature); however, this development is historic, considered harmful to the appearance of the rear elevation of the building and wider terrace, and is not considered to set a precedent for future development in this area. As such, the proposed extension is considered to harm the character and appearance of the host building and wider conservation area by reason of its excessive size.

3.10 The proposals also involve the removal of the existing metal spiral staircase and the erection of an upper ground floor balcony which would wrap around the entirety of the rear elevation, projecting 1m from the extended bay window and 2m from the original rear elevation, with a staircase down to garden level. The balcony would be surrounded by 1.1m high railings, although limited detail has been provided within the application submission as to their detailed design. These details would be secured by condition if the application were considered acceptable in all other regards.

3.11 The balcony area is considered excessively large, with an overall area of approximately 19sqm. Together, the new balcony and railings (which would measure 8.6m long) would mask the original architectural detailing of the rear elevation and appear as an excessively large structure.

3.12 The proposed rooflight would match the size design of the existing rooflight, would be subject to limited views given its location above the extension, and as such, would preserve the character and appearance of the existing building.

3.13 On balance, the proposed rear extension, balcony and railings are considered unacceptable by reason of their size and massing which would overwhelm the host building and would not respect its original proportions and architectural detailing. The proposed development would be highly visible from neighbouring properties and Primrose Hill to the rear of the site, and as such would be harmful to the character and appearance of the host building and wider Elsworthy Conservation Area, contrary to policies D1 and D2 of the Camden Local Plan.

4.0 Amenity

4.1 Policies A1 and A4 seek to protect the amenity of Camden's residents by ensuring the impact of development is fully considered and would not harm the amenity of neighbouring residents. This includes privacy, outlook, noise, daylight and sunlight.

4.2 Due to the location and nature of the proposals, they are not considered to have a significant impact on neighbouring amenity in terms of daylight/sunlight or outlook. Although the proposals include the installation of two new windows to the side of the extension facing no.23, these would not directly face any neighbouring windows, and as such, would not result in a loss of privacy for the neighbouring occupants.

4.3 An additional lantern rooflight would be added above the rear extension to match the size and detailing of the existing rooflight in this location. Concerns have been raised that the rooflight would result in harmful

lightspill to the flat above, which has windows directly overlooking it. However, the rooflight would be positioned adjacent to an existing rooflight, which itself sits closer to the neighbouring window. The new rooflight would serve the same dining room which would be extended. As such, the proposed rooflight is unlikely to materially increase lightspill from this room.

4.4 It is likely that the proposed rear balcony will result in noise disturbance and harm to neighbouring privacy due to its large footprint, projection from the rear elevation and raised position at upper ground level, where it would allow views into the neighbouring windows at both 23 and 17-19 Elsworthy Road on either side of the application site. As such, this would also form a reason for refusal.

5.0 Conclusion

5.1 The proposed rear extension and associated balcony are considered excessively large, causing harm to the character, proportions and architectural detail of the host building and wider Elsworthy Conservation Area, as well as the privacy of neighbouring residents, and as such would be contrary to policies A1, D1 and D2 of the Camden Local Plan.

6.0 Recommendation

6.1 Refuse planning permission