

<b>Delegated Report</b>		<b>Analysis sheet</b>		<b>Expiry Date:</b>		11/03/2009	
		N/A / attached		<b>Consultation Expiry Date:</b>		03/03/2009	
<b>Officer</b>				<b>Application Number(s)</b>			
Jonathan Markwell				2008/5529/P			
<b>Application Address</b>				<b>Drawing Numbers</b>			
5-11 Monmouth Street London WC2H 9DA				Please see decision notice			
<b>PO 3/4</b>	<b>Area Team Signature</b>	<b>C&amp;UD</b>	<b>Authorised Officer Signature</b>				
<b>Proposal(s)</b>							
Erection of a fourth and fifth floor roof extension to nos. 9-11 and erection of a 5 <sup>th</sup> floor mansard roof extension with remodelled 4 <sup>th</sup> floor to nos. 5-7, to provide eight additional bedrooms to the existing hotel (Class C1), associated window alterations to front and rear elevations, and installation of an external glazed lift enclosure from ground to 5 <sup>th</sup> floors at the rear of building.							
<b>Recommendation(s):</b>		<b>Refuse Planning Permission</b>					
<b>Application Type:</b>		<b>Full Planning Permission</b>					
<b>Conditions or Reasons for Refusal:</b>		<b>Refer to Draft Decision Notice</b>					
<b>Informatives:</b>							
<b>Consultations</b>							
<b>Adjoining Occupiers:</b>		No. notified	<b>50</b>	No. of responses	<b>01</b>	No. of objections	<b>01</b>
				No. electronic	<b>01</b>		
<b>Summary of consultation responses:</b>		a site notice was displayed from 10/02/2009, expiring on 03/03/2009. One objection was received from the occupier of Flat 3, 3 Monmouth Street, summarised as follows: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Loss of view and outlook from existing roof terrace at No. 3 Monmouth Street;</li> <li>- Potential loss of privacy from the proposed glass lift;</li> <li>- Height of the proposed works are out of character with the area;</li> </ul>					
<b>CAAC/Local groups* comments:</b> <small>*Please Specify</small>		<u>Covent Garden CAAC</u> object to the application "This is a completely unacceptable over development of the worst sort – two stories (sic) too high which will make the existing building look ridiculous".  <u>Covent Garden Community Association</u> object to the external lift proposed owing to the visual impact of the lift to the conservation area and adjacent to a listed building.					

## Site Description

The application site comprises No's 5-11 Monmouth Street, which is located on the east side of Monmouth Street close to the junction with Shaftesbury Avenue and Neal Street.

No's 5-7 are 6 storeys in height, including basement and mansard 4<sup>th</sup> floor level. No's 9-11 are five storeys in height, including basement level. The buildings are typical early/mid 19<sup>th</sup> century townhouses with later shopfronts which are characteristic of this area. The height, proportion and architectural composition of the buildings are features which add to their character and appearance.

Nos. 5-7 are 20<sup>th</sup> century replicas of No's 9-11, of form and proportion that is characteristic of their neighbours. However, No's 5-7 are considered to play a less important role in the architectural and historic interest of the conservation area.

At ground floor level, No's 5 and 9-11 Monmouth Street are in retail (Class A1) use. No. 7 is in hotel (Class C1) use at ground floor level, with hotel uses continuing at No's 5-7 on the upper floors of the building. Presently the lawful use of the upper floors of No's 9-11 is ancillary retail use (at first and third floor level) and office use (Class B1) at second floor level, although there is extant consent for hotel (Class C1) accommodation at existing first, second, third floor level and a mansard roof extension at newly created fourth floor level (Application Ref: 2006/3067/P).

Although the buildings are not listed, they are located within Seven Dials (Covent Garden) Conservation Area. In addition, both No's 5-7 and 9-11 are identified as important buildings which make a positive contribution to the character and appearance of the conservation area. In addition, the nearby building at No. 61 Neal Street is Grade II listed.

## Relevant History

### 5 Monmouth Street

8800502 - Refurbishment and change of use from retail at basement and ground level with a single residential maisonette at first - third floors to retail at basement ground and first floors with a single residential maisonette at second third and new mansard fourth floor level. Installation of new shop front. Granted 09/03/1989.

PSX0304267 - Change of use of 1st, 2nd and 3rd floors from offices, tailors workshop and ancillary storage to hotel use, in connection with hotel use at No. 7. (No change to basement and ground floor and no external alterations). Refused 29/05/2003; Appeal dismissed 24/10/2003.

2006/2495/P - Installation of new shopfront, kitchen extractor duct and 4x air-conditioning units to rear elevation in connection with the basement restaurant (Class A3). Granted 08/08/2006.

