

Application No:	Consultees Name:	Consultees Addr:	Received:	Comment:	Response:
2017/4690/P	Diane May	5 Eton Villas London NW3 4SX	06/09/2017 11:45:09	OBJ	2 PROVOST ROAD, LONDON NW3 REF: 2017/4690/P, 2017/4702/L

I object strongly to the above proposals for 2 Provost Road for the following reasons:

1. The proposed dormers are unacceptable. The case for symmetry with the oversized dormers at No 1 Provost Road is no argument for unacceptable development which will harm the integrity of the existing roofline and the building as a whole; the group value of the listed buildings on Provost Road and cause an unacceptable intrusion into the conservation area. The projection forward of the proposed dormers will make them appear oversized in the street scene; dominate the roof line and invade the privacy of the occupiers of No.3 Provost Road.
2. Internal alterations: These do not appear to be minor alterations as stated in the Heritage Statement, particularly at first and 2nd floor level where they will significantly alter the internal floor plan; the external character of the listed building and remove original fabric. The cumulative impact of the proposals will have a harmful impact on the integrity of the listed building.

The proposals are contrary to the guidelines established in the Eton Conservation Area Appraisal; the Council's Design Guidelines set out in CPG 1 and policies of the Development Plan.

1. The proposed dormers are unacceptable

The applicant's Heritage Statement identifies the proposed dormer windows as a 'key change' to the property, involving 'a change to the historic roof arrangement' to match that of No.1 and 'will return the symmetry that was originally part of the design of the pair of villas and will preserve, if not enhance, the appearance of the building as a whole'.

This is a specious argument and very poor justification for the proposed dormers at No 2 Provost Road. It is one that is used frequently to justify oversized dormers on Provost Road, particularly in recent years, as applicants new to the area are unaware of, or choose to ignore, the planning history of properties on Provost Road and the key principles of the area's conservation status.

The buildings on Provost Road (1-14) were listed in 1974 primarily for their group value. Their symmetry lies in the architecture of the semi detached Victorian villas; the roof line with modest dormers that exist in the street scene and the gaps between the buildings which allow glimpses through to the rear.

The planning records show that the dormer windows at No.1 Provost Road were approved in April 1966. This pre-dates the listing of the properties on Provost Road and the designation of the Eton Conservation Area in 1973. Indeed the dormer windows at No 1 predate Camden's Development Plans, Policies and Guidelines which are a material consideration in the control of development. These have consistently aimed to 'preserve

Application No: Consultees Name: Consultees Addr: Received:

Comment: Response:

and enhance' the character and appearance of conservation areas (Policy DP25 b) [Conserving Camden's Heritage] and ensure that in respect of listed buildings 'only grant consent foralterations and extensions where it is considered this would not cause harm to the special interest of the building' (Policy DP 25 f).

In the past the Council has regarded the roofline of properties on Provost Road as being of 'special interest'. In respect of No 2, the Council has recognised that this is one of the few remaining un- interrupted rooflines on Provost Road. In 1995 the Council refused planning and listed building consent for '2 new dormers in the side roof' at 2 Provost Road on the grounds that 'the proposed dormers would have an adverse effect on the character and appearance of the listed building.' This was upheld at appeal and a decision to refuse the application was issued on 21st August 1995.

It is quite clear that the proposed dormer windows will be considerably larger than those of its neighbours in Provost Road and undermine their listing for group value. Few, if any of the dormers on Provost Road are symmetrical; they are however generally modest in appearance and sit politely in the slope of the roof without projecting intrusively into the street view. The proposed dormers at No.2 Provost Road face into the conservation area and will be intrusive in the street scene and harmful to the character and appearance of the conservation area. Their size also means that they will project forward dominating the roof line and causing a degree of loss of privacy for the occupiers of No.3 Provost Road. This has been recognised by officers elsewhere on Provost Road in similar circumstances.

