

Delegated Report		Analysis sheet	Expiry Date:	17/07/2017
		N/A / attached	Consultation Expiry Date:	07/07/2017
Officer		Application Number(s)		
Hugh Miller		2017/0854/P		
Application Address		Drawing Numbers		
149 York Way London N7 9LG		See draft decision		
PO 3/4	Area Team Signature	C&UD	Authorised Officer Signature	
Proposal(s)				
Erection of roof extension and alterations to front elevation associated with conversion from self-contained flat to 2x self-contained flats (1x1bed and 1x2bed) at 3rd, 4th and 5th floor levels.				
Recommendation(s):	Refuse planning permission			
Application Type:	Full Planning Permission			

Conditions or Reasons for Refusal:	Refer to Draft Decision Notice					
Informatives:						
Consultations						
Adjoining Occupiers:	No. notified	00	No. of responses	00	No. of objections	00
Summary of consultation responses:	<p>Site Notices displayed 16/06/2017, expires 07/07/2017</p> <p><u>1 Cliff Road</u> – Objection.</p> <p>Planning permission was granted in 1987 for the current replacement structure.</p> <p>The current proposal to add a further storey above the current mansard is similar to an application refused permission in 2009, except that the front parapet is now shown raised a storey. Effectively, the proposal repeats an attempt to add two storeys to the original height of the structure, which is against Camden’s planning policies.</p> <p>This repeat application may have been inspired by the granting of permission on appeal for a new block of flats at 5&6 Cliff Villas on the other side of the taller self-storage warehouse at 145 York Way.</p> <p>Whatever the merits of that successful appeal, the circumstances are fundamentally different and should not be taken to relate to this application. There, a completely new, larger structure was deemed appropriate by the planning inspector, in that no original buildings remained adjacent, and its neighbouring school and warehouse are both of a larger scale than the remaining pair of mid-Victorian houses. Furthermore, the approved building would still be lower than the warehouse.</p> <p>At 149 York Way, however, the current structure retains the original house form (originally with commercial use at lower levels) and continues the lower scale development in the two adjacent conservation areas. It should also be noted that self-storage warehouse heavily overshadows residential properties in Cliff Road, so its height and mass should not be seen as appropriate in generating further high structures to its northwest.</p> <p>As this proposal effectively repeats the failed 2009 application, I see no reason that it should be treated differently, and would strongly support its rejection.</p>					
CAAC/Local groups* comments: *Please Specify	Not within a designated conservation.					

Site Description

A basement, 4-storey building located on the southwest side of York Way and west of Cliff Road junction. The host building comprises 1x unit at basement and ground floor levels with residential units above at 1st floor level to 4th floor levels. The site is not within a conservation area and is located on the boundary with Camden Square conservation area.

Relevant History

July 2010 – PP Granted - Change of use of the lower ground and ground floor from A1 shop to 1 x 2 bedroom self-contained residential flat (Class C3); ref. 2010/2913/P

April 2009 – PP Refused - Erection of a roof extension and rearrangement of internal layout to create an additional one bed maisonette;(ref. 2008/4631/P) as follows:

Reason for refusal:

The proposed additional storey, by reason of its height, position and relationship with the host property, would fail to respect the proportion and composition of the original building resulting in a top-heavy unbalanced appearance. In addition, the resulting two storey flank projecting along the boundary with number 151 York Way would create an awkward and incongruous relationship with the neighbouring property, contrary to policies B1 (General design principles) and B3 (Alterations and extensions) of the London Borough of Camden Replacement Unitary Development Plan 2006 and supporting information within the Camden Planning Guidance 2006

April 1987 – PP Granted - The erection of a basement and five storey building for use as a shop on the basement and ground floors and two flats and one maisonette on the upper floors as revised first on 27th March 1987 and subsequently on 24th April 1987 and as shown on drawing numbers 283/01 02 03C 04B 05 06A and 07B; ref. 8700257.

