

Delegated Report		Analysis sheet		Expiry Date:		22/08/2012	
		N/A / attached		Consultation Expiry Date:		09/08/2012	
Officer				Application Number(s)			
Richard Black				i) 2012/3329/P ii) 2012/3043/C			
Application Address				Drawing Numbers			
8 Fitzroy Square London W1T 5HN				See Decision Notice			
PO 3/4		Area Team Signature		C&UD		Authorised Officer Signature	
Proposal(s)							
i) Erection of rear extension at first to third floor level, and installation of rooflight at roof level all in connection with existing dwellinghouse (Class C3).							
ii) Erection of rear extension at first to third floor level, installation of rooflight at roof level and internal alterations all in connection with existing dwellinghouse (Class C3).							
Recommendation(s):		i) Refuse Planning Permission ii) Refuse Listed Building Consent					
Application Type:		i) Householder Application ii) Listed Building Consent					
Conditions or Reasons for Refusal:		Refer to Draft Decision Notice					
Informatives:							
Consultations							
Adjoining Occupiers:		No. notified	14	No. of responses	00	No. of objections	00
				No. electronic	00		
Summary of consultation responses:		A site notice was displayed outside the property between 13/07/2012 and 03/08/2012 and a press notice was published in the Ham & High on 19/07/2012. One letter of objection was received, stating: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> The proposal will result in a significant reduction in sunlight/daylight for adjoining property. 					
CAAC/Local groups* comments: *Please Specify		English Heritage has suggested conditions, should planning permission be granted.					

Site Description

The application site relates to a 4-storey plus basement Grade I listed buildings situated in a terrace on the east side of Fitzroy Square, a principle space in the Fitzroy Square Conservation Area. The The property underwent some post-war rebuilding (particularly in its upper portion at the rear) and was in office use for many years. It was recently converted back to a single family dwelling in 2010.

Relevant History

8 Fitzroy Square (the application site)

2009/3352/P - Change of use of basement, ground plus three upper floors from an office (Class B1) to a single residential dwelling (Class C3). Granted planning permission 23/12/2009 and implemented.

2012/0388/P & 2012/0437/L - Erection of rear extension from first to third floor, installation of new doors to basement lightwell, removal of existing vent on roof and installation of 2 rooflights all in connection with existing dwellinghouse (Class C3). Refused 09/05/2012.

1) The proposed rear extension by reason of its height and bulk fails to be subservient to the host building, compromises features on the host building (namely the rear bow window), and obscures the almost uninterrupted rear façade of this stretch of the terrace. It therefore is considered to cause harm to the special interest of the Grade I listed building and fails to preserve and enhance the character and appearance of the Fitzroy Square Conservation Area.

The refusal has been appealed to the Planning Inspectorate, however at the date of preparing this report, a determination has not been made.

7 Fitzroy Square & 11 Grafton Mews

2009/2507/P & 2009/2511/L - Change of use of No. 7 Fitzroy Square from offices (Class B1) to residential (Class C3) and erection of building to rear comprising lower ground, ground, first to third floor and mansard roof storey (following demolition of No. 11 Grafton Mews (Class B1)) to provide in total 5 x 1-bedroom and 2 x 2-bedroom flats (in rear building) and 1 x 4-bedroom dwellinghouse (in front building) with staff accommodation at rear lower ground floor level (in rear building) and replacement of windows at basement and ground floor level and internal alterations at No. 7 Fitzroy Square – Withdrawn as the applicant failed to sign the S106.

2011/5382/P & 2011/5549/L - Change of use of No. 7 Fitzroy Square from offices (Class B1) to residential (Class C3) and erection of building to rear comprising lower ground, ground, first to third floor and mansard roof storey (following demolition of No. 11 Grafton Mews (Class B1) to provide 1 x studio, 3 x 1-bedroom and 2 x 2-bedroom flats and 1 x 3-bedroom (in rear building) and 1 x 4-bedroom house (in front building and lower ground floor of rear building), installation of glass lift shaft on rear elevation of 7 Fitzroy Square and replacement of windows at basement and ground floor level on front elevation of 7 Fitzroy Square. Pending consideration.

Relevant policies

National Planning Policy Framework (adopted March 2012)

The London Plan (July 2012)

Policy 7.6 (Architecture)

Policy 7.8 (Heritage assets and Archaeology)

Local Development Framework - Core Strategy and Development Policies 2011

CS5 (Managing the impact of growth and development)

CS14 (Promoting high quality places and conserving our heritage)

DP24 (Securing high quality design)

DP25 (Conserving Camden's heritage)

DP26 (Managing the impact of development on occupiers and neighbours)

Fitzroy Square Conservation Area Statement (March 2010)

Camden Planning Guidance 2011

CPG 1 (Design)

CPG 6 (Amenity)

Assessment

The Proposal

The scheme proposes the following extensions and internal alterations to the building:

External alterations

- Demolition of the existing closet wing and the erection of a rear extension;
- A skylight on the main roof of the building.

