

Delegated Report (Members Briefing)		Analysis sheet		Expiry Date:	04/05/2012
		N/A / attached		Consultation Expiry Date:	12/04/12
Officer			Application Number(s)		
John Nicholls			2012/1036/P		
Application Address			Drawing Numbers		
8 Willow Road London NW3 1TJ			See decision notice		
PO 3/4	Area Team Signature	C&UD	Authorised Officer Signature		
Proposal(s)					
Erection of single storey garage fronting Pilgrims Lane following demolition of existing garage associated with residential dwelling (Class C3).					
Recommendation(s):		Grant Planning Permission			
Application Type:		Householder Application			

Conditions or Reasons for Refusal:	Refer to Draft Decision Notice					
Informatives:						
Consultations						
Adjoining Occupiers:	No. notified	02	No. of responses	03	No. of objections	02
			No. Electronic	00		
Summary of consultation responses:	A site notice was displayed on 15/3/2012 and a press notice displayed on 22/3/2012.					
	As a result two letters of objection have been submitted. These are summarised as follows: 1. The encroachment of the new, higher and bulkier, garage would indubitably lead to a feeling of oppression, not just within the rear ground floor rooms of these two houses, but also outside in their small gardens. The close proximity of the enlarged structure to the boundary wall will have a significant impact in terms of the mass/bulk of the structure as the foot print is pushed right up against the party wall. The garden of 10 Willow Road is lower than that of the garage. By bringing the structure up against the boundary wall and at the height of a temporary structure (existing trellis) on the boundary wall, there will be a significantly increased sense of bulk and much less light. The property is approximately 5m from the rear windows that are the primary family living space (living room / kitchen) of my property, it would have a significant impact on the sense of space and amenity that we currently enjoy. There would be a marked decrease in outlook and a sense of enclosure that would be oppressive as my family would be left facing a structure closer to existing living space. See paragraph 3.2 and 3.3 for an officer's response. 2. Daylight and sunlight will be affected as a result of the trellis fence being replaced with solid walls. See paragraph 3.2 3. Indeed we wonder, even while liking the idea of off-street parking, if a new double garage, has any real place within this conservation area? See paragraph 1.5. 4. Views from Pilgrim's Lane, on to which the garage faces, and the Heath, particularly from Preacher's Hill (lying on the far side of Willow Road), and especially during the five or six months each year when the trees growing in the garden of 8 Willow Road do not have any leaves on their branches. See paragraphs 2.5 and 2.6. 5. Will the proposal require deeper foundations to be installed - and over a larger area - which need to be considered carefully with regard to the existence of the Willow Road stream. See paragraph 1.6. 6. Given that asbestos needed to be removed from the ceiling of the current garage, will due care be taken when the garage is demolished as, beyond any doubt, the interior of the garage will have been					

	<p>contaminated. See paragraph 3.9</p> <p>7. While the green roof is a nice touch, to include something hinting of a nod towards that which is 'green', I would comment that it would soon become not green, but a rusty brown. Sedum roofs do not do well; do not thrive in times of little rainfall, unless they are watered. See paragraph 2.7.</p> <p>8. The proposed plans have failed to adequately consider the strong objections previously raised in relation to the planning application for Worsley Court, 45 Pilgrims Lane, where a proposed development will have a detrimental impact and sense of lost amenity regarding the space currently enjoyed. The proposed garage plans will compound this problem. See paragraphs 3.5-3.8.</p>
	<p>The Hampstead CAAC does not object to the proposal.</p>

Site Description

The Victorian end of terrace four storey dwelling is located on the south side of Willow Road on the corner of Pilgrim's Lane and opposite the Metropolitan Open Space of Hampstead Heath. The site is located in a prominent corner location within the Hampstead Conservation Area.

The building is identified within the Conservation Area Statement as making a positive contribution to the character and appearance of the Conservation Area.

Relevant History

8 Willow Road

2007/4579/P: Certificate of lawfulness (existing) use of the property as a single-family dwellinghouse (Class C3). Granted 17/10/2007.

2008/0264/P: Certificate of lawfulness (proposed) for the erection of side conservatory extension at first floor level to single-family dwellinghouse; installation of French doors at rear lower level and two front rooflights. Granted 07/03/2008.

2010/1582/P: Erection of single storey rear extension at lower ground floor (garden) level to single dwelling house. Granted 21/5/2010.

2009/3700/P: Erection of a conservatory at first floor level to the side of existing dwelling house (Class C3). Refused 14/10/2009

2010/5175/P: Additions and alterations, including new handrail and balustrade to front entrance staircase, new boundary treatment, alterations to existing doorway at lower ground floor level, alteration to fenestration, and roof light to single dwelling house (Class C3). Granted 22/11/ 2010

2010/5775/P: Erection of conservatory extension at first floor level to existing dwelling house (Class C3) –Refused 21/12/2010. Allowed on appeal: 20/05/2011

2011/3172/P: Erection of single storey garage fronting Pilgrims Lane following demolition of existing garage associated with residential dwelling (Class C3). Withdrawn: 09/09/2011

45 Pilgrim's Lane

2011/6199/P & 2011/6421/C – Demolition of the existing and the erection of 5 storey building to provide four residential units (Class C3) comprising two dwelling houses over all floors and two studio flats at part lower ground floor, including works of excavation at lower ground floor level – still being determined.

