# Condition and Feasibility Study

118 Malden Road London NW5 4BY



# william | carter "

Four Treas Surgery

27 Daleham Mews London NW3 5DB P 020 7813 3349 E daniel@william-carter.com

July 2024 Version 2

## Table of Contents

1

Introduction	2
Existing Building	4
Site Context	7
Planning History	9
Local Policy Background	11
Condition Report	16
Use	24
Development Appraisal	26
Analysis	47
Site Capacity & Design	56
Conclusion	66
Appendices	73

Þ

## 1.0 Introduction

- 1.1 This study is submitted in support of a full planning application made on behalf of Axis Malden Road Limited for the reconstruction of the existing part 3 storey, part 1 storey building to form a new part 4 storey, part 2 storey building consisting of 4 self-contained flats (3 x 2 bedroom and 1 x 1-bedroom), including the creation of new basement floor space at 118 Malden Road, London NW5 4BY.
- 1.2 The existing property at 118 Malden Road falls within the London Borough of Camden and consists of a three-storey plus basement building planned over basement, ground, first and second floor levels, dating from the middle of the 19th century. The upper floors of the property were previously used as a GP's surgery with the basement level providing residential accommodation. The property ceased to function as a GP's practice in 2016, when the surgery relocated nearby. Since that time, the property has remained vacant and in a state of disrepair. Recently, the upper floors of the property have been let as office space.
- 1.3 In accordance with section 9 of the London Borough of Camden's Energy efficiency and adaptation CPG (January 2021), this document provides a condition and feasibility study and options appraisal based on an assessment of the existing building condition and options for refurbishment, refurbishment and extension and partial or substantial demolition.
- 1.4 As part of this appraisal, a full structural survey has been undertaken to establish the construction and condition of the existing building together with an audit detailing each building element. This information has been used to establish the works required to upgrade retained elements to current standards for each development option.



1. Photograph showing the front elevation of 118 Malden Road, London NW5 4BY

3

## 2.0 Existing Building

- 2.1 118 Malden Road is located to the north of the junction between Malden Road and Queen's Crescent. The building is at the end of a short terrace of five buildings with the entrance to Queens Crescent Market at the southern end and 118 Malden Road at the northern end. The buildings in the terrace predominantly consist of commercial units at ground floor level with residential accommodation at first, second and third floor levels. With the exception of 118 Malden Road, the other buildings in the terrace have been extended at roof level to provide additional residential accommodation. 118 Malden Road is not located in a conservation area and is not listed.
- 2.2 The earliest information about 118 Malden Road is an 1856 lease of a property described as "*No. 5 Howell Terrace Malden Road*", for a term of 99 years starting retrospectively on 25 March 1847 from Thomas Palmer and George Howell (landlords) to John Moore (tenant). The 1856 plan describes "*No. 5 Howell Terrace*" as the "fifth house from *Queen's Road*" which is assumed to have been the former name of the present day Queen's Crescent. The 1856 plan matches the footprint of 118 Malden Road without the more recent ground floor rear extension. The dimensions shown on the 1856 plan for 5 Howell Terrace match those of 118 Malden Road. The 1856 lease makes reference to "*All that piece of ground with the messuage or tenement thereon situate*" which confirms its use as a dwelling house. The first registration of 118 Malden Road with the Land Registry is dated 10 July 1911.
- 2.3 It is understood that the family of the previous owner of the property first occupied the building in the early part of the 1930's. Records show that in 1945 the family occupied the top two floors and basement of the house while the ground floor was used by the family as a doctor's surgery. This arrangement continued, with the property being passed down through generations of the same family, until 2016.
- 2.4 The rear ground floor surgery extension was built in 1993 and at the same time a license was granted by the London Borough of Camden for the use of the side passage between 118 and 120 Malden Road for ramped access to the raised ground floor area of the surgery. The side



passageway was purchased by the current owner of the building from the London Borough of Camden in 2023.

2. Location plan with 118 Malden Road edged in red (Not to scale)

2.5 In around 2014, because of the unsuitability of the building for use as a modern surgery premises, the doctors at 118 Malden Road applied to NHS England for funding for the relocation to new premises. The application explained the unsuitability of 118 Malden Road as a surgery due to it being a converted residential building over 3 floors with no adequate disabled access, with two treatment and consulting rooms on upper floors and accessible only by narrow stairs, which did not meet the relevant NHS and Care Quality Commission standards.

- 2.6 In April 2016 the surgery relocated to a refurbished surgery premises less than 100 metres away at 76 Queen's Crescent, where it merged with the existing practice and became the "Four Trees at Queen's Crescent Surgery".
- 2.7 From 2016 2022, the building remained empty. In December 2022, following light refurbishment works, the first and second floors of the property were let as offices to a charity. This arrangement ended in November 2023.
- 2.8 The 1850 OS map of the area shows Malden Road and the junction with Queen's Road, to the Southwest. No buildings or structures are indicated at this time. Wesley Road and Queens Crescent are also not yet present. By 1873 number 118 appears in the centre of a row of terraced houses numbered 110 to 136 Malden Road. This arrangement remained for at least 97 years as the 1970 map shows the terrace still complete.
- 2.9 During the 1970s, numbers 120 136 Malden Road were demolished. The 1980 map then shows the construction of a block at 6 - 61 Gilden Crescent and The Community Centre. An approved planning application for a building identified as 120 Malden Road is dated 1998 and appears on the current OS map.
- 2.10 Summary of the Building's History:
  - 1856 1935: Building built and used as a house.
  - 1935 1993:Basement and upper floors in residential use.Ground floor used as a doctor's surgery.
  - 1993 2016: Basement in residential use. Upper floors used as a doctor's surgery.
  - 2016 2022: Entire building vacant.
  - 2022 2023: First and second floors used as offices. Ground and basement floors vacant.
  - November 2023 Entire building vacant.

6

## 3.0 Site Context

- 3.1 118 Malden Road forms the end of a terrace of five similar buildings with the entrance to Queens Crescent Market at the southern end and 118 Malden Road at the northern end. A further detached building of a similar size is located to the north of 118 Malden Road, adjacent to Gilden Crescent.
- 3.2 Whilst the buildings within the terrace are of a similar plan, the existing street scene to the front of the property is of poor quality. The buildings within the terrace are in a dilapidated state and have been altered, resulting in incongruous fenestration styles and detailing. The front elevation of 118 Malden Road has been substantially rebuilt in the past, resulting in differences in brickwork tone and a small step against the boundary with No.116.
- 3.3 The front elevations of the buildings at Nos.112 and 114 have also been substantially rebuilt and the property at No.120 is new. The properties at Nos.114 and 120 contain window detailing that does not match the other buildings in the terrace. The overall effect is poor.
- 3.4 The properties within the terrace consist of residential upper parts, with a mixture of residential and commercial ground floor units. This is reflected in a variety of elevational treatments. The properties at Nos. 112 and 120 Malden Road are residential in nature with casement windows at ground floor level, whilst Nos. 114 and 116 have roller shutters. The existing shop front at 118 Malden Road is in a poor state of repair and is out of keeping.
- 3.5 In terms of the types of usage found within the host terrace and surrounding area, as detailed above, 118 Malden Road was in use as a doctor's surgery and residence until 2016. No.120 Malden Road is solely in residential use. Nos.114 and 116 Malden Road have residential units on first, second and converted third floor levels, with a shared commercial unit on the ground floor. The commercial unit has remained vacant since 2014. The property at 112 Malden Road is solely in residential use. The property at 110 Malden Road has residential units on first, second and converted third floor levels and a commercial unit on the ground floor.

- 3.6 To the Northeast of the host terrace, the properties on Malden Road are largely residential in nature with the exception of the Wellesley Road Care Home, which fronts onto Malden Road, and a small terrace of properties between Nos. 162 and 166 which have residential accommodation on the upper levels and commercial units on the ground floor. The commercial units at Nos.162 and 164 are currently vacant.
- 3.7 To the Northwest of the host terrace, the properties on Malden Road are residential in nature with the exception of Nos. 139 – 173 which largely have residential accommodation on the upper levels and a mixture of residential and commercial units on the ground floor. Largely, the ground floor residential units within these properties are converted shops.
- 3.8 To the south of the host terrace, the properties on Malden Road are residential in nature, save for 106 Malden Road, which has residential units at first and second floor levels and a commercial unit on the ground floor.



3. Examples of converted shops to the Northwest of the application site

## 4.0 Planning History

#### 4.1 **04/06/1984 (Ref: 8400994)**

Planning Consent granted for installation of new shop front.

#### 4.2 **29/07/1992 (Ref: 9200748)**

Planning Consent granted for extending the rear part of the ground floor.

#### 4.3 **04/05/1999 (Ref: PE9700983)**

Planning Consent granted to St. Pancras Housing Association for the building of a new block of 3 one-bedroom flats on 3 floors at 120 Malden Road.

#### 4.4 **14/08/2012 (Ref: 2012/3607/P)**

Planning application submitted for extending the first floor at the rear incorporating a lift. Application – Withdrawn.

#### 4.5 **24/01/2013 (Ref: 2013/0350/P)**

Planning consent granted for mansard roof extension to nos. 114 to 116 Malden Road.

#### 4.6 **26/01/2017 (Ref: 2017/0357/P)**

Planning consent granted for the erection of a single storey first floor rear extension, mansard roof extension with terrace, the conversion of the Doctors Surgery (Class D1) into residential flats (Class C3), consisting of 1 x 2Bed maisonette at lower-ground and ground floor level,  $1 \times 1Bed$  first floor flat and  $1 \times 2Bed$  maisonette at second and third floor level and replacement of the existing shopfront.

#### 4.7 01/04/2022 (Ref: 2022/0127/P)

Planning Application submitted for the erection of a first floor rear extension and mansard roof extension with terrace, replacement of pavement grille with enlarged glass blocks over the front lightwell and replacement of the existing shopfront all in associated in a change of use from a doctors surgery (Class E) to three self-contained flats.

#### 4.8 16/11/2022 (Ref: 2022/5022/PRE)

Pre-planning Application submitted for the reconstruction of the existing building to form 4 self-contained flats (Class C3), involving the extension of the main building to the side, demolition of the existing single-storey rear extension and erection of a new rear extension at basement, ground and first floor levels, creation of a new mansard roof extension with terrace and replacement of the existing shopfront. The proposals were found to be broadly acceptable.

#### 4.9 **04/01/2024 Ref: 2023/5113/P)**

Planning application submitted for the reconstruction of existing building to form a new part four/part two storey building providing four self-contained residential units (Class C3), including the creation of new basement floor space.

## 5.0 Local Policy Background

- 5.1 The application site falls within the London Borough of Camden.
- 5.2 This study has been prepared in response to the requirements of the policies set out in the Camden Local Plan 2017 and its supplementary document: Camden Panning Guidance Energy efficiency and adaptation (January 2021) which at clause 9.4 requires a condition and feasibility study and options appraisal for all developments proposing substantial demolition.