Relevant policies

Camden Local Plan 2017

D1 Design
A1 Managing the impact of development
T1 Prioritising walking, cycling and public transport
T2 Parking and car free development
H1 Maximising housing supply
H3 Protecting existing homes
H6 Housing choice and mix

Supplementary Planning Guidance:

Camden Planning Guidance 2016
CPG1 (Design)- chapters 1, 2, 3, 4 & 5
CPG2 (Housing): Section 4: Residential space standards, Section 5: Lifetimes Homes
CPG6 (Amenity) – Chapters 6 & 7
CPG7 (Transport)

London Plan 2016

National Planning Policy Framework 2012

Assessment

Background

The council refused planning permission for a similar proposal 8 years ago, in April 2009. The reasons for the refusal is as follows: *'The proposed additional storey, by reason of its height, position and relationship with the host property, would fail to respect the proportion and composition of the original building resulting in a top-heavy unbalanced appearance. In addition, the resulting two storey flank projecting along the boundary with number 151 York Way would create an awkward and incongruous relationship with the neighbouring property.'*

In the intervening period the Council's policies and guidelines have been superseded with the current adopted Camden Local Plan 3rd July 2017.

1.0 Proposal

- Change of use and conversion form 1 self-contained flat to 2x self-contained flats (1x1bed and 1x2bed) at 3rd, 4th and 5th floor levels;
- Erection of mansard roof extension including dormers.

2.0 Principle of the conversion

2.1 There are 4 existing self-contained flats at the property; 2x 1bed units – 1st and 2nd floor levels; and 2x2bed [maisonettes] at basement and ground floor levels and at the 3rd and 4th floor levels. The proposed conversion would provide 1 x 1 bed flat at 3rd floor level and 1 x 2-bed maisonette located at 4th and new 4th floor levels. This proposal is similar to a previously refused scheme of April 2009 (see history section above).

2.2 Camden's LP policy H3 aim to ensure that existing housing continues to meet the needs of existing and future households; and H3 (a) to resist development that would involve a net loss of residential floorspace. This application proposes no loss of residential accommodation rather the conversion of an existing unit plus extension to provide one additional flat and is therefore in accordance with this policy.

2.3 Policy H7 states the Council will aim to secure a range of homes of different sizes that will contribute to creation of mixed, inclusive and sustainable communities; and will seek to ensure that all housing development contributes to meeting the priorities set out in the Dwelling Size Priorities Table. The Dwelling Size Priorities Table indicates that market housing with 2- bedroom units are the highest priority and most sought after unit size. Therefore, on balance there would be no objection in principle to the mix proposed in this instance.

Residential standard

2.4 The 3rd floor unit would comprise 2 habitable rooms, with 1x double bedroom [14.6sqm], separate kitchen/dining/living room [15.9sqm]. The general layout plus stacking is considered acceptable. However, the overall size [35.7sqm GIA] is below the national minimum. Nevertheless, the unit provide generous sized habitable rooms, and on balance, it is considered that it would provide an acceptable quality of amenity for future occupants. The maisonette unit would provide 2x -bedrooms that measure 11.3sqm and 14.6sqm plus kitchen/dining/living room 39.6sqm, would be compliant with the residential space standards, and is considered acceptable. Both units have dual aspect views and comply with CPG guidelines.

2.5 Base on the above, it is considered that the provision of 1 extra flat is considered acceptable in principle; and subject to legal agreement for carfree development. However, the units' formation is reliant on an acceptable roof extension. Please see assessment below.

3.0 Design

3.1 Policy D1 states that the Council will seek to secure high quality design in development; respecting the local context and character; the character and proportions of the existing building,

where alterations and extensions are proposed; the impact on existing rhythms, symmetries and uniformities in the townscape. Supplementary design guidance contained within CPG 1(Design) provides details on how the above policies will be applied for extensions and roof developments. This states that roof alterations or additions are likely to be unacceptable if they would have an adverse impact on the skyline, the appearance of the building or the surrounding street scene.