### 5-7 Monmouth Street

2003/3524/P - Erection of mansard roof to no.5 for use as a hotel (Class C1), relocation of Class B1(c) from second floor to first floor, change of use of second and third floors from office / workshop (Class B1) to hotel accommodation, all in connection with hotel use at no.7. Granted 04/03/2004.

### 5-11 Monmouth Street

2007/5559/P - 4-storey extension to rear of hotel at 9-11 Monmouth Street to provide 4 additional bedrooms. Withdrawn 30/01/2008.

2008/5619/P - Erection of a fourth and fifth floor roof extension, including a mansard roof to the existing hotel (Class C1) to provide eight additional bedrooms, remodelled fourth floor level and insertion of a lift. *Current application awaiting a decision from the Council.*

### 7 Monmouth Street

9400378 - Change of use of premises from picture framers within Class B1 to use as a hotel within

Class C1 of the Town and Country Planning (Use Classes) Order 1987. Granted 02/06/1994.

9401008 - The erection of a mansard roof extension to provide three hotel bedrooms for use in connection with hotel use in the rest of the building. Granted 12/08/1994.

## **9 Monmouth Street**

AR/TP57394/B590 - The change of use from work-rooms to offices on the 2nd and 3rd floors at No. 9, Monmouth Street, Holborn. Granted 24/01/1956.

8501992 - Erection of a single storey extension at the rear of the ground floor for use as reading rooms ancillary to the retail use on the remainder of the ground floor. Granted 08/01/1986.

## **9 -11 Monmouth Street**

P14/53/E/7425 - The use, for a limited period, of the 2nd floor of 9-11 Monmouth Street, Camden, as offices. Granted limited period consent until 31/03/1972 - 06/08/1969.

P14/53/E/14735 - Continued use of 2nd floor of 9-11, Monmouth Street, W.C.1. for offices. Granted limited period consent until 31/12/1979 - 05/12/1972.

2006/3067/P - Erection of a mansard roof to existing four storey building and change of use of 1st & 3rd floors from ancillary retail use (Class A1) and the 2nd floor from office use (Class B1) to hotel use (Class C1) to create additional 16x bedrooms in connection with the adjoining hotel at No. 5-7 Monmouth Street. Granted 13/10/2006.

## **Relevant policies**

### **London Borough of Camden Replacement Unitary Development Plan 2006**

S1/2 – Sustainable development

SD1 – Quality of life

SD2 – Planning obligations

SD5 – Mixed use development

SD6 – Amenity for occupiers and neighbours

B1 – General design principles

B3 – Alterations and extensions

B7 – Conservation areas

T3 – Pedestrians and cycling

T7 – Off-street parking, city car clubs and city bike schemes

T12 – Works affecting highways

C5b – Tourism uses

### **Camden Planning Guidance 2006**

### **Seven Dials (Covent Garden) Conservation Area Statement**

## **Assessment**

### **Introduction**

Planning permission is sought for the erection of a fourth and fifth floor roof extension to No's 5-11 Monmouth Street. The existing mansard roof at fourth floor level of No's 5-7 will be removed and replaced with a sheer storey (with materials to match the existing brick façade) and a new mansard roof extension is proposed at newly created fifth floor level. No's 9-11 will be increased by two storeys, with a sheer storey at newly created fourth floor level (with materials to match the existing brick façade) and a mansard roof extension with dormers at newly created fifth floor level. In addition, a glazed lift is proposed on the rear elevation (to the rear of No. 7 Monmouth Street) from ground to above the height of the proposed roof additions.

The proposed development will increase the number of hotel bedrooms (Class C1) by 8 at newly created fifth floor level, encompassing a floor area of 118.6m<sup>2</sup>. At fourth floor level, the existing mansard at No's 5-7 and the extant mansard (by 2006/3067/P) at No's 9-11, will be replaced by a new sheer storey, increase the floorspace of the hotel by 19.6m<sup>2</sup> (but not increasing the number of hotel bedrooms). As such, the total increase in hotel floorspace by this application is 138.2m<sup>2</sup>

### **Land use issues**

The application site is located within the Central London Area, and as such the proposed extension is broadly acceptable in the context of Policy C5B, further contributing to London's vitality, character and economy.

Given that the proposed development increases the amount of Class C1 floorspace at the application site by 138.2m<sup>2</sup>, this is below the 200m<sup>2</sup> threshold set out by Policy SD3 (Mixed use development). As such, the proposed development will not be required to contribute towards residential provision in the borough as outlined by Policy SD3.