### The Camden Local Plan 2017:

- 5.3 The Camden Local Plan 2017 sets out the Council's planning policies and replaces the Core Strategy and Development Policies planning documents (adopted in 2010). It ensures that Camden has robust policies in place that contribute to delivering the Camden Plan and other local priorities.
- 5.4 Through the Local Plan, Camden aims to deliver on creating the conditions for harnessing the benefits of economic growth, reducing inequality and securing sustainable neighbourhoods.
- 5.5 The Local Plan sets out a number of strategic objectives which have been developed in order to achieve the objectives of the Camden Plan.
- 5.6 These include Strategic Objective 7, which seeks to, "promote high quality, safe and sustainably designed buildings, places and streets and preserve and enhance the unique character" and Strategic Objective 9, which seeks to, "make sure that development in Camden minimises its energy use by encouraging local efficient energy generation, achieving the highest possible environmental standards, and is designed to adapt to, and reduce the effects of, climate change".
- 5.7 Policy CC1 (Climate change mitigation) of the Local Plan requires all developments to minimise the effects of climate change and encourage all developments to meet the highest feasible environmental standards

that are financially viable during construction and occupation. To this end, the London Borough of Camden will:

- Promote zero carbon development and require all development to reduce carbon dioxide emissions through following the steps in the energy hierarchy;
- Require all major development to demonstrate how London Plan targets for carbon dioxide emissions have been met;
- Ensure that the location of development and mix of land uses minimise the need to travel by car and help to support decentralised energy networks;
- Support and encourage sensitive energy efficiency improvements to existing buildings;
- Require all proposals that involve substantial demolition to demonstrate that it is not possible to retain and improve the existing building; and
- Expect all developments to optimise resource efficiency.
- 5.8 The Local Plan states at paragraph 8.16, "The construction process and new materials employed in developing buildings are major consumers of resources and can produce large quantities of waste and carbon emissions. The possibility of sensitively altering or retrofitting buildings should always be strongly considered before demolition is proposed. Many historic buildings display qualities that are environmentally sustainable and have directly contributed to their survival, for example the use of durable, natural, locally sourced materials, 'soft' construction methods, good room proportions, natural light and ventilation and ease of alteration".
- 5.9 The Local Plan states at paragraph 8.17, "All proposals for substantial demolition and reconstruction should be fully justified in terms of the optimisation of resources and energy use, in comparison with the existing building. Where the demolition of a building cannot be avoided, we will expect developments to divert 85% of waste from landfill and comply with the Institute for Civil Engineer's Demolition Protocol and

either reuse materials on-site or salvage appropriate materials to enable their reuse off-site. We will also require developments to consider the specification of materials and construction processes with low embodied carbon content".

- 5.10 The Local Plan states at paragraph 8.18, "We will expect all developments, whether for refurbishment or redevelopment, to optimise resource efficiency by:
  - *Reducing waste;*
  - *Reducing energy and water use during construction;*
  - Minimising materials required;
  - Using materials with low embodied carbon content; and
  - Enabling low energy and water demands once the building is in use"

#### Energy Efficiency and Adaptation CPG (January 2021):

- 5.11 Camden's Energy efficiency and adaptation CPG supports the policies in the Camden Local Plan 2017. It is a Supplementary Planning Document (SPD) which is a "*material consideration*" in planning decisions.
- 5.12 The January 2021 version of the CPG replaces the Energy Efficiency and Adaptation CPG (March 2019), which itself replaced the CPG3 Sustainability (July 2015).
- 5.13 The document provides information on key energy and resource issues within the borough and supports Local Plan Policies CC1 Climate change mitigation and CC2 Adapting to climate change.
- 5.14 In response to the requirements of the Energy efficiency and adaptation CPG (January 2021), an energy and sustainability statement has been prepared and submitted as part of the planning application.
- 5.15 The requirements of Section 9 of the Energy efficiency and adaptation CPG (January 2021), which relates to reuse and optimising resource efficiency, are addressed within this feasibility study.

- 5.16 Section 9 of Camden's Energy efficiency and adaptation CPG (January 2021) confirms that the Council will, "expect creative and innovative solutions to repurposing existing buildings, and avoiding demolition where feasible". The CPG requires "all developments to seek to optimise resource efficiency and use circular economy principles".
- 5.17 Paragraph 9.2 of the CPG confirms that, "Local Plan policy CC1 states we will e) require all proposals that involve substantial demolition to demonstrate that it is not possible to retain and improve the existing building; and f) expect all developments to optimise resource efficiency".
- 5.18 Paragraph 9.4 of the CPG states that, "In assessing the opportunities for retention and refurbishment developers should assess the condition of the existing building and explore future potential of the site. The New London Plan highlights the importance of retaining the value of existing buildings with the least preferable development option of recycling through demolition, although Policy D3 of the New London Plan states the 'best use of the land needs to be taken into consideration when deciding whether to retain existing buildings in a development".
- 5.19 To understand the reuse potential of existing buildings, the CPG states that condition and feasibility studies should assess:
  - Existing building uses
  - Servicing
  - Technical: review, with evidence and photos of existing building, based on intrusive survey
  - Site capacity
- 5.20 At paragraphs 9.5 and 9.6, the CPG provides a hierarchy based on the condition of an existing building and feasibility of re-use as follows:
  - Refit Retain existing structure as is, including minor works to continue occupation of the building.
  - Refurbish Refurbishment of existing building, seeking to significantly improve the building's service life and retrofitting to

reduce carbon emissions and to include sustainable adaption measures.

- Substantial refurbishment and extension Alterations to the existing structure to meet future needs and to optimise site capacity, retaining as much of the existing building as possible to reduce the need to use new materials and loss of embodied carbon in the existing structure.
- Reclaim and recycle Where it has been demonstrated that the above options are not feasible, the development proposal should include a pre-demolition audit identifying all materials within the building and documenting how they will be managed with a preference for re-use on site, then re-use off site, remanufacture or recycling.
- 5.21 The Energy efficiency and adaptation CPG confirms that at option 4, a Whole Life Carbon assessment (including embodied carbon) should be submitted.
- 5.22 Paragraph 9.7 of the Energy efficiency and adaptation CPG confirms that this approach is justified through the Local Plan policy CC1 which requires all proposals that involve substantial demolition to demonstrate that it is not possible to retain and improve the existing building.

## 6.0 Condition Report

- 6.1 In accordance with the requirements of Paragraph 9.4 of the London Borough of Camden's Energy efficiency and adaptation CPG (January 2021) and to assess the future potential of the site, a full structural survey has been undertaken to establish the construction and condition of the existing building. An audit detailing each building element has also been produced.
- 6.2 The information collected has been used to establish the works required to upgrade the existing structure to current standards for each development option. The findings of this process are discussed later in this study.
- 6.3 Copies of the full survey report and audit are provided at Appendix A and B. A summary of findings is provided below.

#### **Existing Building – Construction**

6.4 The building at 118 Malden Road is of typical construction consisting of external masonry walls and internal walls of masonry and stud partition. These in turn support timber floors and a butterfly pitched timber roof structure.

#### Basement

- 6.5 A ground investigation survey has been carried out and has shown that the existing building is located over made ground to a depth of 0.36m, below which there is very stiff mid brown fissured silty clay.
- 6.6 The existing basement of the property is formed of solid masonry perimeter retaining walls on stepped foundations down to a depth of 0.44m. The internal walls at basement level are solid masonry, ranging in thickness from approximately 108mm to 228mm.
- 6.7 The front elevation at basement level consists of 228mm solid brickwork. The walls to the rear of the property at basement level form

the front and side of a rear courtyard area that was originally open but has been covered by the more recent rear extension. These walls are constructed in 228mm solid brickwork.

- 6.8 The basement floor consists of a concrete slab with a thickness of between 150mm 200mm. A bituminous membrane is located beneath the slab. The ground investigation survey has determined that the basement floor is not insulated.
- 6.9 The vaults to the front of the property, which extend beneath the public footpath, have been constructed with solid masonry retaining walls and an internal 108mm thick solid masonry dividing wall. The lightwell located between the vaults and main building is fitted with a metal grill at pavement level.

#### **Ground Floor**

- 6.10 The ground floor of the property has been extended in the past. The original part of the building is constructed with solid brick external walls to the rear and side and a glazed aluminium framed shopfront to the front. Sections of the rear wall of the building have been removed to form openings into the rear extension. The brickwork within the side and rear external walls at this level is 348mm thick.
- 6.11 The central spine wall has been removed at ground floor level with steelwork installed to support structure above. A timber bressummer beam is located above the shopfront within the front elevation to support the brickwork at first and second floor levels. This beam spans the full width of the building.
- 6.12 The internal walls within the original part of the ground floor are studwork partitions fitted with plasterboard. The ceiling coverings are also plasterboard.
- 6.13 The floor structure within the original part of the ground floor consists of timber joists of varying sizes, ranging from 100mm x 70mm to 200mm x 50mm. The floor joists run from front to back. The floor deck consists of timber floorboards.

- 6.14 The rear extension at ground floor level has been constructed with cavity masonry walls, comprised of dense blockwork inner and outer leaves. Record drawings indicate that these walls have a 50mm uninsulated cavity. The extension has been constructed on strip foundations with a depth of 1000mm along the boundary of 116 Malden Road, stepping down to 2000mmm along the boundary with 120 Malden Road.
- 6.15 The floor of the rear extension is formed of a 300mm thick reinforced concrete slab. The ground investigation survey has determined that this slab is not insulated.
- 6.16 The roof of the extension consists of 200mm x 50mm timber joists with a plywood deck and asphalt roof covering. The roof is not insulated.
- 6.17 The internal walls of the rear extension are 100mm thick dense blockwork, rendered and plastered. The ceiling coverings are plasterboard.
- 6.18 All windows and doors at ground floor level, save for the aluminium doors within the shopfront, are timber framed.

#### First Floor

- 6.19 The external walls at first floor level are 348mm thick solid brickwork.
- 6.20 The main internal loadbearing walls are formed of timber stud with plaster and lath coverings. New partitions consisting of timber studwork and plasterboard have been added to form lobbies at the entrances to the rooms. The ceiling coverings are plaster and lath.
- 6.21 The floor structure at first floor level consists of 190mm x 50mm timber joists running from front to back. The floor deck consists of timber floorboards.
- 6.22 All windows and doors at first floor level are timber framed. The staircase is also of timber construction.

#### Second Floor

- 6.23 The external walls at second floor level are 348mm thick solid brickwork. The thickness of the rear wall of the building reduces to 228mm in the location of the second floor mezzanine level.
- 6.24 The main internal loadbearing walls are formed of timber stud with plaster and lath coverings. New partitions consisting of timber studwork and plasterboard have been added to form lobbies at the entrances to the rooms. The ceiling coverings are plaster and lath.
- 6.25 The floor structure at second floor level consists of 190mm x 50mm timber joists running from front to back. The floor deck consists of timber floorboards.
- 6.26 All windows and doors at second floor level are timber framed. The staircase is also of timber construction.

