

**DISCLAIMER**

Decision route to be decided by nominated members on Monday 19<sup>th</sup> April 2010. For further information see

<http://www.camden.gov.uk/ccm/navigation/environment/planning-and-built-environment/planning-applications/development-control-members-briefing/>

<b>Delegated Report (Members Briefing)</b>		<b>Analysis sheet</b>	<b>Expiry Date:</b>	20/04/2010
		N/A / attached	<b>Consultation Expiry Date:</b>	24/03/2010
<b>Officer</b>			<b>Application Number(s)</b>	
Jonathan Markwell			a) 2010/0786/P b) 2010/0793/L	
<b>Application Address</b>			<b>Drawing Numbers</b>	
10 South Square and the Hall, South Square, Gray's Inn London WC1R 5ET			Please see decision notice	
<b>PO 3/4</b>	<b>Area Team Signature</b>	<b>C&amp;UD</b>	<b>Authorised Officer Signature</b>	
<b>Proposal(s)</b>				
a) Construction of bridge linking 10 South Square with The Hall (9 South Square) at first floor level, alterations to doors and windows at ground and first floor, alterations to access at 10 South Square and associated alterations (Class D1). b) External and internal alterations including installation of disabled lift and food hoist at basement, ground and first floor levels, insertion of handrails at the main entrance to the hall, construction of bridge linking 10 South Square with The Hall (9 South Square) at first floor level, alterations to doors and windows at ground and first floor, alterations to access at 10 South Square and associated alterations (Class D1).				
<b>Recommendation(s):</b>		a) Grant Planning Permission b) Grant Listed Building Consent		
<b>Application Type:</b>		a) Full Planning Permission b) Listed Building Consent		

Conditions or Reasons for Refusal:	Refer to Draft Decision Notice					
Informatives:						
Consultations						
Adjoining Occupiers (2010/0786/P only):	No. notified	19	No. of responses	15	No. of objections	01
			No. Electronic	08		
Summary of consultation responses:	In addition to the adjoining occupiers being formally consulted, site notices for both the planning application and listed building consent were erected on 03/03/2010, expiring on 24/03/2010.					
	A total of ten letters of support for the application have been received from the following addresses:					
	2 Gray's Inn Square; 2-3 Gray's Inn Square (tenant of the Inn, Benchers of the Inn and Head of Chambers at 2-3 Gray's Inn Square); 4-5 Gray's Inn Square (specific reference made to support for both planning and listed building applications); Third Floor South, 3 Raymond Buildings; Third Floor North, 6 Raymond Buildings; 8 South Square (The Welfare officer of the Association of Gray's Inn Students); 11 South Square; 1 Blenheim Road, W4 1UB (a Benchers of the Inn and member of the Management Committee); 23 Tudor Crescent, Otford, TN14 5QS (and Barrister member of the Honourable Society of Gray's Inn and the Honorary Secretary of the Committee of Senior Barristers) and one unspecified address (noted as a member of Gray's Inn).					
	One response has returned 8 consultation letters, all from 10 South Square, specifying that there are "no flats at 10 South Square" and instead all have been converted to barrister's overnight accommodation.					
	An occupier of 3 <sup>rd</sup> floor flat, 1 Gray's Inn Square (in two separate submissions), denotes "wholehearted" support to the proposals. Concerns are however raised regarding noise during construction. As such, it is sought for the following to be adhered to:  <div><div></div><div>- no drilling work prior to 0800 (0830 on Saturdays); - No work on Sunday</div></div>					
Officer response: The standard informative added to any planning permission is for any building works that can be heard at the boundary of the site only between 08.00 and 18.00 hours Monday to Friday and 08.00 to 13.00 on Saturday and not at all on Sundays and Public Holidays. This is in accordance with the Control of Pollution Act 1974. The applicant has responded that they intend to adhere to the occupiers request and thus the						