### **Design**

The application involves a fourth and fifth floor roof extension to the building, as detailed in the introduction section of this assessment section. The principle of a mansard has been accepted by previous permissions at nos 9-11 but raising the entire building by another storey is considered unacceptable in principle on account of its additional bulk. It is considered that the proposed roof extension would unbalance the composition of the front facades and result in undue harm the architectural integrity, proportions, character and appearance of the host buildings. This is considered contrary to Policy B3 of the UDP, which states "the Council will not grant planning permission for alterations and that it considers cause harm to the architectural quality of the existing building."

The scheme is misguided in its attempt to match the bulk and height of higher buildings at nos 1-3 and 15. Monmouth Street is made up of a variety of buildings with different ages and styles which result in a variation in the building heights. These variations add to the visual interest of the street. Moreover no 1-3 is an important corner landmark building which forms an urban design setpiece at the junction of Shaftesbury Avenue and is traditionally designed to be higher and more ornate in form; no 15 is a higher infill interwar development but should not be seen as setting a precedent, as the dominant building height of the street on this side is one of 4 storey Victorian terrace buildings with or without mansards. The proposed scheme would result in a more consistent building height and bulk along the street and at roof level, and would lessen and compete with the dominance of the landmark corner building at no 1-3. This is considered to reduce the visual interest and variety of the street and roofscape and harm the overall appeal of Monmouth Street, which would be detrimental to the character and appearance of the Seven Dials (Covent Garden) Conservation Area (contrary to UDP Policies B1, B3 and B7).

In relation to the proposed lift to the rear of the building, the position is well concealed in between tall buildings surrounding the rear of the application site. The width of the lift is not considered to over-dominate the rear façade and the lift is only considered to be visible from the upper floors of a number of the properties overlooking the rear courtyard. In this regard the lift is unlikely to harm the scale and appearance of the host building or the character and appearance of the Seven Dials (Covent Garden) Conservation Area.

However, the upper part of the lift, especially at 5th floor level rising above the new roof level, is considered undesirable and unnecessary. As such, in overall terms, owing to its height and bulk, it would be detrimental to the form and proportions of the building and fail to preserve or enhance the character and appearance of the Seven Dials (Covent Garden) Conservation Area at this point. It is also considered that the lift may also cause harm the setting of the rear of listed building at No. 61 Neal Street. However this harm, given the enclosed nature of the rear of the buildings at this point, is not considered sufficient to warrant the refusal of the application on this specific basis.

## **Amenity**

With regard to amenity, it is not considered that there are any concerns that are sufficient to warrant the refusal of the application on this basis. It is acknowledged that there is an existing roof terrace at No. 3 Monmouth Street. There is potential for overlooking to/from this terrace from the increase in No's 5-7 by one storey. However, there is already a degree of overlooking in this area from the current buildings and this is not considered to be sufficiently exacerbated by the proposed scheme. Likewise, the other buildings to the rear of the application site, which are mainly in commercial use, already have a degree of overlooking between one another. This situation will not worsen further from the proposed scheme given that the works are at roof level.

With regard to sunlight and daylight impact, the proposals are not considered to adversely impinge on the amenity of neighbouring occupiers. Given that the majority of buildings to the rear of the site are in commercial use, the site is less sensitive to such issues. Moreover, the orientation and proximity of the surrounding buildings in relation to the application site means that properties in the northern corner apex at Neal Street already receive poor light, and it is considered that sunlight/daylight and outlook will not be materially worsened especially to lower floors.

The proposed lift is not considered to adversely impact on residential amenity given its limited size and position on the application site. Although the applicant has not stated the exact type of glazing proposed, it is considered that an obscurely glazed lift at this point would overcome any potential amenity issues to neighbouring occupiers.

## **Transport**

With regard to cycle parking, the proposal will increase the total floorspace of the application site by approximately 138.2m<sup>2</sup>. This is below the threshold of 500m<sup>2</sup> required to stimulate a need to provide cycle parking. Therefore cycle parking is not required as part of this scheme. With regard to off-street parking, there is none proposed as part of this scheme.

The proposal includes the removal of one mansard storey and the construction of an additional two storeys, in addition to a glazed lift to the rear of the building. As such, it is anticipated that there will be a significant number of construction vehicle movements to and from the site along a narrow road (Monmouth Street). The proposed development will therefore be likely to have a significant impact on the transport network in the area. As such, a Construction Management Plan would be required to outline how construction work will be carried out and how this work will be serviced (e.g. delivery of materials, set down and collection of skips), with the objective of minimising traffic disruption and avoiding dangerous situations for pedestrians and other road users. The applicant has not indicated that they will be willing to enter into this agreement within the determination period of the application.

**Recommendation:** Refuse Planning Permission

## **Disclaimer**

***This is an internet copy for information purposes. If you require a copy of the signed original please contact the Culture and Environment Department on (020) 7974 5613***