

Delegated Report (Members' Briefing)		Analysis sheet		Expiry Date:		15/10/2013	
		N/A / attached		Consultation Expiry Date:		10/10/2013	
Officer				Application Number(s)			
Rob Tulloch				2013/5302/P			
Application Address				Drawing Numbers			
La Sainte Union Catholic School Highgate Road London NW5 1RP				See decision notice			
PO 3/4	Area Team Signature	C&UD	Authorised Officer Signature				
Proposal(s)							
Alterations and extensions to senior block of existing school (Class D1) including erection of a two storey side extension to north-east elevation, single storey extension at first floor level to north west elevation, infill extension to entrance on north east elevation, and replacement windows and tiling							
Recommendation(s):		Grant Planning Permission					
Application Type:		Full Planning Permission					
Conditions:		Refer to Draft Decision Notice					
Informatives:							
Consultations							
Adjoining Occupiers:		No. notified	21	No. of responses	13	No. of objections	13
Summary of consultation responses:		Site notice 11/09/2013-02/20/2013 Press advert 19/09/2013-10/10/2013					
		Objections were received from nos. 29, 31 & 35 St Alban's Road, and 6, 9, 10, 11, 13, 17, 19 & 26 Brookfield Park.					
		<u>Design</u> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Proposed extension is too large Green/yellow aluminium cladding is too garish and would be harmful to the character and appearance of the building and conservation area The proposed tiles will make an unattractive building stand out even more Aluminium is not a sustainable product Other locations within the site would be more suitable for extensions Could pave the way for a four storey extension later Overdevelopment of site 					
		Officer response: The proposed extensions are considered to be subservient to the host building given the size of the building and wider site, and would not constitute overdevelopment of the site. The proposed tiling is considered appropriate. There is an extant permission for a similar first floor extension in the same location as proposed, and the school considers the proposals to be in the right location and most economical location to maximise funding.					

(see section 2)

Amenity

- Loss of outlook from properties in St Alban's Road and Brookfield Park as a result of the extensions
- Loss of light
- Will block views of buildings on Highgate Road
- Loss of privacy and increased noise/pollution from additional pedestrian/vehicular traffic and moving access road closer to St Alban's Road
- Loss of privacy from roof terrace
- Security risk from roof terrace
- Noise and dust from construction work – school is already noisy

Officer response: Due to the size and location of the extensions it is not considered that they would have a detrimental impact on the amenity of adjoining occupiers in terms of daylight and sunlight or outlook. The access road leads to a small car park so does not carry through traffic or a large number of vehicles. The repositioning of the road is relatively minor and would only move the road 3m closer to the rear garden boundaries of the properties on St Alban's Road, the road would still be 11m away. An existing roof terrace would be replaced with a first floor extension, no new terraces are proposed.

(see section 3)

Trees

- Loss of amenity from removal of listed trees
- Harm to wildlife
- Existing trees block view of the school, particularly one that screens the building when viewed from St Alban's Road
- Small gap (7m) between road and rear boundary walls of St Alban's Road is insufficient for replanting trees or screening

Officer response: Only young trees would be removed, none of which are covered by Tree Preservation Orders, and the same number of trees would be replanted to maintain a screen between St Alban's Road and the school buildings. The gap between the wall and road would be 11m and is sufficient for tree planting. The application has been revised so that the mature tree visible through a gap from St Alban's Road would be retained. The proposal is not considered to harmfully impact upon the site's biodiversity (see section 4)

Insufficient notification – only one site notice displayed

Officer response: The consultation process is considered to be sufficient. One site notice was displayed, an advert placed in the press and 21 properties around the application site were notified.

CAAC/Local group comments:

Dartmouth Park CAAC consider the submitted plans to be inadequate and object. They also consider insufficient site notices were displayed.

Site Description

La Sainte Union School comprises several buildings surrounded by Highgate Road to the west, Croftdown Road to the south, Brookfield Park to the east and St Albans Road to the north. The building facing Highgate Road was formerly a Roman Catholic convent and is listed Grade II listed. More modern 1960's buildings are located toward Brookfield Park, including the senior block where the works are proposed. The site is well treed and an area to the east of the block is designated as private open space. The site also lies within the Dartmouth Park Conservation Area.

Relevant History

2013/1066/P Continued use of single storey temporary portacabin to the south boundary of Croftdown Road (Class D1). Granted 31/05/2013

2012/1964/P Extension at first floor level over an existing terrace (Class D1). Granted 18/05/2012

2010/1971/P Erection of a single storey portacabin outbuilding within existing school grounds to provide additional teaching space and associated relocation of existing bicycle storage racks for a temporary period of three years. Granted 27/05/2010

2008/6008/P Retention of single storey temporary portacabin adjacent to the south boundary with Croftdown Road. Refuse and Warning of Enforcement Action 30/03/2009

PEX0100298 The erection of a four storey extension to the existing school (amendment to scheme approved on 9th November 2000 Ref: PEX0000499). Granted 21/06/2001

PEX0000499 The erection of a four storey extension to the existing School. Granted 09/11/2000

P9601311R1 The erection of a ground and first floor extension for use additional classroom space. Granted 01/11/1996

There is extensive planning history for the site and numerous other applications have been determined including works to the listed building.