	<p>30 minute window on Saturdays (between 0800 and 0830 is not considered necessary to secure via condition. Nor is this considered to be an objection to the proposals.</p> <p>The occupiers of 2<sup>nd</sup> floor flat at 1 Gray's Inn Square, although recognising "the Bridge will provide significant enhancement to the facilities... and has the added benefit of restoring a part of the Inn's architectural heritage... and that the design, as one would expect...of high quality" also raise concerns regarding the potential nuisance to adjacent residents. As such, it is suggested that the Bridge be "soundproofed to the greatest extent, and that any use to be made of it should have a curfew hour of no later than 11pm". This is considered to constitute an objection to the application.</p> <p>Officer response: Please see paragraphs 2.1 and 4.2 of the assessment section below for details.</p>
<p><b>CAAC/Local groups* comments:</b> *Please Specify</p>	<p>Bloomsbury CAAC has been formally consulted, but has not provided a response to date.</p> <p>English Heritage is minded to grant listed building consent (subject to conditions - see assessment section for details) and have referred the case to Government Office for London.</p> <p>Government Office For London (GOL) has responded that the Secretary of State has considered the information provided by English Heritage and does not intend to require the application to be referred to him. GOL authorisation has thereby been received.</p> <p>English Heritage's Greater London Archaeology Advisory Service (GLAAS) has confirmed that the proposals are not considered to have an affect on any significant archaeological remains.</p>

### Site Description

The application site comprises two buildings (9 South Square – The Hall and 10 South Square) within Gray's Inn legal precinct, located within Bloomsbury Conservation Area. The Hall is a Grade I listed banqueting hall, originally dating from 1556-60. The building was gutted in 1940, then re-roofed and restored in facsimile in 1950-60. It comprises red brick with later patching and stone dressings, and a tiled roof with crow-step gables and hexagonal lead lantern with pinnacles in the centre. Internally, the building has a hammer beam roof reconstructed in facsimile and fine late 16<sup>th</sup> century screen reinstated, along with re-instated 16<sup>th</sup> and 17<sup>th</sup> century heraldic glass. A Buttery addition to the western end dates from 1971-72 by Erith and Terry. As seen in the relevant history section below, a ramp access to the north elevation was granted in 2006. It comprises a basement level (which connects the Hall with No. 10 South Square) and two storeys, although the first floor level consists of a balcony over the main Hall at ground floor level.

No. 10 South Square is an unlisted Common Room building by Erith and Terry, dating from 1971-72. This replaced an Edwardian building on the same site which was connected to the Hall by a neo-Tudor style bridge. This in turn had replaced a 17<sup>th</sup> century four-storey building on the same footprint.

The existing building comprises a basement floor level and four storeys, with ramped access on the east elevation at ground floor level (adjacent to the access road in-between No. 10 and the Hall).

The character of this part of the conservation area is considered to be particularly special in that it pre-dates the layout of Georgian streets and squares that typify Bloomsbury, and instead comprises buildings set within a collegiate layout, in a series of interlocked squares, gardens and quadrangles, within an area which is walled off from the surrounding streets. The squares are linked with narrow passages and carriage openings at ground level within the buildings. The materials are generally consistent red or stock brick, some with stone dressings. Many of the buildings of Gray's Inn are listed, with the surrounding area of the Inns predominantly legal in character but also include a mix of other uses. These include uses that complement the legal profession, such as residential flats and overnight accommodation for barristers.

### **Relevant History**

#### **9 South Square (The Hall)**

2005/4592/L - Alterations and enabling works within the Undercroft area in order to facilitate works to the North Porch. Granted 23/12/2005.

2006/0343/P - Alterations to the north and west elevations of the "North Porch" to provide new a door and window and installation of access ramp. Granted 26/05/2006.

2006/0346/L - Alterations to the North and West elevations of the "North Porch" to provide new door and window, installation of ramp access and an internal lift to serve basement/undercroft level, plus removal of internal door at basement level. Granted 26/05/2006.

2006/4095/L - Details of ironmongery and handrail pursuant to condition 5(a) and (b) of listed building consent dated 26 May 2006 (ref: 2006/0346/L) and submission of archaeological watching brief and building recording report pursuant to condition 6 of listed building consent granted 26 May 2006 (ref: 2006/0346/L) and condition 2 of planning permission granted 26 May 2006 (ref: 2006/0343/P) (Alterations to the North and West elevations of the "North Porch" to provide new door and window, installation of ramp access and an internal lift to serve basement/undercroft level, plus removal of internal door at basement level.) Granted 01/11/2006.