Mansard roof extension

3.2 The host building forms a terraced group of 7 buildings between nos.135 to 153. It has an existing mansard type roof extension pitched front with front dormer window and vertical rear elevation plus roof terrace. It is lower in height by 1-storey than the adjoining to 145-147 [self-store building] but also 1-storey higher than nos. 151 -153. Between nos, 135 to 149 the height of the buildings vary between 5 and 6-storeys with nos. 151 and 153 being 4-storeys that forms a bookend and mirrors the height of the more uniform terraced group to the north (nos. 155 to 167 York Way). Within the terrace, most of the top floors either form roof extensions or as originally constructed are recessed to minimise their visual bulk and height with the most visually prominent building due to its overall bulk and height being nos. 145-147 self-store building. The large self-storage building adjoining to the south is a full storey higher than the application site and extends back along the whole south side and west (rear) boundary of the application site.

3.3 To the rear, the building projects from the building line of its neighbour number 151 up to third floor level with a further projecting addition up to second floor level with a small terrace above. The recessed roof level has a flat roof and door to a further small terrace. The existing parapet would project upwards in its vertical position and the existing elevation, which slopes away from the front building line behind a parapet would be continued upwards to create the additional storey but as per the existing it would not be a traditional mansard as the structure would have a flat roof and a vertical rear elevation. A new window dormer window would be added to the front elevation and two new windows in the rear at new 5th floor level. The CPG states that extensions should not be introduced where the building already have an additional storey or mansard; or already higher than neighbouring properties where an additional storey would add significantly to the bulk or unbalance the architectural composition.

The proposed roof extension is considered to fail both of these tests. The proposal seeks to replace the existing roof extension with a replacement front elevation that continues the brick and fenestration pattern from the levels below, rising to a new decorative string course which would match the adjoining self-store building. The new roof level above would then mimic the existing roof extension. However, to replicate elements of the host building and terminate it with a heavy string course is not in keeping with the character of the host building and is not considered appropriate. The additional roof extension would not only overwhelm the host building appearance, it would accentuate the verticality of the host building and is considered unacceptable here. The cumulative effect of the unsympathetic design 28sqm extension, at 15.88m above ground level, is considered to result in an incongruous, overly dominant and austere addition, which would cause demonstrable harm to the appearance of the host building.

3.4 In relation to its neighbours, the self-storage building is a full storey higher, which then steps down to the existing host building, which then steps down again to the Victorian properties. The self-storage building has a frontage of over four times that of the application site, being much grander in its scale than its neighbours it would follow that this property sets the prevailing maximum height for the frontage. The narrow infill host building is of less grandeur in terms of design and bulk so the increase in height to almost that of its neighbour is not appropriate to the scale of the building and therefore does not respect the original historic grain or the architectural form. In addition, the north flank of the double roof extension would extend two storeys above its neighbours at number 151 & 153 creating an awkward and unattractive relationship between the two.

3.5 The proposed extension is therefore considered to be contrary to policy D1 and Camden Planning Guidance section 5. Roofs and terraces and balconies.

3.6 The rear elevation is clearly visible from the public realm on the Cliff Road corner. This view includes a mixture of building types, ages, styles and materials and there is not clear pattern of development.

3.7 Whilst the extension would create a vertical 2 level roof addition within the context of the surroundings this is not considered to seriously impact upon the appearance of the group of buildings.

4.0 Amenity

4.1 The new roof layer will be completely within the footprint of the existing roof level and would not cause any loss of day/sunlight or outlook to its neighbours or result in any increased overlooking or loss of privacy.

5.0 Conclusion

5.1 The proposed new residential flat although acceptable in principle and is policy compliant is dependent on an acceptable roof extension. In this instance, as the roof extension is considered unacceptable, the proposed new residential flat is therefore not possible to provide.

6.0 Recommendation:

Refuse planning permission

Photos.

149 york way host building





149 York Way – host building

151-153 York Way



Self-storage building 145-147 York Way

View from Cliff Road Rear view of host and neighbouring buildings



View from Cliff Road - Rear of application site & neighbouring buildings – 149 – 151 York Way