Relevant policies

LDF Core Strategy and Development Policies

CS5 Managing the impact of growth and development

CS10 Supporting community facilities and services

CS11 Promoting sustainable and efficient travel

CS14 Promoting high quality places and conserving our heritage

CS15 Protecting and improving our parks and open spaces and encouraging biodiversity

DP15 Community and leisure uses

DP16 The transport implications of development

DP24 Securing high quality design

DP25 Conserving Camden's heritage

DP26 Managing the impact of development on occupiers and neighbours

Camden Planning Guidance 2011/13

Dartmouth Park Conservation Area Appraisal and Management Strategy

NPPF 2012

Assessment

1 Proposal

- 1.1 The school has received Capital Investment Programme (CIP) funding from the Council to undertake improvement works to the school buildings. The proposal is for works of alteration and extension to the Senior Block including a new entrance and two extensions to the building, replacement windows and hanging tiles, and the repositioning of an access road.
- 1.2 During the course of the application it has been revised to retain one of the trees proposed for removal. This tree is the only one (of the group to be removed) visible from St Alban's Road and is considered to have amenity value.
- 1.3 The main issues are:
- Design
 - Amenity
 - Sustainability
 - Trees and biodiversity
 - Transport
 - Community Infrastructure Levy

2 Design

- 2.1 The school occupies a large site of over 2.7 hectares (27,000sqm). Within the site are various school buildings including the listed former convent facing Highgate Road. The proposal relates to the Senior Block, which is a 1-4 storey 1960's building at the north eastern end of the site set around a quadrangle.

Front entrance

- 2.2 The existing senior block entrance is accessed from Croftdown Road and does not have a street presence. It receives the majority of the school's visitors, but the recessed entrance, which is partly under a first floor oriel extension, is not particularly welcoming. It is proposed to make the entrance more of a focal point by filling in the void and extending slightly outward (2.3m) to provide a more conventional reception. The school's name would also be added to the base of the existing first floor extension.

Windows and tiling

- 2.3 It is proposed to enhance the appearance of the front (north west) and side (north east) elevations of the senior block by replacing the windows and tiling scheme. The existing critical windows would be replaced with powder coated aluminium units, with a similar design to the windows on the existing four storey extension. The beige concrete tiling that currently covers the spandrels would be replaced with Aluminium Composite Material (ACM) panels in various shades of green with specks of yellow to reflect the school's colours.

Single storey extension

- 2.4 The north east side of the senior building comprises the flank of the four storey front building and a two storey gym, connected by a part one/part two storey link. This link building has classrooms on the ground floor and a staff common room and terrace on the first floor. The building is largely glazed with a brick base and concrete tiles between the floors. It is proposed to erect a single storey extension at first floor level where the terrace currently is, to provide an additional classroom.
- 2.5 The proposed single storey extension would measure approximately 9m (w) x 10m (d) x 4m (h)

and would continue the general design and tiling pattern proposed for the front (north east) elevation. Permission was granted in 2012 for a similar extension, but this has not been implemented. The approved extension was considered subordinate, and the design and materials were considered appropriate as they matched the existing building.

Two storey extension

- 2.6 It is also proposed to erect a two storey extension to the flank of the four storey front building. This extension would measure 15.3m (w) x 8.8m (d) x 8m (h). It would provide additional administrative space and a disabled toilet at ground floor level with teaching space above. The extension would also replicate the fenestration and facing materials of the rest of the scheme. The extension would require part of the access road to the rear of the site to be pushed 3m closer to the boundary with the rear gardens of the houses on St Alban's Road, and result in the removal of eight trees.

Assessment

- 2.7 Although the changes would not be readily visible from the public realm they would be apparent to pupils, staff and visitors to the school, as well as being visible from surrounding properties. The proposed entrance and re-branding are considered to improve the appearance of the building as well as enhancing its functionality and accessibility. The proposed extensions, given the size of the senior block and the site in general, would be subordinate to the host building and are not considered harmful to the character or appearance of the building or conservation area.
- 2.8 The proposed tiling would reinforce the school's identity by utilising the school's colours and would maintain the building's linear proportions. The colour of the tiling is considered appropriate given the context of a 1960's school building. The existing elevations, particularly the front (north east) elevation currently appear rather tired, the concrete tiling is in a poor state of repair, and the 20 year old extension to the south, built with slightly different materials and fenestration, also gives the front elevation a somewhat disjointed appearance. The proposed elevational changes would give the building a more cohesive appearance and are considered to enhance the appearance of the building.
- 2.9 The proposed alterations and extensions would be 170m away from the listed building and are not considered to affect its setting. Only the proposed two storey extension would be partially visible from the designated open space, and is therefore not considered to have any impact on its character. As such the proposal is not considered to harm the character or appearance of the host building, conservation area or open space, and would comply with policies CS14, CS15, DP24 and DP25 of the LDF and Camden Planning Guidance.
- 2.10 As such the proposal is not considered to harm the character or appearance of the host building, conservation area, listed building or open space and would comply with policies CS14, DP24 and DP25 of the LDF and Camden Planning Guidance.