2006/4375/P - Alteration to the ramp design as a variation to planning permission dated 26th May 2006 (ref. 2006/0343/P) for alterations to the north and west elevations of the "North Porch" to provide new a door and window and installation of access ramp. Granted 01/12/2006.

2006/4377/L - Alteration to the ramp design as a variation to planning permission dated 26th May 2006 (ref. 2006/0343/P) for alterations to the north and west elevations of the "North Porch" to provide new a door and window and installation of access ramp. Granted 01/12/2006.

#### **10 South Square**

5404 - Proposal to remodel the interior and widen the Arch at No. 10, South Square, Gray's Inn, W.C.1. Granted 25/07/1968.

PSX0005162 - The change of use of the ground floor flat to an ancillary bar use and the formation of a staff bedsit, the change of use of the second floor to 2 x 1 bed flat and 1 bedsit and the provision of a disabled ramp serving the main entrance and alterations to the rear door and stair area. Granted 06/03/2001.

## **Relevant policies**

### **PPS 5 - Planning for the Historic Environment (Published: 23<sup>rd</sup> March 2010)**

#### **London Borough of Camden Replacement Unitary Development Plan 2006**

SD1 – Quality of life

SD6 – Amenity for occupiers and neighbours

B1 – General design principles

B3 – Alterations and extensions

B6 – Listed buildings

B7 – Conservation areas

#### **Camden Planning Guidance 2006**

#### **Bloomsbury Conservation Area Statement (Draft)**

#### **LDF Core Strategy and Development Policies**

As the draft LDF Core Strategy and Development Policies documents have now been published, they are material planning considerations. However, as a matter of law, limited weight should be attached to them at this stage.

#### **Draft LDF Core Strategy**

CS1 – Distribution of growth

CS5 – Managing the impact of growth and development

CS14 – Promoting high quality places and conserving our heritage

#### **Draft Development Policies**

DP24 – Securing high quality design

DP25 – Conserving Camden's heritage

DP26 – Managing the impact of development on occupiers and neighbours

DP29 – Improving access

## **Assessment**

### **1. Introduction**

1.1 Planning permission and listed building consent is sought for the re-creation of a bridge between 10 South Square and the western end of the Hall (9 South Square), at first floor level, in order to link the two spaces. No. 10 comprises support space including training rooms, café-bar and robing rooms and barristers overnight accommodation elsewhere in the building; the Hall is a dining room, special event space, and considered to be the heart of the Inn. The two buildings are used together, for example the robing rooms being used for changing prior to special events, and the café-bar used as a waiting area, but the physical separation currently leads to what is considered to be a disjointed use of the spaces.

1.2 The Inn considers that it would be beneficial to have the two spaces linked once again. Until its demolition in the early 1970s, associated with the rebuilding of No. 10, there was a link between the two buildings. Map regression, historical information and photographs have all shown the two

buildings to have been joined in some form for at least two centuries. The most recent link dated from 1905-6, and took the form of a brick bridge with stone dressings, enclosed at the upper level.

1.3 It is intended for the proposed works to improve the educational and social facilities of Gray's Inn by re-organising existing spaces, including the provision of a bar within the bridge area created at first floor level. The Hall has a diverse set of functions, including a dining hall, function room and venue for moots and debates for example. As such, the purpose of this application is intended to improve the opportunities for integration between the senior, junior and student members at Gray's Inn. It is also intended to result in fewer movements between the two buildings, which are presently undertaken externally, but will be possible to be undertaken internally in the future.

1.4 The proposals also include the insertion of metal handrails to the main (south elevation) entrance to the Hall and the re-modeling of the main entrance (east elevation) of No. 10, incorporating the removal of the existing ramped access and replacement with a stepped entrance and new door. Level access is maintained to the building from an entrance on the north elevation of No. 10.

1.5 During the course of the application the originally proposed new disabled access ramp to the Hall, on the north elevation of the building was omitted. The existing disabled access ramp, granted in 2006 (see relevant history above), will continue to provide a suitable provision of access to this building for all.