#### Main Roof

6.27 The main roof is formed of 75mm x 50mm timber joists, rafters and struts. The roof is finished with a membrane and tiled roof covering.

#### Existing Building – Condition

- 6.28 The basement structure has been observed to be in a generally dilapidated condition with localised areas showing signs of structural distress. There are a series of diagonal cracks in the flank wall and chimneybreast masonry and minor cracks in the walls more generally.
- 6.29 The basement is showing signs of dampness, with significant localised mortar decay within the walls of the vaults. The entire front lightwell of the vaults is heavily supported with a series of timber props and was found to be unsafe to access during inspection. Significant cracking was found to the front wall section and above its window. Significant signs of distress and movement in the front wall were also found, possibly due to the deterioration and instability of the front lightwell and vault. The front wall at basement level is significantly leaning inwards.

- 6.30 The ground floor structure has been observed to be in a fairly poor condition. The timber floor sections were found to be uneven and bouncy, with a creaking sound in most areas when walked on. The floor has been found to be structurally distorted and unstable in some areas.
- 6.31 There are a series of vertical and diagonal crack lines to the front wall, flank wall and ceiling of the main building. Between the main building and rear extension there are signs of structural distress with significant cracking observed. The cracks in the main building area were observed to be hairline – 6mm in width. The cracks to the rear were observed to be 10 – 15mm wide in some areas.
- 6.32 Signs of dampness were noted in some sections of the ceilings. In the covered courtyard area there are horizontal props bracing the flank and internal masonry wall and vertical props supporting the ceiling.
- 6.33 The first floor structure has been observed to be in fairly good condition. However, the timber floors have been found to be uneven and bouncy in some areas with noticeable gaps between the floor and masonry walls. The floors are showing signs of distortion and are structurally unstable in some areas.
- 6.34 A series of diagonal cracks were observed on the flank wall, ranging from hairline – 3mm in width. Cracking was also noted in various locations on the walls and ceilings with sections of the existing ceiling coverings falling off. The cracking in these areas was again observed to be from hairline – 3mm in width.
- 6.35 Various locations on the existing masonry and stud walls and ceilings were found to be damp. The existing window frames at the front and back were found to be showing signs of deterioration, possibly due to dampness. The timber staircase was observed to be unstable.
- 6.36 A gap between the masonry party wall and parapet wall to the rear extension roof was observed.
- 6.37 The second floor structure has been observed to be in fairly poor condition. The timber floors were found to be uneven and bouncy in some areas with noticeable gaps between the floor and masonry walls.

The floors are showing signs of distortion and are structurally unstable in most areas.

- 6.38 Cracking was observed between the front masonry wall and partly wall, between the front masonry wall and flank wall and between the spine wall and flank wall. Diagonal and vertical cracking was also observed on the flank wall and internal walls and ceilings.
- 6.39 The existing window frames at the front and back were found to be showing signs of deterioration, possibly due to dampness. The timber staircase was observed to be very unstable.
- 6.40 The landing room / second floor mezzanine level has been observed to be in a very poor condition. In general, the suspended timber floor was found to be showing signs of distortion and to be structurally unstable with gaps observed between the floor and masonry walls.
- 6.41 The ceiling in this area was observed to be partially damaged and structurally unstable. A series of cracks were noted on the walls, floor and ceiling, together with signs of dampness to the walls and ceiling.
- 6.42 The staircase to this area was observed to be structurally unstable with gaps between the top step and room and between the staircase and side wall.
- 6.43 The front elevation has been observed to be in a fairly poor condition with some discolouration and stepping of the brickwork at first floor level. A significant joint crack was noted along the length of the brick wall against the line of the party wall.
- 6.44 Crack lines were also noted at the corner of the front and flank elevations at the junction of the rendered and exposed brickwork sections. These cracks follow the pattern of the render and exposed brick wall from above ground floor level to second floor level.
- 6.45 A further gap / crack was also observed between the front corner render and flank wall section from ground floor to first floor levels. It was noted that the remaining existing brick wall pier is bowing, potentially due to excessive load reaction of the existing timber bressummer beam.

- 6.46 The existing bressummer beam has been observed to be deteriorating with signs of decay and the cracking noted may be due to structural overload from the existing masonry wall and structure above.
- 6.47 The section of existing brick wall forming the parapet to the front is showing signs of dampness and contains a series of diagonal cracks in places. Observed from street level, it has been noted that the parapet appears to be leaning forwards and that the majority of mortar within the brickwork has worn off.
- 6.48 The pavement floor in front of the building in the location of the lightwell, which is currently temporarily propped from beneath, is showing signs of depression.
- 6.49 The rear elevation has been observed to be in poor condition with signs of distress to the brickwork. The top parapet appears to be bulging inwards and cracks and gaps around the windows and in the brickwork of the second floor have been noted. Cracks were observed above the windows heading towards the roof parapet. It has been noted that the wall around the small window on the second floor appears recent and poorly constructed and that the top wall section mortar beds appear to be wearing out.
- 6.50 It has been noted that the brick lintels over the windows at first and second floor level appear to have been recently repaired, but that cracks are appearing again and the first floor window lintel is showing signs of failure.
- 6.51 Significant distortion and unevenness has been noted in the majority of the rear elevation.
- 6.52 The side elevation has been observed to be in a moderate condition, with no significant signs of distress. However, significant cracks have been noted within the wall internally at basement and ground floor levels. Cracking has also been noted externally between the front corner render and flank wall section from ground to first floor level.

#### **Other Material Factors**

- 6.53 The existing main building and rear extension, which was constructed in 1993, have both been affected by subsidence. An Insurance claim relating to the subsidence of the main building was successfully made in 1990. A further claim relating to the subsidence of the rear extension was successfully made in 2012 (Further details are provided at Appendix F).
- 6.54 In both cases, the presence of Plane trees adjacent to the site was determined to be the cause of the movement. As detailed in the structural report, significant cracking was noted within the structure during the inspection of the building, with evidence of movement associated with subsidence observed.
- 6.55 As a result of this damage and to safeguard against future movement, the existing rear extension will need to be demolished and rebuilt (Structural Report paragraphs 5.5 & 7.2).
- 6.56 To safeguard against future movement in the main building, any retained structure will need to be underpinned to a sufficient depth (Structural Report paragraphs 5.2, 7.2 & 7.13).
- 6.57 Other rebuilding works are required to affected areas regardless of the development option selected (Structural Report sections 5 & 7).
- 6.58 As a result of the previous insurance claims that were made and history of subsidence, it is no longer possible to insure the property against subsidence on standard terms. This issue is not limited to the existing building in its current format and will affect converted flats at the property. The advice received is that this issue will not be resolved by undertaking remedial or upgrading works to the existing building structure (See CCI Brokerage letter at Appendix C).

## 7.0 Use

- 7.1 Records show that the property at 118 Malden Road was originally constructed as a dwellinghouse and used as such until 1935.
- 7.2 Between 1935 1993, the basement, first and second floors of the property were used as residential accommodation, whilst the ground floor was used as a doctor's surgery.
- 7.3 From 1993 2016, only the basement was in residential usage with the ground, first and second floors used as a doctor's surgery.
- 7.4 Following the closure of the doctor's surgery in 2016, the building remained fully vacant until December 2022, when the first and second floors were briefly let as office space until November 2023.
- 7.5 Since November 2023, the building has remained vacant.
- 7.6 118 Malden Road is located in an area with predominantly residential usage. The buildings on Malden Road are principally residential, with any commercial usage confined to ground floor retail premises. A number of these premises have been converted to flats or are vacant. The doctor's surgery previously located at 118 Malden Road has moved to newly refurbished premises within the vicinity of the site at 76 Queens Crescent.
- 7.7 Planning permission was obtained in 2017 (Ref: 2017/0357/P) for the conversion of the entire building at 118 Malden Road to three self-contained flats (Class C3). The planning consent was not implemented and a further application for the same scheme was submitted in 2022 (Ref: 2022/0127/P). Although not formally decided, the London Borough of Camden has recently confirmed that this application has been recommended for approval.
- 7.8 In 2022, a pre-application was submitted for a revised scheme (Ref: 2022/5022/PRE) involving the conversion of the property to four self-contained flats (Class C3). The proposals were found to be broadly acceptable.

- 7.9 An appraisal of possible uses for the property was provided by Day Morris Estate Agents and submitted as part of planning application ref: 2017/0357/P. In granting planning permission, the London Borough of Camden accepted that considering the building's history, poor structural and physical condition and local market conditions, conversion to residential usage was the only viable option for bringing the property back into long term usage (See Appendix E).
- 7.10 Within this context, options for the development of the site to residential usage are explored further in the next section of this study, taking into account the condition of the existing building and the policy requirements of the London Plan (2021) and Camden Local Plan Policy CC1.

## 8.0 Development Appraisal

- 8.1 To date, three development proposals for the creation of residential units at the site have been produced as follows:
  - Planning Applications Ref: 2017/0357/P and 2022/0127/P

"Erection of a single storey first floor rear extension, mansard roof extension with terrace, the conversion of the Doctors Surgery (Class D1) into residential flats (Class C3), consisting of 1 x 2Bed maisonette at lower-ground and ground floor level, 1 x 1Bed first floor flat and 1 x 2Bed maisonette at second and third floor level and replacement of the existing shopfront".

#### • Pre-Application Ref: 2022/5022/PRE

"Reconstruction of the existing building to form 4 self-contained flats (Class C3), involving the extension of the main building to the side, demolition of the existing two-storey rear extension and erection of a new three-storey rear extension at basement, ground and first floor levels, creation of a new mansard roof extension with terrace and replacement of the existing shopfront".

#### • Planning Application Ref: 2023/5113/P

"Reconstruction of existing building to form a new part four/part two-storey building providing four self-contained residential units (Class C3), including the creation of new basement floor space".

- 8.2 In each instance, it is unclear from the description of development how much of the existing building structure would need to be demolished to implement each of the respective schemes.
- 8.3 To establish the scope of works required for each development option, a review of the documents submitted as part of the planning applications for these schemes has been undertaken and is detailed below.

8.4 Given that planning application ref: 2022/0127/P has been recommended for approval within the framework of current policy, it can be considered a starting point for appraising development options. In addition to analysing the works required to implement each of the schemes listed above, an assessment has also been carried out into alternative options for residential development at the site, to establish whether more of the existing building fabric could be retained, whilst taking into account the requirements of London Plan Policy D3.

