

<b>Delegated Report</b>		<b>Analysis sheet</b>	<b>Expiry Date:</b>	<b>02/08/2013</b>
		N/A	<b>Consultation Expiry Date:</b>	<b>18/7/13</b>
<b>Officer</b>			<b>Application Number(s)</b>	
Alan Wito			1) 2013/2887/P 2) 2013/2938/L	
<b>Application Address</b>			<b>Drawing Numbers</b>	
35 Swinton Street London WC1X 9NT			See decision notice	
<b>PO 3/4</b>	<b>Area Team Signature</b>	<b>C&amp;UD</b>	<b>Authorised Officer Signature</b>	
<b>Proposal(s)</b>				
Erection of mansard roof with 3x dormer windows and 1x roof-light.				
<b>Recommendation(s):</b>		1) Refuse Planning Permission 2) Refuse Listed Building Consent		
<b>Application Type:</b>		1) Planning Permission 2) Listed Building Consent		

Conditions or Reasons for Refusal:	Refer to Draft Decision Notice					
Informatives:						
<b>Consultations</b>						
Adjoining Occupiers:	No. notified	<b>16</b>	No. of responses	<b>00</b>	No. of objections	<b>00</b>
			No. electronic	<b>00</b>		
Summary of consultation responses:	<p>A site notice was put up outside of the property from 19/6/13 to 10/7/13 and a press notice published on 27/6/13.</p> <p>Two objections have been received:</p> <p>The first objection comes from the a resident of 39 Swinton Street and states that if planning permission is granted then the coping stones to the roof between 35 and 37 Swinton Street should be restored. Additionally the exhaust pipe on the rear of the building should be removed.</p> <p>The second objection relates to alleged breaches of planning controls on the building, namely the rental of the garage as a studio flat, three satellite dishes on the rear elevation and estate agent boards which are often seen on the building. It is also stated that the mansard would not enhance the building.</p> <p><i>Response: These issues relate to the existing condition of the building. It is not clear when the satellite dishes and flue were attached to the building. These will be investigated further and enforcement action taken if necessary.</i></p> <p><i>The garage was erected in 2011 and replaced a previous structure. It was advised that listed building consent was required but none has been submitted yet. There is no record of the planning permission haven been granted for use of the garage as a studio and this has been referred to our enforcement team.</i></p> <p><i>The assessment of the impact of the mansard roof is made below.</i></p>					
CAAC/Local groups* comments: *Please Specify	Bloomsbury CAAC was notified of the scheme but no comments have been received.					

## Site Description

The subject site is located on the south side of Swinton Street and comprises of a 3-storey mid terraced residential property with a basement level. The property is Grade II listed and falls within the Bloomsbury Conservation Area. It forms part of a distinct group of listed buildings (nos. 35-49) dating from c.1835-44. They share many characteristics including the stuccoed rusticated ground floor with round headed windows and simple window reveals. The subject site is located within the Central London Area and forms part of the Red Route network.

## Relevant History

### 35 Swinton Street

**23596(R)**: The construction of a garage at the rear. (Permission **granted**, dated 8/3/1977)

**31133(R)**: Erection of a single storey pre-fabricated building in the rear yard and raising the boundary wall to Swinton Place by 600mm to 2400mm. (Permission **refused**, dated 5/12/1980)

**HB2534**: Demolition of an existing lean-to extension and the erection of a single storey pre-fabricated building in the rear yard, involving the raising of the boundary wall to Swinton Place by 600mm. (Listed building consent **refused**, dated 5/12/1980)

**2008/0327/P and 2008/1011/L**: Creation of three garage spaces fronting Swinton Place (in connection with residential units) and associated external alterations and access onto Swinton Place. (planning permission and listed building consent **refused**, dated 29/5/08)

### 29-33 Swinton Street

**HB1295**: Works involving the demolition of rear extensions, the erection of new mansard roofs to 29 and 31 and new mansard windows to 29, 31 and 33 and alterations to stair wells and associated windows. (Permission **granted**, dated 5/4/76)

### 37 Swinton Street

**31075(R2) and HB2507(R2)**: Change of use, including works of conversion, to one self-contained maisonette and three self-contained flats, and the erection of a mansard roof extension. (Planning permission and listed building consent **granted**, dated 26/3/81)