1.6 Moreover, a number of internal alterations are also proposed to the listed Hall. These alterations include: the insertion of a disabled lift and food hoist at basement, ground and first floor level; a new opening and a new door at ground floor level; new first floor level door connecting with the proposed bridge; and, new linking staircase at first floor level between the Hall and bridge. A number of internal alterations are also proposed to No. 10, but given that this building is not listed, planning permission is not required for these alterations.

## **2. Land use issues**

2.1 The existing land use at the building is D1 (Non-residential institution) and this will remain unchanged as a result of the proposed scheme. The bar use proposed within the bridge area at first floor level is considered to be ancillary to the main uses of the buildings. At present there are no controls over the hours of use of the building and it is not considered possible or necessary to impose an operating hour condition to this permission. There would be significant difficulty in enforcing such a condition, given the nature of the building and how the ancillary uses change from one room to another. Moreover, the buildings currently operate with a licensed bar within No. 10 (at ground floor level) without an hours condition and although the area of this bar area will increase slightly as a result of the proposals, it is not considered reasonable to impose such a condition.

## **3. Design**

3.1 In terms of design matters, it is considered that the principle of recreating the link in this position would enhance the character of the area. This is for it would reinstate one of the characteristic features of the Inn in terms of the way that the squares are linked and approached. For example, existing access to the site from both High Holborn and Gray's Inn Road is through bridged entrances.

3.2 The east elevation of No. 10 South Square has a palace-fronted composition of eleven bays, with the central three bays defined by a pediment. It is not possible, however, to view this side of the building in true elevation, given its proximity to the western end of the Hall (9 South Square). Instead it is only viewed obliquely from the north and south. The new bridge will link into this central section, but it is not considered that the addition will have a significantly detrimental impact on the heritage value of the building. It is considered that the principal interest of the building lies in its contribution to the character of the Inn as a whole, in terms of its general form and materials, rather than intrinsic architectural merit or interest.

3.3 The impact of the proposal from a listed building point of view is considered to be similarly limited, as no significant historic fabric will be affected, much of the Hall having been rebuilt and reconfigured post-war. The formation of three modestly sized door openings within the west wall is not considered to detrimentally impact the special interest of character of the internal Hall space as a whole. The removal of some of the crenellation and pinnacles of the northern elevation of the 1970s buttery extension is not considered to be harmful as this elevation will form a part of the wider bridge structure. Moreover, the position, design, materials and scale of the bridge link are considered to preserve the setting and special interest of the Hall. Thus in summary the new bridge is considered to represent a well-designed intervention which understands and responds well to the character of Gray's Inn and the Hall.

3.4 With regard to the principle of the provision of handrails to the main entrance to the Hall, this is considered to be satisfactory in design terms. Likewise, the amendments to the east elevation entrance to No. 10, which involve the removal of the ramped access and replacement with a stepped entrance, raises no design issues.

3.5 English Heritage has also commented on the application and confirmed that they do not wish to comment in detail, but have offered general observations and detailed conditions, recommended to be attached to the listed building consent. Generally English Heritage view that the applicant has provided extensive research and information to demonstrate the access, educational and cultural benefits of the proposals. A number of conditions have however been recommended, including those in relation to:

- Demolition works being carried out by hand or by tools held in the hand other than power-driven tools.
- Provision of structural engineers' drawings, a method statement, indicating the proposed method of ensuring the safety and stability of the building fabric to be retained throughout the period of demolition and reconstruction, submitted to the Council prior to works being undertaken.
- No new plumbing, pipes, soilstacks, flues, vents, ductwork, grilles, security alarms, lighting or cameras shall be fixed on the external faces of the building.
- New external and internal works and finishes and works of making good to the retained fabric, shall match the existing adjacent work with regard to the methods used and to material, colour, texture and profile.
- The new facing brickwork shall match the existing brickwork adjacent in respect of colour, texture, face bond and pointing.
- The new joinery work shall match the existing joinery work adjacent in respect of materials,

- Details in respect of the following shall be submitted to and approved in writing by the Council as local planning authority in consultation with English Heritage before the relevant work is begun. The relevant work shall be carried out in accordance with such approved details
  - a. 1:20 internal elevations and sections at an appropriate scale to the western end of The Hall showing new openings and doors, including details finishes and materials. Sections at an appropriate scale showing details new openings, and fittings.
  - b. 1:50 elevations of the new Bridge Link detailing materials and finishes
  - c. Details of external facing materials, including samples of brickwork, stone dressings to made available on site for approval by the Council as local planning authority.
  - d. Specification for internal facing materials.
  - e. Reflected ceiling plan at 1:50 or larger of the underside of the Link Bridge, including details of finishes and junctions with existing masonry.
  - f. Precautions shall be taken to secure and protect interior features against accidental loss or damage during building work. Details of these shall be submitted to the Council before relevant work is undertaken. Special attention should be given to the timber gallery and window.