#### Planning Applications Ref: 2017/0357/P & 2022/0127/P:

- 8.5 Planning Applications Ref: 2017/0357/P and 2022/0127/P contain similar proposals, involving the creation of three residential units at the site in the follow arrangement: 2-bedroom maisonette on basement and ground floor levels, 1-bedroom flat at first floor level and a 2-bedroom maisonette on second and new third floor levels. Planning application ref: 2017/0357/P was granted planning approval but has now lapsed. Planning application ref: 2022/0127/P has been recommended for approval.
- 8.6 The schemes involve the creation of additional floorspace in the form of a new first floor rear extension within the footprint of the existing rear extension and the creation of a new third floor level on the main building in the form of a mansard roof extension. Demolition plans for the schemes were not submitted as part of the respective planning applications.
- 8.7 As part of this assessment, an overlay of existing and proposed plans has been created. From these overlays, a set of demolition plans has been prepared showing the minimum extent of demolition work required based on the proposed alterations to the layout of the building and other factors detailed below (Overlay and demolition plans are included at Appendix D).
- 8.8 The works can be summarised as follows:

	Applications Ref: 2017/0357/P & 2022/0127/P
	Basement:
A1	Partial removal of load bearing masonry walls and new openings formed to the front of the property in the location of the vaults.
A2	Partial removal of the load bearing masonry wall in the location of the front elevation, the removal of existing window openings and the creation of new window and door openings.
A3	Alterations to the load bearing masonry wall in the location of the rear elevation.
A4	Removal and relocation of the existing load bearing masonry wall between the rear courtyard and bathroom.
A5	The installation of new masonry walls to form a new lightwell.
A6	Removal of the existing concrete floor slab, excavation to required depth and installation of a new floor slab.
A7	Underpinning of all retained walls at basement level.
A8	Removal of the existing chimneybreasts.
A9	Removal of all existing internal walls including the central spine wall and walls forming the existing stairwell and hallway.
A10	Removal of existing staircase on the southern side of the property and installation of a new staircase on the northern side of the property.
A11	Removal of all existing windows and doors.
A12	Installation of new structure as required, including a steel frame at all levels within the main building.
A13	Installation of new internal walls as required.
A14	Installation of new glazing as required.
A15	Removal of all existing fixtures and the installation of new fixtures, services and finishes as required, including new underground drainage.
A16	Upgrading works to retained elements as required to meet regulatory standards.

¥

	Ground Floor:
A17	Removal and replacement of the existing floor structure, including the existing concrete floor slab in the location of the rear extension and above the basement courtyard.
A18	Removal of all existing internal walls including the central spine wall and walls forming the existing stairwell and hallway.
A19	Removal of the existing shopfront and bressummer beam within the front elevation and installation of new masonry walls together with new window and door openings.
A20	Partial removal of the load bearing masonry wall in the location of the rear elevation.
A21	Removal of all structure forming the existing rear extension.
A22	Removal of existing chimneybreasts.
A23	Removal of existing staircase on the southern side of the property and installation of a new staircase on the northern side of the property.
A24	Removal of all existing windows and doors.
A25	Construction of new rear extension and installation of new structure as required, including a steel frame at all levels within the main building.
A26	Installation of new internal walls as required.
A27	Installation of new glazing as required.
A28	Removal of all existing fixtures and the installation of new fixtures, services and finishes as required.
A29	Upgrading works to retained elements as required to meet regulatory standards.
	First Floor:
A30	Removal and replacement of the existing floor structure.
A31	Removal of the existing masonry wall forming the rear elevation.
A32	Removal of all structure forming the existing rear extension.

¥

A33	Removal of all existing internal walls including the central spine wall and walls forming the existing stairwell and hallway.
A34	Removal of existing staircase on the southern side of the property and installation of a new staircase on the northern side of the property and to the rear to provide access to new roof terrace.
A35	Removal of existing chimneybreasts.
A36	Removal of all existing windows and doors.
A37	Construction of new rear extension and installation of new structure as required, including a steel frame at all levels within the main building.
A38	Installation of new internal walls as required.
A39	Installation of new glazing as required.
A40	Removal of all existing fixtures and the installation of new fixtures, services and finishes as required.
A41	Upgrading works to retained elements as required to meet regulatory standards.
	Second Floor:
A42	Removal and replacement of the existing floor structure.
A43	Removal of the existing masonry wall forming the rear elevation.
A44	Removal of all existing internal walls including the central spine wall and walls forming the existing stairwell and hallway.
A45	Removal of existing chimneybreasts.
A46	Removal of existing staircase on the southern side of the property and installation of a new staircase on the northern side of the property.
A47	Removal of existing mezzanine structure.
A48	Removal of all existing windows and doors.
A49	Installation of flat roof structure above new rear extension.
A50	Installation of new structure as required, including a steel frame at all levels within the main building.
A51	Installation of new internal walls as required.
A52	Installation of new glazing as required.

A53	Removal of all existing fixtures and the installation of new fixtures, services
	and finishes as required.
A54	Upgrading works to retained elements as required to meet regulatory standards.
	Third Floor:
A55	Removal of the existing main roof structure.
A56	Removal of existing second floor mezzanine level.
A57	Construction of new third floor structure and roof.
A58	Installation of new structure as required, including a steel frame at all levels within the main building.
A59	Removal of all existing fixtures and the installation of new fixtures, services and finishes as required.
A60	Upgrading works to retained elements as required to meet regulatory standards.

- 8.9 In assessing the extent of the works required to implement planning application refs: 2017/0357/P and 2022/0127/P, the following points need to be considered:
- 8.10 Vaults / Front Lightwell: The front lightwell and vaults are in an extremely poor condition and were found to be unsafe to access during inspection. Significant cracking was found to the wall sections with signs of distress and movement in the front wall which was assessed to be significantly leaning inwards (Structural Report paragraphs 4.1, 5.3, 7.5 & 7.13). The structural report concludes that this area needs immediate attention and will require rebuilding regardless of the development option selected (Structural Report paragraphs 5.3 & 7.13).
- 8.11 **Rear Extension**: The existing rear extension is in a very poor structural condition and shows signs of historic movement. Cracks were observed in the walls of the extension with a width of 10 15mm. As detailed in the structural report, the extension is beyond repair and needs to be demolished and rebuilt with foundations of a sufficient depth to

safeguard against future movement. (See Structural Report paragraphs 4.2, 5.5, 7.1 & 7.2).

8.12 **Rear Elevation**: The proposed changes to the layout of the basement and ground floors require alterations to the existing masonry wall in the location of the rear elevation at those levels. The creation of a new first floor rear extension will result in the associated removal of the rear elevation at that level. The extensive alterations to the fenestration detail at second floor level mean that the existing rear elevation will also need to be rebuilt at that level. The net result of these works is that the existing rear elevation will need to be substantially removed and/or rebuilt at all levels under planning applications ref: 2017/0357/P and 2022/0127/P.

Notwithstanding this, the rear elevation has been observed to be in a poor condition with signs of distress to the brickwork. The top parapet wall is bulging inwards and there are a number of cracks around and above window openings and in the brickwork. There is significant distortion and unevenness to the majority of the elevation. The structural report concludes that the rear elevation will need to be partially rebuilt regardless of the development option selected (Structural Report paragraphs 4.7, 5.18 & 7.14).

- 8.13 **Front Elevation**: The works required to the front elevation at basement and ground floor levels, together with the removal and replacement of the existing timber bressummer beam at first floor level, will require the installation of steel beams to temporarily prop the brickwork above (Structural Report paragraphs 5.17 & 7.5). Given the position of the windows directly above the bressummer beam, steel supports will need to be installed at first floor level down to basement level and all windows fully braced during the works. As detailed in the structural report, the brickwork within the front elevation is of poor quality and contains areas that are structurally distorted and cracked. Retained brickwork would need to be repaired and rebuilt as required to remediate these defects and upgraded to meet current standards for thermal performance.
- 8.14 **Floors**: The plans show alterations to the floor levels at basement, first and new third floor levels, requiring the replacement of the existing floor structure. Notwithstanding this, given the extent of proposed alterations to load bearing walls, the removal and relocation of the

existing stairwell and the standards set out in Approved Document A of the Building Regulations, which requires the installation of a steel frame at all levels of the building to safeguard against disproportionate collapse, all floors at the property will need to be replaced. This in turn will necessitate the removal of all internal walls (Structural Report paragraphs 7.7 & 7.8). Notwithstanding the proposed works, the existing timber floors are showing signs of distortion and structural instability and will require strengthening and, in most areas, replacement with

newly designed floor joists (Structural Report paragraphs 5.4, 5.6, 5.12).

- 8.15 **Basement Slab**: The proposals show the lowering of the basement floor. These works will require the removal of the existing basement slab, excavation works to required depth and the installation of a new concrete floor slab. In addition, new foundations will need to be installed beneath the existing basement walls at a sufficient depth to accommodate the lowered basement level and to safeguard the building against future movement (Structural Report paragraphs 5.2, 7.2 & 7.13). Notwithstanding these works, the existing basement slab is not adequately waterproofed or insulated and so would need to be upgraded in any event.
- 8.16 **Roof**: New roof levels are proposed on the rear extension and main building. The existing roof structures will need to be entirely replaced.
- 8.17 **Services**: All existing wiring and plumbing installations at the property are non-compliant and beyond serviceable use. These will need to be fully replaced with new installations.
- 8.18 **Fittings**: All internal fitments at the property, such as internal doors, skirting boards, architraves, bathroom fittings etc, are unsuitable for use in the new development. These will need to be removed and replaced.
- 8.19 As set out in the above information and plans, the elements of structure that could realistically be retained under planning proposals ref: 2017/0357/P and 2022/0127/P are the following:
  - Side elevation
  - Part of the front elevation

- Retaining walls at basement level
- Part of the wall below the rear elevations at basement level
- Part of the walls forming the vaults at basement level
- 8.20 Works to temporarily support retained sections of the front elevation will be complicated for the reasons outlined at paragraph 5.5. of the structural report and will result in damage to the façade. This element, if retained, will need to be partially rebuilt / repaired and upgraded to meet current standards for thermal performance.
- 8.21 Any walls retained at basement level will need to be underpinned to enable the proposed lowering of the basement floor level and to safeguard the building against future movement (Structural Report paragraphs 5.2, 7.2 & 7.13).