### 47-53 Swinton Street

**11213(R) and HB455**: The rebuilding and extension of the rear addition and the construction of a mansard roof and lift shaft at 47-55 Swinton Street W.C.1. (Planning permission and listed building consent **granted**, dated 2/9/71 and 24/10/72 respectively)

### 28-34 Acton Street

**33984 and HB2861**: Change of use, including works of conversion, to 4 self-contained maisonettes, and 6 self-contained flats, and the erection of a new mansard roof at 3rd floor level. (Planning permission and listed building consent **granted**, dated 31/8/82)

## Relevant policies

### LDF Core Strategy and Development Policies

**CS1** - Distribution of growth

**CS5** – Managing the impact of growth and development

**CS13** – Tackling climate change through promoting higher environmental standards

**CS14** – Promoting high quality places and conserving our heritage

### Development Policies

**DP22** – Promoting sustainable design and construction

**DP24** – Securing high quality design

**DP25** – Conserving Camden's heritage

**DP26** – Managing the impact of development on occupiers and neighbours

**Bloomsbury Conservation Area Appraisal and Management Strategy (2011)**

**Camden Planning Guidance 2011**

**National Planning Policy Framework 2012**

**English Heritage guidance note 'London Terrace Houses 1660-1860'**

## Assessment

### Proposals

These applications seek permission for the erection of a mansard roof extension to create an enlarged attic storey flat. The roof extension would involve building up the party wall and behind the existing gable and would incorporate two dormer windows to the front elevation.

### Revisions

A slightly revised scheme has been received which amended errors on the drawings in relation to the internal layout and retain the existing gable with the mansard sitting behind.

### Conservation and Design

The subject site forms part of a row of grade II listed buildings nos. 35-49 (odd). Within close proximity to the application site there are mansard roofs. Mansard roofs exist at 29, 31, 33, 37 and 39 Swinton Street. Additionally mansard roof also exist on 34 Acton Street and mansard roof exists on the front slope of 36 Acton Street. It is noted that these date from the 1970s or early 1980s (or not record exists of their approval) and pre-date existing policy and guidance.

It is acknowledged that mansard roof exist on many of the surrounding buildings, however what makes this building an exceptional case is that it is an end of terrace building with an ornate gable featuring a stucco cornice and pediment. This forms an attractive terminating feature to the façade and is clearly silhouetted against the skyline.

CPG1 is clear in paragraph 5.8 that a roof alteration or extension is likely to be unacceptable in the following circumstances:

- Buildings or terraces which have a roof line that is exposed to important London-wide and local views from public spaces;
- Buildings whose roof construction or form are unsuitable for roof additions such as shallow pitched roofs with eaves;
- The Building is designed as a complete composition where its architectural style would be undermined by an addition at roof level;

The erection of a mansard roof on this building would, even set behind, harm the silhouette and primacy of this feature on the façade of the building and the terminating piece of the elevation. Whilst the slate mansard would sit behind the gable and pediment it would still be clearly seen behind and would jar with the building's appearance. This impact would be clear in both close views and longer views from both Swinton Place and Swinton Street. It is likely that this feature existed on all of the corner buildings on Swinton Place although it has been lost on 34 Action Street and 33 Swinton Street. However these pre-date existing policy and guidance and their loss does not act as a precedent in this case.

Due to the longer views that are possible of the building any roof form which tried to address these concerns would have to be so contrived in its form that it would be harmful to the special interest of the building. Mansards are the traditional form of extending this type of building but should be executed to scholarly designs which respect existing features

The insertion of appropriately sized dormers into the existing roof form which respect the overall fenestration pattern of the building may be an acceptable alternative to provide additional accommodation.

The proposed mansard roof would harm both the special interest of the listed building and the character and appearance of Bloomsbury Conservation Area.

### **Amenity**

The proposed rear mansard roof extension with windows would not create any further loss of amenity to the neighbouring occupiers with regard to overlooking, sense of enclosure or sunlight/daylight.

### **Recommendation**

Refuse Planning Permission and Listed Building Consent