2. Internal alterations:

As indicated above, these do not appear to be 'minor alterations' as stated in the applicant's Heritage Statement. The proposed dormer windows will radically alter the roofline of the property, remove original fabric and alter its plan form at second floor level. Similarly at first floor level significant alteration to the floor plan is proposed with re-arrangement of original features.

The cumulative impact of the proposed alterations, extensions and additions - internally and externally – and the removal of original fabric will have a harmful impact on the integrity of the listed building.

Conclusion:

The proposals for 2 Provost Road will have a harmful impact on the integrity of the listed building and the character and appearance of the Conservation Area contrary to the guidance in

- The Eton Conservation Area Appraisal: Alterations and Extensions to Existing Buildings;
- Key messages contained in CPG 1 Design (para 5.11) and
- Camden's Development Policies DP25 b)-Conserving Camden's Heritage; DP 25 f) with regard to 'harm to the special interest of the building' and DP 26 a) concerning 'visual

Application No:	Consultees Name:	Consultees Addr:	Received:	Comment:	Response:
-----------------	------------------	------------------	-----------	----------	-----------

privacy and overlooking'.

For the reasons set out above the submitted application for proposed alterations at No 2 Provost Road should be rejected.

Application No:	Consultees Name:	Consultees Addr:	Received:	Comment:	Response:
-----------------	------------------	------------------	-----------	----------	-----------

2017/4690/P	Eton CAAC	5 Eton Villas NW3 4SX NW3 4SX	04/09/2017 18:26:55	OBJ	Eton Conservation Area Advisory Committee
-------------	-----------	-------------------------------------	---------------------	-----	--

Advice from Eton Conservation Area Advisory Committee: 04.09.2017

Re 2 Provost Road: 2017/4690/P, 2017/4702/L

This is a second application relating to 2 Provost Road. The first, registered in January 2017 (2017/0080/P, 2017/0198/L), was for the erection of a lower ground extension and a garden building to the rear of the existing dwelling house plus internal alterations. This was refused in March 2017 on the following grounds:

"The proposed outbuilding by reason of its location, size and scale would detract from the general openness of the rear garden area, would be overly dominant and appear as an incongruous form of development, furthermore it would harm the setting of the listed building and result in harm to the character and appearance of the surrounding conservation area."

This refusal was appealed in July 2017 and, as far as we can ascertain, remains outstanding at the time of writing.

In relation to the first application we concluded that the proposed extension to No 2 Provost Road was "quiet" and unobtrusive, and appropriate to the simplicity of the house. We have no objection, therefore. Regarding this further application, there is no objection to the spiral staircase at the rear. We agree that in considering both houses as a whole, the addition of the staircase contributes an element of symmetry to the overall elevation.

But the argument for symmetry ceases to be convincing when applied to the big, long dormer. In this case, it becomes an argument that seeks to justify copying the size of the dormers on No.1, which are clumsily large in relation to the architectural style of these houses and predate the conservation area (dating from 1966 whereas this part of the Eton Conservation Area was created in December 1973). We cite Camden Planning Guidance - Design...5.11 (b): "Full-length dormers ... will be discouraged to minimise the prominence of these structures."

Where the rear extension is nicely judged, and where the spiral staircase makes a well argued contribution, the dormer proposes repeating the mistakes of the past. Far from it being discreet, as dormers are generally required to be, it is overly prominent and weighty for the house. As the side elevation shows, it takes up too much of the roof.

As we have stated in relation to previous applications, we are concerned that this part of the Conservation Area is under threat from a recent spate of applications to materially alter the external appearance of the houses in Provost Road which are listed primarily for their group value. For example, the owners of 12 Provost Road are currently having to rectify the unauthorised scale of the dormers which were erected following the original permission in October 2012 by reducing them in size. Similarly, 11 Provost Road was recently subject to enforcement action to reinstate its external and internal fabric following the unauthorised

Application No:	Consultees Name:	Consultees Addr:	Received:	Comment:	Response:
					removal of its roof and internal floors. This reinstatement work has recently been completed. We would like to see it as a form of "template" for future alterations to the houses in Provost Road, particularly in relation to the size of dormers.
					Eton CAAC