Any hidden historic features which are revealed during the course of works shall be retained in situ and the Council as local planning authority notified immediately. Provision shall be made for their retention and/or proper recording, as required by the Council.

3.6 In addition, the Council also request that detailed drawings, or samples of materials as appropriate, in respect of the following, shall be submitted to and approved in writing by the Council before the relevant part of the work is begun:

- a) Sample panel of all facing materials, including a sample panel of brickwork which demonstrates brick type, colour, texture, face bond, mortar mix and pointing, to be erected on site and maintained there during the course of construction;
- b) Detailed drawings with materials annotated, of new doors, windows and window openings (including surrounds) at 1:20 scale, including elevational details of the new doors to the west wall of the Hall.

3.7 It is considered that such conditions are relevant and necessary to be added, in order to safeguard the special architectural and historic interest of the building.

#### **4. Amenity**

4.1 With regard to amenity issues, it is considered that neighbouring buildings, such as 1 Gray's Inn Square and those within the southern section of No. 10 South Square, will continue to receive adequate levels to sunlight and daylight as a result of the proposed development. Moreover, there are not considered to be direct opportunities for overlooking from the proposed bridge; instead overlooking opportunities will only be possible from acute angles. Such overlooking is not considered to be sufficient to warrant a sustainable reason for the refusal of the application. In terms of outlook, the buildings to the north and south are considered to maintain adequate levels of outlook as a result of the proposed bridge, as both No. 1 Gray's Inn Square and No. 11-13 South Square look out onto open squares, thus maintaining sufficient outlook.



4.2 Concerns have been raised with regard to the impact of noise on adjoining occupiers. The applicant has confirmed during the course of the application that the proposed bridge will need to comply with the latest building regulations in relation to controlling noise within the building. This is an improvement to the standards and levels of acoustic protection in both application buildings, which currently hold regular functions and have licenses for the sale of alcohol. As such, it is considered that in this instance that the proposed works are unlikely to result in a significant increase in opportunities for noise and disturbance to neighbouring occupiers. In-fact, it may be that noise and disturbance may decrease owing to less activities being required to take place outdoors in the space between the two buildings. In this context there is considered, on balance, to be insufficient scope to impose conditions requiring more details of soundproofing or limiting audible noise outside the building from being added.

4.3 In addition, one of the main purposes of the application is to improve access to the buildings. The provision of a lift within the Hall will greatly enhance accessibility for all users, with further details to be secured with the building control application. The proposal to remove the existing ramped access to No. 10 will not result in the loss of level access to this building, as this will be possible from the north elevation, in the passageway between the application site and No. 1 Gray's Inn Square. The proposed stepped entrance includes railings on both sides and also corduroy paving at the top of the steps. Sufficient distances are also provided between the door opening and the steps. This will be subject to further detailed consideration as part of a Building Control application, but in planning terms is considered to be appropriate. Ramped access is maintained into the Hall from that existing on the north elevation. The provision of additional access features is therefore welcomed.

## **5. Transport**

5.1 In terms of possible transport implications, it is considered that the increase in floor area proposed is only small; therefore it is not considered to result in a significant increase in person trips. Furthermore, requirements for matters such as cycle parking are also not triggered in this instance. Both Gray's Inn Square and South Square are private roads, so Highways Approval is not required for the proposals. It is considered that the height of the bridge, similar to that for the main entrances into Gray's Inn from High Holborn, will provide sufficient access for emergency services if required. Moreover, this matter will also be addressed at the Building Control application stage. Thus no transport implications are anticipated from the proposed scheme.

## **6. Recommendation**

6.1 Grant Planning Permission / Grant Listed Building Consent