3 Amenity

Daylight/sunlight

- 3.1 The proposed two storey block would be 24m away from the rear of the properties on St Alban's Road. The proposed first floor extension would be 34m away. The two storey extension would be in the shadow of the four storey flank elevation it would be appended to when viewed from St Alban's Road. The first floor extension would not obtrude a line drawn at 25° from any ground floor window, which suggests that there would be no impact on sunlight or daylight in line with BRE guidance.

- 3.2 The proposed two storey extension would be 35m away from the rear of the houses on Brookfield Park, and the first floor extension would not be visible from Brookfield Park. The two storey extension would not obstruct a line drawn at 25° from ground floor windows at the rear of Brookfield Park. As such the proposed extensions are not considered to have an impact on sunlight or daylight to any neighbouring properties. Due to the distances of the extensions from neighbouring properties, and their height and location, the proposals are not considered to have an impact on outlook from neighbouring properties.

Overlooking

- 3.3 The proposed extensions would have windows at first floor level facing both St Alban's Road and Brookfield Park. The proposed first floor extension would face St Alban's Road and be alongside existing first floor windows, it would also replace an existing terrace (no additional terrace is proposed). There is also an extant permission for a similar extension. The proposed two storey extension would have no windows facing St Alban's Road, but would have windows at first floor level facing Brookfield Park. This would introduce one additional classroom alongside three much larger classrooms at first floor level. As such, it is not considered that the proposal would lead to a loss of privacy for adjoining occupiers. Furthermore, as a guide, Camden Planning Guidance recommends a minimum distance of 18m between directly facing habitable rooms to prevent overlooking, and the extensions would be in excess of this

Transport

- 3.4 The two storey extension would require a section of access road to be relocated 3.5m to the northwest. This road leads to a car park, which is not being altered or extended, and also provides emergency access. The repositioned section would be 10m away from the rear garden walls of the properties on St Alban's Road, and 20m from the rear elevations of the houses. The access road is not a through road and the car park is relatively small, and would primarily be used during school hours and term time. Due to the small size of the car park and minimal change in location of the access road, it is not considered that vehicle movements would cause any additional impact on the amenity of the neighbours. There is no footway alongside the road, nor are there building entrances on the northwest elevation of the block, so there would be no additional pupil movements.
- 3.5 As such the proposal are not considered to harm the amenity of adjoining occupiers and would comply with policies CS5 and DP26 of the LDF and Camden Planning Guidance.

4 Sustainability

- 4.1 Policy DP22 states that the Council will require development to incorporate sustainable design and construction measures. The new windows would improve the thermal efficiency of the building and increase natural ventilation when compared to the existing critical windows. The proposed tiling will also incorporate additional insulation. The applicant has indicated additional energy saving measures that would be incorporated into the wider refurbishment programme such as an overhaul of the school's heating system and energy efficient lighting. The amount of additional floorspace is below 500sqm so there is no requirement for a BREEAM assessment.

5 Trees and biodiversity

- 5.1 The site is well treed with at least 75 trees across the whole site, the repositioning of the access road would require the removal of seven trees. The trees are relatively young and it is proposed to replace them with new trees to the north west of the repositioned road between the road and the rear of St Alban's Road. This would result in no overall loss in the number of trees on site and maintain the screening of the school building the trees currently provide in views from the properties on St Alban's Road. It was proposed to remove a mature specimen that is visible in

glimpsed views from St Alban's Road, but the application has been revised to retain this tree.

- 5.2 Council Tree officers consider the proposal to be acceptable and conditions will require details of the replacement trees to be agreed with the Council and ensure that retained trees are properly protected.
- 5.3 The applicant has submitted a Habitat Survey which considers the site as a whole to have a low ecological value as the habitats identified within the school site boundary are common and widespread. No nearby statutory or non-statutory designated sites would be affected by the proposals. Although bats have been recorded near the site, no bats have been recorded within the school site boundary, and the senior school was assessed to have a negligible bat roost potential. No trees with holes that could provide potential for bat roosting are proposed to be removed. There is a kestrel nest in the bell tower of the listed building, but the site does not have the potential to support any other legally protected species. As such the proposed works to the senior building are not considered to have any harmful ecological impact.

6 Transport

- 6.1 The proposal would not result in an increase in the number of pupils or staff. No additional car parking spaces are proposed and the site is large enough to accommodate construction vehicles without harming the local transport network.

7 Community Infrastructure Levy (CIL)

- 7.1 No contribution will be required as the site is a school under the Education Acts and is therefore exempt.

8 Recommendation: Grant Planning Permission

DISCLAIMER

Decision route to be decided by nominated members on Monday 14th October 2013. For further information please go to www.camden.gov.uk and search for 'members briefing'