#### Pre-Application Ref: 2022/5022/PRE:

- 8.22 Pre-Applications Ref: 2022/5022/PRE involves the creation of four residential units at the site in the following arrangement: 2-bedroom flat at basement level, 2-bedroom flat at ground floor level, 2-bedroom flat at first floor level and a 2-bedroom maisonette on second and new third floor levels.
- 8.23 The scheme involves the lateral extension of the main building footprint, over the existing side passageway, the extension of the existing basement area to the side and rear, the creation of a new rear extension at basement, ground and first floor levels and the creation of a new third floor level within the main building in the form of a mansard roof extension. Demolition plans for the scheme were not submitted as part of the pre-application.
- 8.24 As part of this assessment, an overlay of existing and proposed plans has been created. From these overlays, a set of demolition plans has been prepared showing the minimum extent of demolition work required to implement the scheme based on the proposed alterations to the layout of the building and other factors detailed below (Overlay and demolition plans are included at Appendix D).
- 8.25 The works can be summarised as follows:

	Pre-Application Ref: 2022/5022/PRE
	Basement:
B1	Partial removal of load bearing masonry walls and new openings formed to the front of the property in the location of the vaults.
B2	Partial removal of the load bearing masonry wall in the location of the front elevation, the removal of existing window openings and the creation of new window and door openings.
B3	Removal of load bearing masonry wall in the location of the rear elevation.
B4	Removal of load bearing masonry walls in the location of the existing rear courtyard and bathroom.
B5	Removal of existing retaining walls to the rear and side of the property.
B6	All works associated with the construction of additional basement space to the rear and side, including excavations and the installation of new concrete retaining walls
В7	Construction of new extension with lightwell to the rear.
B8	Removal of all existing internal walls.
B9	Replacement of the basement slab.
B10	Underpinning of all retained walls at basement level.
B11	Removal of the existing staircase and the installation of a new staircase to the front of the building.
B12	Removal of all existing windows and doors.
B13	Installation of new structure as required, including a steel frame at all levels within the main building.
B14	Installation of new internal walls as required.
B15	Installation of new glazing as required.
B16	Removal of all existing fixtures and the installation of new fixtures, services and finishes as required, including new underground drainage.
B17	Upgrading works to retained elements as required to meet regulatory standards.

¥
	Ground Floor:
B18	Removal and reconstruction of all structure forming the existing main building and rear extension.
	First Floor:
B19	Removal and reconstruction of all structure forming the existing main building and rear extension.
	Second Floor:
B20	Removal and reconstruction of all structure forming the existing main building and rear extension.
	Third Floor:
B21	Removal and reconstruction of all structure forming the existing main building and rear extension.

- 8.26 In assessing the extent of the works required to implement preapplication ref: 2022/5022/PRE, the following points need to be considered:
- 8.27 Vaults / Front Lightwell: The front lightwell and vaults are in an extremely poor condition and were found to be unsafe to access during inspection. Significant cracking was found to the wall sections with signs of distress and movement in the front wall which was assessed to be significantly leaning inwards (Structural Report paragraphs 4.1, 5.3, 7.5 & 7.13). The structural report concludes that this area needs immediate

attention and will require rebuilding regardless of the development option selected (Structural Report paragraphs 5.3 & 7.13).

- 8.28 **Side Elevation**: The proposed lateral extension of the building footprint over the existing side passageway will require the complete removal of the existing side elevation of the building.
- 8.29 **Rear Elevation**: The extension of the basement to the rear together with the proposed changes to the layout of the basement and ground floors requires the removal of the existing masonry wall in the location of the rear elevation at those levels. The creation of a new first floor structure at the rear of the property will result in the associated removal of the rear elevation at that level. The extensive alterations to the fenestration detail at second floor level mean that the existing rear elevation will also need to be rebuilt at that level. The net result of these works is that the existing rear elevation will need to be substantially removed and/or rebuilt at all levels to facilitate the proposals contained within pre-application ref: 2022/5022/PRE.

Notwithstanding this, the rear elevation has been observed to be in a poor condition with signs of distress to the brickwork. The top parapet wall is bulging inwards and there are a number of cracks around and above window openings and in the brickwork. There is significant distortion and unevenness to the majority of the elevation. The structural report concludes that the rear elevation will need to be partially rebuilt regardless of the development option selected (Structural Report paragraphs 4.7, 5.18 & 7.14).

- 8.30 **Front Elevation**: The removal of the existing shop front and timber bressummer beam, extension of the building to the side and extensive alterations proposed to the fenestration detail at first and second floor levels means that the existing front elevation will need to be rebuilt.
- 8.31 **Rear Extension**: The proposed alterations to the size and form of the existing rear extension require its removal and reconstruction. Notwithstanding this, the existing rear extension is in a very poor structural condition and shows signs of historic movement. Cracks were observed in the walls of the extension with a width of 10 15mm. As detailed in the structural report, the extension is beyond repair and needs to be demolished and rebuilt with foundations of a sufficient

depth to safeguard against future movement. (See Structural Report paragraphs 4.2, 5.5, 7.1 & 7.2).

- 8.32 **Floors**: Given the proposed alterations to the floor levels, the extent of the works required to the internal and external walls and requirement for a steel frame to be installed at all levels in accordance with Approved Document A of the Building Regulations, none of the existing floors can be retained.
- 8.33 **Basement Retaining Walls and Slab**: The plans show that a small amount of structure could be retained at basement level. However, to accommodate the extension of the basement to the side and rear and to achieve compliance with current standards, the entire basement slab would need to be replaced. Any walls retained at basement level would need to be underpinned to a sufficient depth to safeguard the building against future movement and upgraded as required to meet current standards (Structural Report paragraphs 5.2, 7.2 & 7.13).
- 8.34 The net result of the above is that the proposals detailed within preapplication: 2022/5022/PRE require the full demolition and reconstruction of the existing building above ground level as indicated in the demolition plans.

### Planning Application Ref: 2023/5113/P

- 8.35 Planning Application Ref: 2023/5113/P involves the creation of four residential units at the site in the following arrangement: 1 -bedroom flat at basement level, 2-bedroom flat at ground floor level, 2 -bedroom flat at first floor level and a 2-bedroom maisonette on second and new third floor levels.
- 8.36 The scheme involves the extension of the existing basement area to the rear, the creation of a new rear extension at basement, ground and first floor levels and the creation of a new third floor level within the main building in the form of a mansard roof extension.
- 8.37 Whilst demotion plans for the scheme were submitted as part of the planning application for continuity, these have been updated so that

they are in a similar format to those produced for the other schemes detailed above.

8.38 As part of this assessment, an overlay of existing and proposed plans for this development option have been created. From these overlays, a set of demolition plans has been prepared showing the minimum extent of demolition work required to implement the scheme based on the proposed alterations to the layout of the building and other factors detailed below (Overlay and demolition plans are included at Appendix D).

8.39 The works can be summarised as follows:

	Application Ref: 2023/5113/P
	Basement:
C1	Partial removal of load bearing masonry walls and new openings formed to the front of the property in the location of the vaults.
C2	Partial removal of the load bearing masonry wall in the location of the front elevation, the removal of existing window openings and the creation of new window and door openings.
C3	Removal of the load bearing masonry wall in the location of the rear elevation.
C4	Removal of the existing load bearing masonry wall between the rear courtyard and bathroom.
C5	Removal of existing retaining wall to the rear of the property.
C6	All works associated with the construction of additional basement space to the rear, including excavations and the installation of new concrete retaining walls
С7	Construction of new extension with lightwell to the rear.
C8	Removal of all existing internal walls including the central spine wall and walls forming the existing stairwell and hallway.
С9	Removal of the existing chimneybreasts.

C10	Replacement of the basement slab.
C11	Underpinning of all retained walls at basement level.
C12	Removal of the existing staircase and the installation of a new staircase to the front of the building.
C13	Removal of all existing windows and doors.
C14	Installation of new structure as required, including a steel frame at all levels within the main building.
C15	Installation of new internal walls as required.
C16	Installation of new glazing as required.
C17	Removal of all existing fixtures and the installation of new fixtures, services and finishes as required, including new underground drainage.
C18	Upgrading works to retained elements as required to meet regulatory standards.
	Ground Floor:
C19	Removal and replacement of the existing floor structure, including the existing concrete floor slab in the location of the rear extension and above the basement courtyard.
C20	Removal of all existing internal walls including the central spine wall and walls forming the existing stairwell and hallway.
C21	Removal of the existing shopfront and bressummer beam within the front elevation and installation of new masonry walls together with new window and door openings.
C22	Removal of the load bearing masonry wall in the location of the rear elevation.
C23	Partial removal of the existing masonry wall forming the side elevation.
C24	Removal of all structure forming the existing rear extension.
C25	Removal of existing chimneybreasts.
C26	Removal of the existing staircase and the installation of a new staircase to the front of the building.
C27	Removal of all existing windows and doors.

¥

C28	Construction of new rear extension with lightwell to the rear and installation of new structure as required, including a steel frame at all levels within the main building.
C29	Installation of new internal walls as required.
C30	Installation of new glazing as required.
C31	Removal of all existing fixtures and the installation of new fixtures, services and finishes as required.
C32	Upgrading works to retained elements as required to meet regulatory standards.
	First Floor:
C33	Removal and replacement of the existing floor structure.
C34	Removal of the existing masonry wall forming the rear elevation.
C35	Partial removal of the existing masonry wall forming the side elevation.
C36	Removal of all structure forming the existing rear extension.
C37	Removal of all existing internal walls including the central spine wall and walls forming the existing stairwell and hallway.
C38	Removal of the existing staircase and the installation of a new staircase to the front of the building.
C39	Removal of existing chimneybreasts.
C40	Removal of all existing windows and doors.
C41	Construction of new rear extension with lightwell to the rear and installation of new structure as required, including a steel frame at all levels within the main building.
C42	Installation of new internal walls as required.
C43	Installation of new glazing as required.
C44	Removal of all existing fixtures and the installation of new fixtures, services and finishes as required.
C45	Upgrading works to retained elements as required to meet regulatory standards.

	Second Floor:
C46	Removal and replacement of the existing floor structure.
C47	Removal of the existing masonry wall forming the rear elevation.
C48	Partial removal of the existing masonry wall forming the side elevation.
C49	Removal of all existing internal walls including the central spine wall and walls forming the existing stairwell and hallway.
C50	Removal of existing chimneybreasts.
C51	Removal of the existing staircase and the installation of a new staircase to the front of the building.
C52	Removal of existing mezzanine structure.
C53	Removal of all existing windows and doors.
C54	Installation of flat roof structure above new rear extension.
C55	Installation of new structure as required, including a steel frame at all levels within the main building.
C56	Installation of new internal walls as required.
C57	Installation of new glazing as required.
C58	Removal of all existing fixtures and the installation of new fixtures, services and finishes as required.
C59	Upgrading works to retained elements as required to meet regulatory standards.
	Third Floor:
C60	Removal of the existing main roof structure.
C61	Removal of existing second floor mezzanine level.
C62	Construction of new third floor structure and roof.
C63	Installation of new structure as required, including a steel frame at all levels within the main building.
C64	Removal of all existing fixtures and the installation of new fixtures, services and finishes as required.

C65	Upgrading works to retained elements as required to meet regulatory
	standards.