Internal alterations

- Remodel existing layout to accommodate a new bathroom, study and toilet/utility room created by the new extension;
- New doors and openings in association with the proposed extension.

In terms of the rear extension, the only alterations from that previously refused (2012/0017/P) at the subject site, is a reduction in the height of the rear extension from 9.9m to 9.5m (-0.4m), width from 3.1m to 2.9m (-0.2m) and the incision of a junction to restrict the connection between the original rear façade and the proposed extension.

Planning Considerations

The main planning issues associated with the proposed development include design/visual impact and amenity. These are addressed below in the context of planning policy and other material considerations.

Design/Visual Impact

Policy DP25 of the LDF requires that all alterations and extensions with designated conservation areas and to listed buildings preserve and enhance the character and appearance of the area and the special architectural or historic interest of the building.

As stated above, the property has undergone a number of alterations since World War II, and as such has been extended to the rear to form a lower and upper ground floor closet wing containing kitchen, WC and ancillary accommodation. Internal alterations have also been made to the plan form, particularly at lower ground and third floor level. Nonetheless, the principal floors retain roughly their original plan form.

The proposed two-storey closet wing extension, affecting the first and second floors, is not considered to be acceptable in this location, despite its detailing and use of materials which are intended to complement the architecture of the Grade I listed building. There is an in-principle objection to the added height and bulk of this element which will obscure a major section of the rear elevation at a high level on the listed building. The impact of such an extension would not only harm the host building but the wider rear elevation of the terrace, despite only be partially visible from the surrounding area. Reference in this instance should be made to paragraph 13.25 of the Fitzroy Square Conservation Area Appraisal and Management Strategy which states,

“Within the Fitzroy Square Conservation Area there are many examples of historic rear elevations which are of interest. The original historic pattern of rear elevations within a street or group of buildings is an integral part of the character of the area and as such rear extensions will not be acceptable where they would compromise the special character.”

The proposal is also required to comply with the design guidance on extensions and alterations in section 4 of CPG1, with paragraph 4.10 requiring extensions to be secondary to the building being extended and respect and preserve the original design and proportions of the building, including its architectural period and style. Further paragraphs outline the importance of such extensions being subservient to the host building and to neighbouring buildings and should take into account other rear extensions. As stated above, the rear elevation of this stretch of the terrace remains very much in its original form (albeit being partly rebuilt in the post-war period to replicate its original form).

A proposal for a full height lift extension on the rear of No 7 Fitzroy Square, to the immediate south, has been considered. This proposal is subject of current planning and listed building consent applications, and was agreed in principle in 2008 (but was subject of an unsigned Section 106 agreement). However, this proposal is not seen to be a relevant precedent for the extension in question since it is a much more lightweight element which would read as structure that could be easily removed in the future with the original fabric made good.

Also it would be significantly smaller in plan form (both in width and depth), and would not obscure or compromise existing elements of the rear elevation in the same manner.

Amenity

The proposed rear wing extension is sited along the boundary with No.7 Fitzroy Square, and therefore in terms of outlook, the windows on the rear bay of this property would be the most directly affected. Despite consent being sought for a residential conversion of this property at the present time it provides Class B1 office accommodation and the proposal would therefore not harm the business use by way of a loss of outlook.

The application does not propose any windows on the east side elevation of the new rear wing extension which ensures that there would be no loss of privacy to the occupiers of No.13 Grafton Mews. Whilst it is recognised that the extension would be relatively imposing when viewed from No.13, it is considered not to result in an unacceptable loss of daylight/sunlight or outlook.

The windows on the north side elevation of the new rear wing extension would serve a study (Ground Floor), utility room (first floor) and a bathroom (second floors) and are not considered to result in a loss of privacy to the occupiers of properties to the north of the application site.

Conclusions

The proposed two-storey first and second floor extension to the rear closet wing is considered to cause harm to the special interest of the Grade I listed building and fails to preserve and enhance the character and appearance of the Fitzroy Square Conservation Area. This is due to the added height and bulk which fails to be subservient to the host building, compromises features on the host building (namely the rear bow window), and obscures the almost uninterrupted rear façade of this stretch of the terrace. A rear extension of the proposed height and bulk would be an unacceptable precedent causing harm to the rear of the Grade I listed terrace.

As such the proposal is contrary to LDF policies CS14, DP24 and DP25, the design guidance in CPG1 on rear extensions, the Fitzroy Square Conservation Area Appraisal and Management Strategy paragraph 13.25, and the English Heritage guidance on London Terraced Houses.

Since only the rear closet wing extension and associated elements are considered to be unacceptable, it is recommended that an informative is put on any listed building/planning permission refusal stating that works to the lower ground floor interior and minor alterations to the exterior (rooflight in the centre of the main roof structure) would be acceptable in principle.

Recommendation

Refuse planning permission and listed building consent.

Disclaimer

This is an internet copy for information purposes. If you require a copy of the signed original please telephone Contact Camden on (020) 7974 4444