2010/5567/P - Additions and alteration to existing block of flats (Class C3) to include removal of the existing mansard roof and exterior rear stairwell, the erection of a new second storey with new mansard roof at third floor level, erection of side, part rear extension at lower ground level and rear extension at ground, first and second floor level, all in association with reconfiguration of existing 5 no. flats to provide 1 x 1 bed, 3 x 2 bed and 1 x 3 bed flats. Granted subject to a S106 10 May 2011

2010/0636/P & 2010/0751/C: Demolition of existing building and erection of a four-storey and two level basement building to provide 4 (2 x 2-bed and 2 x 3-bed) residential units (Class C3),following demolition of existing four-storey building. Withdrawn 14/05/2010.

2008/2714/P & 2008/3167/C: Demolition of existing building and erection of a four-storey building with two levels basement to provide 2x 2-bedroom and 2x 3-bedroom residential units. Refused 31/10/2008. Appeals (Ref no's APP/X5210/A/09/2098025 & APP/x5210/E/09/2098026) dismissed 08/06/2009.

2007/1796/P & 2007/1801/C: Replacement of the existing 3 storey and basement property (containing 5 flats) by a 5-storey building with two basements containing 5 self-contained flats with basement parking for 6 cars, plus balconies at rear and roof terrace to front/side elevations. Withdrawn

27/08/2007.

2007/6314/P & 2008/0755/C: Demolition of the existing property and the erection of a replacement four storey building with two levels of basements containing 5 self-contained flats and basement parking, plus balconies to front and roof terrace to front/side. Refused 04/04/2008.

Relevant policies

LDF Core Strategy and Development Policies

CS5 – Managing the impact of growth and development

CS13 – Tackling climate change through promoting higher environmental standards

CS14 – Promoting high quality places and conserving our heritage

CS16 – Improving Camden's health and well-being

DP22 – Promoting sustainable design and construction

DP23 – Water

DP24 – Securing high quality design

DP25 – Conserving Camden's heritage

DP26 – Managing the impact of development on occupiers and neighbours

DP32 – Air quality and Camden's Clear Zone

Camden Planning Guidance 2011

Hampstead Conservation Area Statement

Assessment

1.0 Proposal

- 1.1 The proposal involves the demolition of the existing garage fronting onto Pilgrim's Lane and its replacement with a brick built double garage with slightly sloping sedum (green) roof and extended footprint of the garage up to the boundary walls and trellis fence of No.'s 8, 9 and 10 Willow Road.
- 1.2 The existing garage measures 4.8m (w) x 4.9m (l) x 1.8m (h) above ground level, but which is excavated internally by a further 0.5-0.6m from the street frontage back onto the site. The structure is accessed via a ramp from street level which drops down into the garage relatively steeply.
- 1.3 The existing garage is built of a pre-fabricated concrete frame and concrete panels. The structure sits on a 5 sided plot which backs on to the rear gardens of the neighbouring properties at No. 9 and No. 10 Willow Road at oblique angles to the north east and north west. There is also a levels difference between these gardens and the existing structure of between 2.5-3.5m.
- 1.4 The garage structure also sits off these boundaries by 0.7m on the 45 Pilgrim's Lane boundary (SW), 1.5m with the garden at No. 10 Willow Road (NW), between 0.5m – 2.5m with No. 9 Willow Road (NE). The gap between the neighbouring fences and the garage as built contains vegetation and which gives an awareness of space and light between their trellis fences and the solidity of the garage structure. The roof of the existing structure slopes very gradually from the street up into the plot.
- 1.5 The proposal seeks to enlarge the footprint of the garage structure to fill the entire plot, which will consist of two parts; namely the main box forming the garage space which can be used to park two vehicles and a steep sided roof section around the outside which slopes down to the height of the neighbouring fences, which will form space to be able to move around two parked vehicles and for storage. The applicant proposes the changes to be able to park two modern sized vehicles off street which is an acceptable use as there is no change in the use of the land.
- 1.6 The main section of the garage will measure 5.5m square and will extend south west to sit just inside the boundary wall with No. 45 Pilgrims Lane, south east towards the street by 0.4m and by 0.3m to the north east closer to the rear garden with No. 9 Willow Road. The structure will measure 2.5m on the front elevation and slopes back into the site to 1.8m. An infill section between the conventional garage structure and the boundary fences will be built with a more steeply sloped render clad roof measuring 1.1m in height on the north western and north eastern boundaries. Internally, the garage will be excavated a further 200mm inside towards the north west so that internally head heights can be maintained when walking around vehicles. This will require no further depth to the existing foundations and the proposed foundations will be a shallow raft foundation with mini piles rather than deep trench strip foundations and therefore will not impact upon the Willow Road stream or on tree roots.