- 8.40 In assessing the extent of the works required to implement planning application ref: 2023/5113/P, the following points need to be considered:
- 8.41 Vaults / Front Lightwell: The front lightwell and vaults are in an extremely poor condition and were found to be unsafe to access during inspection. Significant cracking was found to the wall sections with signs of distress and movement in the front wall which was assessed to be significantly leaning inwards (Structural Report paragraphs 4.1, 5.3, 7.5 & 7.13). The structural report concludes that this area needs immediate attention and will require rebuilding regardless of the development option selected (Structural Report paragraphs 5.3 & 7.13).
- 8.42 **Rear Extension**: The proposed alterations to the size and form of the existing rear extension require its removal and reconstruction. Notwithstanding this, the existing rear extension is in a very poor structural condition and shows signs of historic movement. Cracks were observed in the walls of the extension with a width of 10 15mm. As detailed in the structural report, the extension is beyond repair and needs to be demolished and rebuilt with foundations of a sufficient depth to safeguard against future movement. (See Structural Report paragraphs 4.2, 5.5, 7.1 & 7.2).
- 8.43 **Rear Elevation**: The extension of the basement to the rear together with the proposed changes to the layout of the basement and ground floors requires the removal of the existing masonry wall in the location of the rear elevation at those levels. The creation of a new first floor structure to the rear will result in the associated removal of the rear elevation at that level. The extensive alterations to the fenestration detail at second floor level mean that the existing rear elevation will also need to be rebuilt at that level. The net result of these works is that the existing rear elevation will be substantially removed and/or rebuilt at all levels to facilitate the proposals contained within planning application ref: 2023/5113/P.

Notwithstanding this, the rear elevation has been observed to be in a poor condition with signs of distress to the brickwork. The top parapet wall is bulging inwards and there are a number of cracks around and above window openings and in the brickwork. There is significant distortion and unevenness to the majority of the elevation. The structural report concludes that the rear elevation will need to be partially rebuilt regardless of the development option selected and entirely rebuilt to facilitate the proposals contained within planning application ref: 2023/5113/P (Structural Report paragraphs 4.7, 5.18 & 7.14).

- 8.44 Side Elevation: The side elevation will need to be partially rebuilt to enable new window openings to be formed in the location of the external chimneybreast. New steel window frames need to be installed and tied back into the main frame of the building to provide restraint. Some significant cracking has been observed to the flank wall internally which will require remedial works. Given the extent of works required to the front and rear elevations, the removal of the floors, new basement structure and additional imposed loads resulting from the new roof structure, it is likely that further rebuilding works will be required to this wall (Structural Report paragraphs 7.10 & 7.16).
- 8.45 **Front Elevation**: The works required to the front elevation at basement and ground floor levels, together with the removal and replacement of the existing timber bressummer beam at first floor level, will require the installation of steel beams to temporarily prop the brickwork above (Structural Report paragraphs 5.17 & 7.5). Given the position of the windows directly above the bressummer beam, steel supports will need to be installed at first floor level down to basement level and all windows fully braced during the works. As detailed in the structural report, the brickwork within the front elevation is of poor quality and contains areas that are structurally distorted and cracked. Retained brickwork would need to be repaired and rebuilt as required to remediate these defects and upgraded to meet current standards for thermal performance.
- 8.46 **Floors**: The plans show alterations to the floor levels at ground, second and new third floor levels, requiring the replacement of the existing floor structure. Notwithstanding this, given the extent of proposed alterations to load bearing walls, the removal and relocation of the existing stairwell and the standards set out in Approved Document A of

the Building Regulations, which requires the installation of a steel frame at all levels of the building to safeguard against disproportionate collapse, all floors at the property will need to be replaced. This in turn will necessitate the removal of all internal walls (Structural Report paragraphs 7.7 & 7.8). Notwithstanding the proposed works, the existing timber floors are showing signs of distortion and structural instability and will require strengthening and, in most areas, replacement with

newly designed floor joists (Structural Report paragraphs 5.4, 5.6, 5.12).

- 8.47 **Basement Slab**: The works to extend the basement to the rear, the requirement for upgraded insulation and waterproofing, underpinning works required to the existing structure and installation of a new steel frame with associated foundations in accordance with Approved Document A mean that the existing basement slab will need to be replaced in its entirety.
- 8.48 **Roof**: New roof levels are proposed on the rear extension and main building. The existing roof structures will need to be entirely replaced.
- 8.49 **Services**: All existing wiring and plumbing installations at the property are non-compliant and beyond serviceable use. These will need to be fully replaced with new installations.
- 8.50 **Fittings**: All internal fitments at the property, such as internal doors, skirting boards, architraves, bathroom fittings etc, are unsuitable for use in the new development. These will need to be removed and replaced.
- 8.51 As set out in the above information and plans, the elements of structure that could realistically be retained under planning proposal ref: 2023/5113/P are the following:
  - Part of the side elevation
  - Part of the front elevation
  - Side and front retaining walls at basement level
  - Part of the walls forming the vaults at basement level
- 8.52 Works to temporarily support retained sections of the front elevation will be complicated for the reasons outlined at paragraph 5.5. of the

structural report and will result in damage to the façade. This element, if retained, will need to be partially rebuilt / repaired and upgraded to meet current standards for thermal performance.

8.53 Any walls retained at basement level will need to be underpinned to safeguard against future movement (Structural Report paragraphs 5.2, 7.2 & 7.13).

# 9.0 Analysis

9.1 The elements of existing structure that could potentially be retained under each development option detailed above can be summarised as follows:

#### Planning Applications Ref: 2017/0357/P & 2022/0127/P

Side elevation of the main building

Part of the front elevation of the main building\*

Retaining walls at basement level

Part of the wall below the rear elevation at basement level

Part of the walls forming the vaults to the front of the property\*\*

Pre-Application Ref: 2022/5022/PRE

Part of the walls forming the vaults to the front of the property\*\*

Planning Application Ref: 2023/5113/P

Part of the side elevation of the main building\*

Part of the front elevation of the main building\*

Side and front retaining walls at basement level

Part of the walls forming the vaults to the front of the property\*\*

\*Works to temporarily support these elements will be complicated and will cause localised damage. These elements will need to be repaired and upgraded to current standards.

\*\* As set out in the structural report, these elements are in a poor state of repair and will need to be partially rebuilt/repaired.

9.2 The extent of reconstruction required under each scheme is broadly similar. The principal differences are the extent to which the side and front elevations could be retained and the removal of the wall beneath the rear elevation and rear retaining wall at basement level under

schemes ref: 2022/5022/PRE and 2023/5113/P and the removal of the side retaining wall at basement level under scheme ref: 2022/5022/PRE.

- 9.3 Each of the schemes detailed above involves the creation of Class C3 residential units at the site. In design terms, applications ref: 2022/5022/PRE and 2023/5113/P are most similar, involving the creation of three self-contained flats on basement, ground and first floor levels and a maisonette on second and third floor levels.
- 9.4 The layout of the proposed units detailed within applications ref: 2022/5022/PRE and 2023/5113/P are broadly similar and both schemes involve the creation of additional basement space. In the case of application ref: 2022/5022/PRE, an extension of the basement is proposed to the side and rear. In the case of application ref: 2023/5113/P, an extension of the basement is proposed to the rear only. Both schemes involve similar changes to the floor levels and to the position of the main staircase. In addition, both schemes propose the construction of a similar rear extension at basement, ground and first floor levels with a lightwell to the rear.
- 9.5 Application ref: 2022/5022/PRE involves the lateral extension of the building footprint at basement, ground, first, second and third floor levels over the side passageway and to the rear at basement level. Application ref: 2023/5113/P stays within the footprint of the existing building save for an extension of the basement to the rear.
- 9.6 Applications ref: 2017/0357/P and 2022/0127/P contain identical proposals and involve the creation of a maisonette at basement and ground floor levels, a flat at first floor level and a further maisonette at second and third floor levels. Under these schemes, changes are proposed to the floor levels at basement, first and new third floor levels and the main staircase is moved from the southern side of the building to the northern side. Additional accommodation is proposed above the existing rear extension at first floor level, with a new lightwell created in the location of the existing basement courtyard.
- 9.7 All of the proposed schemes involve the creation of additional floorspace within the main building at third floor level in the form of a mansard roof extension.

9.8 Whilst applications ref: 2022/5022/PRE and 2023/5113/P are closest in design terms, applications ref: 2017/0357/P, 2022/0127/P and 2023/5113/P are most similar in terms of the amount of existing structure that could be retained. The principal difference being the degree to which the side elevation would need to be rebuilt and the extent to which the rear retaining wall and wall beneath the rear elevation at basement level could be retained.

### **Common Factors:**

- 9.9 In considering the extent of reconstruction works required under the schemes detailed above, the following common factors need to be taken into account:
- 9.10 The masonry walls forming the vaults and front lightwell are showing signs of significant structural distress and need to be rebuilt (Structural Report paragraphs 4.1, 5.3, 7.5 & 7.13).
- 9.11 The existing rear extension is in a very poor structural condition and shows signs of historic movement with cracks of 10 15mm width noted in the walls. As detailed in the structural report, the extension is beyond repair and needs to be demolished and rebuilt with foundations of a sufficient depth to safeguard against future movement (Structural Report paragraphs 4.2, 5.5, 7.1 & 7.2).
- 9.12 Underpinning works are required to the existing structure to safeguard against future movement regardless of the development option selected. The creation of a third floor level on the main building requires the installation of a new steel frame at all levels with associated foundations. Works to upgrade insulation and waterproofing are required, together with the installation of new drainage. As a result of these works, the existing concrete basement slab will need to be removed and replaced in its entirely regardless of the development option selected.
- 9.13 As part of works to create residential units at the site, the existing shopfront will need to be replaced with windows and doors that are suitably arranged. In addition to these works, the existing timber

bressummer beam at first floor level will need to be replaced (Structural Report paragraphs 5.17 & 7.5). To facilitate the removal of the beam and shopfront, together with the works required to the front wall at basement level, temporary steelwork will need to be installed at first floor level down to basement level to support retained masonry above. As detailed in the structural report, the brickwork within the front elevation is of poor quality and is already showing signs of structural distress. Retained brickwork would need to be repaired and rebuilt as required to remediate these defects and upgraded to meet current standards for thermal performance regardless of the development option selected.

9.14 The schemes detailed above involve the partial removal of the existing masonry wall in the location of the rear elevation at basement and ground floor levels to facilitate changes to the layout of these areas. The schemes also require the removal of the rear elevation at first floor level as part of the construction of a new rear extension. In addition, as a result of extensive changes proposed to the fenestration detail at second floor level, this section of wall will need to be rebuilt. The net result of these works is that no part of the rear elevation can be retained under the proposed schemes.

Notwithstanding this, the rear elevation has been observed to be in a poor condition with signs of distress to the brickwork and significant distortion such that it will need to be partially rebuilt regardless of the development option selected (Structural Report paragraphs 4.7, 5.18 & 7.14).

9.15 The schemes detailed above involve various changes to the floor levels, requiring the associated removal of the existing floor structure. Notwithstanding this, given the extent of the proposed alterations to load bearing walls, the removal and relocation of the existing stairwell and the standards set out in Approved Document A of the Building Regulations, which requires the installation of a steel frame at all levels to safeguard against disproportionate collapse, all floors at the property will need to be removed and replaced. This in turn will result in the removal of all internal walls (Structural Report paragraphs 7.7 & 7.8).

- 9.16 In addition to the works detailed above, compliance with Approved Documents B and E (Fire Safety and Resistance to the Passage of Sound) of the Building Regulations will result in changes to the floor build ups and levels, requiring the removal and replacement of the existing staircases and some internal walls regardless of the development option selected.
- 9.17 Notwithstanding the proposed works, the existing timber floors are showing signs of distortion and structural instability and will require strengthening and, in most areas, replacement with newly designed floor joists (Structural Report paragraphs 5.4, 5.6, 5.12).
- 9.18 The schemes detailed above involve the creation of accommodation at third floor level, requiring the removal of the existing main roof structure and the installation of a new storey in the form of a traditional mansard roof extension.
- 9.19 As detailed in the construction audit report, the windows at the property are beyond serviceable use and do not comply with current standards for thermal performance. As such, these elements will need to be replaced regardless of the development option selected.
- 9.20 As detailed in the construction audit report, all existing wiring and plumbing installations at the property are non-compliant and beyond serviceable use. These will need to be replaced with new installations regardless of the development option selected.
- 9.21 As detailed in the construction audit report, all existing internal fitments (internal doors, skirting boards, architraves, bathroom fittings etc) at the property are unsuitable for use in the proposed schemes. These will need to be removed and replaced. It is considered that this would be the case for any development option involving the creation of new residential units at the site.

### Points of difference:

9.22 The principal difference between the schemes is the degree to which the front and side elevations could be retained. There is also a difference in the amount of masonry wall that could be retained at basement level at the rear and side of the site and below the existing rear elevation. However, the amount of structure involved is relatively small.

- 9.23 Application ref: 2022/5022/PRE involves the extension of the building footprint at basement, ground, first, second and third floor levels over the side passageway and to the rear. As a result, the existing side and rear retaining walls at basement level and existing rear, side and front elevations at ground, first and second floor levels would need to the removed and reconstructed.
- 9.24 Applications ref: 2017/0357/P, 2022/0127/P and 2023/5113/P are similar in relation to the extent of existing structure that could be retained. The principal difference being that under applications ref: 2017/0357/P and 2022/0127/P all of the side elevation could be retained together with the rear retaining wall and part of the masonry wall beneath the rear elevation at basement level. Under application ref: 2023/5113/P, the introduction of windows in the side elevation in the location of the existing external chimneybreast will result in the wall needing to be partially rebuilt and the proposed extension of the basement to the rear will result in additional structure being removed in that area.

### Alternative Schemes:

- 9.25 For the reasons given above, any scheme involving the creation of residential units at the site will require as a minimum the following destructive works:
  - The demolition of the existing rear extension, including ground slab and foundations.
  - The underpinning of retained structure at basement level.
  - The removal and replacement of the existing concrete basement slab.
  - The rebuilding of the walls forming the front lightwell, including the front wall of the building at basement level.

- The partial rebuilding of the walls forming the vaults.
- The removal of the existing timber bressummer beam within the front elevation at first floor level, requiring the temporary support of brickwork at first and second floor levels, and similar removal of any other timber beams found during the works.
- The partial rebuilding / repair of the front elevation.
- The substantial rebuilding of the rear elevation.
- The removal / upgrading of the existing main roof structure to meet current standards.
- The upgrading and replacement in most cases of the existing floor structure.
- The removal and replacement of the existing staircases.
- The replacement of all external windows and doors.
- The removal of all plaster and lathe wall and ceiling coverings.
- The removal of all existing fitments, such as internal doors, skirting boards, architraves, bathroom fittings etc.
- The replacement of all existing pipework and cabling.
- The upgrading of all retained structure to meet current standards.
- 9.26 The following matters also need to be considered:
- 9.27 Any scheme involving the creation of a new third floor level will require the installation of a steel frame throughout the building to safeguard against disproportionate collapse in accordance with the requirements of Approved Document A of the Building Regulations. These works will

result in the removal of the existing floors at the property together with internal walls (Structural Report paragraph 7.7).

- 9.28 Presently, windows are provided within the front elevation at ground, first and second floor levels and within the rear elevation at first and second floor levels. The windows within the rear elevation are aligned with the main floors on the lefthand side of the elevation and half landings on the righthand side. If an additional floor is added to the rear extension at first floor level, only the second floor windows within the rear elevation will remain. As a result, the central part of the building will be dark.
- 9.29 To provide natural light to rooms located centrally within the site, the schemes submitted under planning applications ref: 2017/0357/P and 2022/0127/P propose the creation of a central lightwell between the rear elevation and rear extension. As part of these works, significant alterations are proposed to the fenestration detail of the rear elevation such that it would need to be rebuilt.

The scheme submitted under planning application ref: 2023/5113/P proposes the introduction of windows within the side elevation at ground and first floor levels to provide natural light to rooms located to the rear of the main building. Due to the presence of an external chimneybreast in this location, which is acting as a buttress to the facade, new steel window frames will need to be installed and tied back into the main frame of the building to provide restraint. Some significant cracking has been observed to the flank wall internally which will require remedial works. Given the extent of works required to the front and rear elevations, the removal of the floors, new basement structure and additional imposed loads resulting from the new roof structure, it is likely that further rebuilding works will be required to the side wall as a result (Structural Report paragraph 7.16).

- 9.30 Any scheme involving the creation of residential units at the site will need to address the lack of natural light entering the centre of the building.
- 9.31 Applications ref: 2022/5022/PRE and 2023/5113/P involve the creation of additional basement space. These works require the removal of existing retaining walls and structure. Any scheme involving the

creation of additional basement space will require similar destructive works.

- 9.32 The existing building has been affected by subsidence twice in the past. An Insurance claim relating to the subsidence of the main building was successfully made in 1990. A further claim relating to the subsidence of the rear extension was successfully made in 2012. As detailed in the structural report, significant cracking was noted within the structure during the inspection of the building, with evidence of movement associated with subsidence observed. As a result of this damage, the rear extension that was constructed in 1993 needs to be demolished and rebuilt (Structural Report paragraphs 5.5 & 7.2).
- 9.33 Due to the history of subsidence at the site and the insurance claims that have been made, it is no longer possible to insure the property against subsidence on standard terms. This issue is not limited to the existing building in its current format and will affect converted flats at the property, potentially making them unmortgageable.
- 9.34 To fully resolve this issue, the building needs to be rebuilt on new foundations to current standards, incorporating measures to safeguard against future movement and be classed as a new building (See CCI Brokerage letter at Appendix C).

## 10.0 Site Capacity & Design

- 10.1 London Plan Policy D3 requires all development to make the best use of land by following a design-led approach that optimises the capacity of sites. The Policy defines optimisation of site capacity as "*ensuring that development is of the most appropriate form and land use for the site*". The policy further states, "The best use of the land needs to be *taken into consideration when deciding whether to retain existing buildings in a development*".
- 10.2 To date, four development proposals for the creation of residential units at the site have been submitted to the London Borough of Camden under application references: 2017/0357/P, 2022/0127/P, 2022/5022/PRE and 2023/5113/P.
- 10.3 Planning application ref: 2022/0127/P has been recently recommended for approval within the framework of current policy. It can therefore be considered a starting point for appraising the capacity and design of the site.
- 10.4 The scheme involves the creation of three residential units at the site in the follow arrangement: 2-bedroom maisonette on basement and ground floor levels, 1-bedroom flat at first floor level and a 2-bedroom maisonette on second and new third floor levels.
- 10.5 As part of the works, additional floorspace is proposed through the construction of a new first floor level on the rear extension and a new third floor level within the main building in the form of a mansard roof extension.
- 10.6 Planning application ref: 2023/5113/P builds upon these proposals by improving the quality of accommodation that will be created and by optimising site capacity.
- 10.7 The scheme will provide four residential units at the site in the following arrangement: 1 -bedroom flat at basement level, 2-bedroom flat at ground floor level, 2 -bedroom flat at first floor level and a 2-bedroom maisonette on second and new third floor levels.

- 10.8 The scheme will provide additional floorspace through the construction of a new rear extension at basement, ground and first floor levels and the creation of a new third floor level within the main building in the form of a mansard roof extension.
- 10.9 In comparing the proposals contained within applications ref: 2022/0127/P and 2023/5113/P, the following points should be considered:
- 10.9.1 All of the proposed flats created under planning application ref: 2023/5113/P have a floor area comfortably in excess of the space standards set out in Table 3.1 of the London Plan (2021), together with sufficient built-in storage space. This improves upon the proposals contained within application ref: 2022/0127/P, which does not meet this requirement in all cases.
- 10.9.2 All of the proposed flats created under planning application ref: 2023/5113/P have generous living areas and bedrooms, in excess of the standards set out in the London Plan (2021), and good-sized bathrooms with space for necessary furniture, including baths, whilst retaining sufficient circulation space. This improves upon the proposals contained within application ref: 2022/0127/P, which provide only a shower room within the first floor flat and a very small bathroom at second floor level.
- 10.9.3 All of the proposed principal bedrooms created under planning application ref: 2023/5113/P would have a width greater than 2.75m and a floor area of more than 11.5sqm and single bedrooms would have a width greater than 2.15m and a floor area of more than 7.5sqm, in excess of the standards set out in the London Plan (2021).
- 10.9.4 All of the proposed flats created under planning application ref: 2023/5113/P are perfectly stacked, with bedrooms above bedrooms and living rooms above living rooms in all cases. This improves upon the proposals contained within application ref: 2022/0127/P, which has bedrooms above the living areas of other dwellings, which will likely result in disturbance.

- 10.9.5 All of the proposed flats created under planning application ref: 2023/5113/P are dual aspect and have good access to natural light. This improves upon the proposals contained within application ref: 2022/0127/P which provides a living room and bedrooms on the basement, ground and first floors of the building with windows onto an internal courtyard measuring 2.7m by 2.8m.
- 10.9.6 All of the flats proposed under planning application ref: 2023/5113/P are provided with outdoor amenity space accessed via a living area. This improves upon the proposals contained within application ref: 2022/0127/P.
- 10.9.7 In terms of scale, the principal difference between the schemes is that application ref: 2023/5113/P involves the creation of additional basement floorspace to the rear of the site. In addition, application ref: 2023/5113/P proposes a different configuration of the rear extension, with a lightwell located to the rear of the site, rather than positioned centrally. This design amendment greatly improves the quality of accommodation provided and results in the rear extension being smaller in scale above ground than that proposed under application ref: 2022/0127/P, meaning that it will also have less impact on adjoining properties.
- 10.9.8 The central lightwell proposed under application ref: 2022/0127/P is small and heavily shaded. It services an outdoor amenity space, bedrooms and a living area belonging to different dwellings, creating a poor-quality arrangement which could result in disturbance, loss of privacy, light pollution and inadequate ventilation.
- 10.9.9 The rear lightwell proposed under application ref: 2023/5113/P is substantially larger than that proposed under application ref: 2022/0127/P and will provide better separation between dwellings, improved access to natural light and larger outdoor amenity spaces accessed from living areas.
- 10.9.10 The reconfiguration of the rear extension under application ref: 2023/5113/P is facilitated by the extension of the existing basement area. The proposed basement extension is small and covers an area of 41sqm. As set out above, due to the condition of the existing rear extension, this structure will need to be demolished and rebuilt

irrespective of the new extension and basement area proposed under application ref: 2023/5113/P.