2.0 Design

- 2.1 The replacement garage is essentially an extended form of what already exists except built in brick with a sedum roof and which slopes from the back to the street.
- 2.2 LDF Development Policy DP24 considers that, alterations should respect the character and proportions of the existing building; should be of a high design standard; and respect the character, setting, context and the form and scale of neighbouring buildings.
- 2.4 Furthermore, Camden's Planning Guidance: Design, (paragraph 4.24) states that development in rear gardens should:
 - Ensure the siting, location, scale and design of the proposed development has a minimal visual

impact on, and is visually subordinate to the host garden

- Not detract from the open character and garden amenity of the neighbouring gardens and wider surrounding area;
- Use suitable soft landscaping to reduce the impact of the proposed development
- Ensure building heights will retain visibility over garden walls and fences; and
- Use materials which compliment the host property and overall character of the surrounding area;

2.5 The proposed garage has been designed so as to minimise its visual impact with render and brick built walls and green roof, and would replace the existing garage and be extended over unusable areas of the main garden and would not compromise openness. This is because the overall height increase is 300mm on the front elevation and away from neighbouring gardens, but the rear is no higher than the existing structure and therefore the visibility over walls and fences is no more harmful than exists at present. Objections have been made over views through existing trellis fences, but this will be addressed in the amenity section of this report.

2.6 With such a minimal increase in height on the front elevation, the views from the Pilgrim's Lane elevation is also not considered to be harmed.

Green roof

2.7 The application proposes a green roof covering the entire conventional garage roof. This is welcomed as it softens the impact of the proposal when viewed from the upper floors of neighbouring properties and encourages biodiversity into the area. In order to secure the provision of the green roof and a scheme of maintenance it is recommended that conditions are appended to any planning approval, which should enable the Council to control the long term appearance.

Conclusion

2.8 Therefore, it is considered that the design of the proposal and the materials to be used are all acceptable as they are considered to preserve and enhance to character and appearance of the Hampstead Conservation Area and are therefore comply with policies CS5, CS14, DP24 and DP25 of Camden's Local Development Framework Plans.

3.0 Amenity

3.1 The objectors raise concerns over amenity by way of a sense of enclosure and overshadowing, outlook, impact on sunlight and daylight and the loss of a sense of space which currently exists between the neighbouring garden trellis fences and the existing garage structure.

Sunlight and daylight / overshadowing

3.2 The proposed structure is no higher than the existing garage close to the boundary fences with No. 9 and 10 Willow Road and which rise 0.7m over the 5.5m long roof. The rear elevation of No. 9 Willow Road is also located between 9.3 - 10m away from the structure, and therefore, the impact to sunlight and daylight and over shadowing will be minimal and very similar to the existing situation.

Outlook

3.3 The impact to outlook will be of an improved looking building from the dilapidated concrete garage that presently exists. However, at present there is some greenery which exists between and on the garage and the trellis fences of the neighbouring properties on Willow Road. There will be a loss to some of this greenery because this space will be built on. However, this will be replaced with the introduction of the green roof which would off set the loss of this greenery, albeit not in

the same location.

- 3.4 The largest amenity issue is the loss of the sense of space between the trellis fence and the original garage. By creating a larger footprint and removing this space, a sense of depth and space will be lost from these neighbouring residential gardens. However, this loss is considered minor enough not to be considered to outweigh the merits of the proposal in terms of the improved look of the replacement garage and green roof, and what already exists on the site.

Impact from other development

- 3.5 Local residents have also raised concerns over an undetermined application at No. 45 Pilgrim's Lane (Refs: 2011/6199/P and 2011/6421/C) for the demolition and the erection of a 5 storey building to provide four residential units (Class C3). These concerns surround the relocation of building line closer to the rear of the Willow Road properties and the increased sense of enclosure and loss of space that this might cause.
- 3.6 It should be noted that planning permission has already been granted for a rebuilt second floor and mansard roof and new rear extension.
- 3.7 The current proposal will effectively infill the gap between the approved side extension and the front elevation of this property and extend upwards over three floors, and so will come closer to the rear of the Willow Road properties by 1.8m.
- 3.8 Therefore, taking these issues together, the works to extend the garage at No. 8 Willow Road are not considered to add any further harm to the loss of sense of space than has already been approved, or in fact is currently proposed and is therefore considered acceptable.

Health and safety

- 3.9 Officer's have been informed that the demolition of the existing structure had the asbestos roof removed approximately 12 months ago. It has been used as a site office for development in the main house ever since and was considered safe to work in during that time. Therefore, this is not considered to be contaminated and is safe to be demolished without fear of contamination to neighbouring properties or the atmosphere.

Conclusion

- 3.10 Therefore, the proposed design is considered not to cause any amenity issues which would outweigh the proposal as a whole and is therefore in general compliance with policy DP26 of Camden's Local Development Framework Plan 2010.

Recommendation: Grant Planning Permission

DISCLAIMER

Decision route to be decided by nominated members on Monday 30th April 2012. For further information see

<http://www.camden.gov.uk/ccm/navigation/environment/planning-and-built-environment/planning-applications/development-control-members-briefing/>