- 10.9.11 In addition to facilitating changes to the rear of the site, the extension of the basement area also enables the creation of a separate dwelling at basement level with generous proportions and access to an outdoor amenity space. The scheme proposed under application ref: 2022/0127/P provides a maisonette on ground and basement levels. This unit would have two bedrooms and a floor area of 110sqm, making it oversized, with inadequate access to outdoor amenity space and natural light.
- 10.9.12 Aside from the creation of additional floorspace at basement level and a reduction in the size of the rear extension above ground, the scale of the proposed schemes is the same.
- 10.9.13 To allow natural light into rooms located within the centre of the site, application ref: 2023/5113/P proposes the creation of new windows within the side elevation of the main building. These windows facilitate the creation of two habitable rooms on the ground and first floors, where the rear extension prevents windows being placed in the rear elevation.
- 10.9.14 Under application ref: 2022/0127/P, light is provided to the centre of the site via a central lightwell. This is a poor arrangement for the reasons detailed above.

## Alternative Scope of Development

- 10.10 As set out, any development involving the creation of residential units at the site will require certain destructive works due to the condition of the existing building and need to comply with statutory requirements.
- 10.11 In addition to these works, further destructive works would be required to implement any scheme involving the following forms of development:
  - The creation of a new third floor level on the main building, which would require the installation of a steel frame on all levels.

- The excavation of additional basement floorspace.
- The extension of the building over the side passageway.
- The introduction of windows to the rear of the side elevation to allow light into the centre of the site.
- 10.12 The works associated with these forms of development have been detailed above in relation to schemes ref: 2017/0357/P, 2022/0127/P, 2022/5022/PRE and 2023/5113/P. To assist with assessing the most appropriate form of development for the site, the above development options are discussed further below.
- 10.13 In terms of the creation of a new third floor level on the main building, the property is located at the end of a terrace of five similar properties.All of the other buildings within the terrace have been extended to provide accommodation on new third floor levels.
- 10.14 The provision of floorspace at third floor level allows the creation of a residential unit on the second and third floors of the building.
- 10.15 The second floor level of the property is not large enough to house a self-contained unit and without the provision of floorspace at third floor level, will need to be incorporated into a dwelling unit located on the lower floors. This would limit the scheme to providing:
  - a) A single dwellinghouse.
  - b) Flats at basement and ground floor levels, subject to an extension of the existing basement area, and a maisonette on first and second floor levels.
  - c) A maisonette on basement and ground floor levels and a maisonette on first and second floor levels.
- 10.16 A scheme involving the creation of basement floorspace would not be viable under the reduced scope of option B. Given the extent of works required to the building, schemes within the reduced scope of options

A or C would not be viable. These schemes would still require the demolition and reconstruction of the existing rear extension, replacement of the basement slab, underpinning of all retained structure within the basement, replacement of all fitments, services, windows and doors, replacement of the main roof and other required rebuilding works detailed above.

- 10.17 The creation of basement floorspace to the rear of the site significantly improves the quality of accommodation that can be provided. In addition to enabling the creation of a dwelling unit at basement level, it allows the creation of a lightwell to the rear, providing valuable amenity space and natural light to the basement, ground and first floor levels.
- 10.18 As the existing rear extension, together with the its floor slab and foundations, needs to be demolished regardless of the development option selected, an extension of the existing basement area to the rear will not significantly affect the amount of existing structure that can be retained.
- 10.19 The creation of new basement floorspace space to the rear of the site will result in the additional removal of the rear retaining wall and part of the masonry wall beneath the rear elevation at basement level only. These sections of wall are relatively small.
- 10.20 Application ref: 2022/5022/PRE involves the lateral extension of the main building over the side passageway. The flats proposed under the scheme have a similar configuration to those proposed under application ref: 2023/5113/P. Whilst the proposals contained within application ref: 2022/5022/PRE will provide valuable additional floorspace, it is not considered that the extended scope of the scheme will provide a significantly higher quality of accommodation.
- 10.21 Any development option involving the creation of residential units at the site will benefit from successfully addressing the issue of the lack of natural light entering the central part of the building at ground and first floor levels. This issue was addressed in applications ref: 2017/0357/P and 2022/0127/P through the creation of a lightwell between the rear elevation and rear extension. For the reasons given above, it is considered that application ref: 2023/5113/P provides a better

solution, involving the introduction of windows within the side elevation.

### Analysis

- 10.22 London Plan Policy D3 requires all development to make the best use of land by following a design-led approach that optimises the capacity of sites. The Policy defines optimisation of site capacity as "*ensuring that development is of the most appropriate form* and *land use for the site*"
- 10.23 In assessing the most appropriate form and use for the site, the following points need to be considered:
- 10.24 The building is located within a predominantly residential area with a dwindling demand for commercial premises. The property was formerly used as a doctor's surgery with residential accommodation at basement level. The doctor's surgery relocated to a nearby premises in 2016.
- 10.25 The existing building is in a very poor condition such that extensive works are required to the property regardless of the development option selected.
- 10.26 The property has remained vacant since 2016 save for a short period when the first and second floors were let out as office space.
- 10.27 The London Borough of Camden has accepted that considering the building's history, poor structural and physical condition and local market conditions, conversion to residential usage is the only viable option for bringing the property back into long term usage.
- 10.28 Planning permission to put the property into residential use was granted approval under application ref: 2017/0357/P and has been recently recommended for approval under application ref: 2022/0127/P.

- 10.29 The building is located at the end of a terrace of similar properties. The buildings within the terrace, with the exception of the subject property, have been extended at roof level to include accommodation on the third floor. Planning permission for a similar extension of the subject property was approved under planning application ref: 2017/0357/P and recently recommended for approval under application ref: 2022/0127/P.
- 10.30 The extension of the property at third floor level can therefore be considered a sensitive and appropriate form of development that would increase the capacity of the site and bring the building into line with its neighbours.
- 10.31 The additional floorspace provided by the third floor enables the creation of a maisonette at second and third floor levels. Without the additional floorspace at third floor level, accommodation on the second floor would need to be incorporated into a dwelling unit located on the lower floors, limiting the development's potential and viability.
- 10.32 The existing rear extension at the property needs to be demolished and rebuilt regardless of the development option selected. Proposals for an increase in the height of the rear extension by one storey have already been approved under planning application ref: 2017/0357/P and recently recommended for approval under planning application ref: 2022/0127/P.
- 10.33 In approving the enlarged extension, the Council found that, "The residential extension would not project higher than the existing parapet wall with no.116 Malden Road and would be set-back by 4.4m with no. 120 Malden Road. The proposed first floor window would not impact upon no.131 Queens crescent in terms of loss of privacy given there is blank wall to the rear of the single storey rear addition. The window to the flank elevation would face the blank wall with no.120 Malden Road. Thus, the neighbouring properties would not be impacted in terms of daylight/sunlight nor contribute to a sense of enclosure. In terms of outlook and the loss of privacy there would not be any additional impact. As such, would accord to A1 of the Local Plan 2017 "

- 10.34 The increase in the height of the property by one storey at the rear can therefore be considered a sensitive and appropriate form of development that would improve the capacity of the site.
- 10.35 As detailed above, the extension of the existing basement area to the rear of the site has many benefits. It will provide additional floorspace, enables the creation of a lightwell and amenity space to the rear and allows a better quantum and layout of dwelling units.
- 10.36 The extension of the basement area proposed under planning application ref: 2023/5113/P is relatively small and the analysis contained within the basement impact assessment for the scheme concludes that the predicted damage to neighbouring properties from the works would be "*Negligible*" to "*Very Slight*".
- 10.37 The extension of the basement to the rear is therefore considered to be an appropriate form of development given the improvements to the quality and quantum of accommodation it will create.
- 10.38 Access to natural light is required to rooms located within the centre of the site. Different solutions for achieving this have been proposed under planning applications ref: 2017/0357/P, 2022/0127/P and 2023/5113/P. Any development involving the creation of residential units at the site will need to address this issue.
- 10.39 The lateral extension of the property over the side passageway as proposed under pre-application ref: 2022/5022/PRE will create valuable floorspace. The proposals were found to be broadly acceptable by the London Borough of Camden in design terms. Whilst the proposals would increase the amount of floorspace at the site, the layouts would be similar to those proposed under planning application ref: 2023/5113/P and it is considered that the quality of accommodation would not be significantly improved. Works to extend the property to the side would be much more complicated to implement.
- 10.40 The form of the proposed development is broadly set by its surroundings. The site is positioned at the end of a terrace of similar buildings, of a similar scale. To optimise site capacity, an increase in the

size of the building at the site is proposed in the form of a new third floor roof extension on the main building, a new first floor level at the rear, in the location of the existing rear extension, and an extension of the basement area. These changes are in line with the buildings neighbouring the site and as set out above, significantly improve the quality of accommodation that would be provided.

- 10.41 Proposals for the redevelopment of the site to residential usage involving the creation of an additional floor on the main building and rear extension were previously granted planning permission by the London Borough of Camden under application ref: 2017/0357/P and recently recommended for approval under application ref: 2022/0127/P.
- 10.42 Planning application ref: 2023/5113/P builds on these proposals. The scheme will provide a building of a similar scale to that previously approved but will deliver better quality accommodation through the creation of additional basement floorspace, a lightwell to the rear and the provision of windows in the side of the building. As detailed above, the proposed basement extension is small and an assessment of the scheme has found that the basement works will have "*Negligible*" to "*Very Slight*" impact on neighbouring properties.
- 10.43 The proposals contained within planning application ref: 2023/5113/P can therefore be considered an appropriate form and use of the site that optimises capacity in accordance with the requirements of London Plan Policy D3.

# 11.0 Conclusion

- 11.1 A planning application has been submitted to the London Borough of Camden under reference: 2023/5113/P for the reconstruction of the existing building to form a new part four / part two-storey building providing four self-contained residential units (Class C3), including the creation of new basement floor space.
- 11.2 The Camden Local Plan 2017 and its supplementary document: Camden Panning Guidance - Energy efficiency and adaptation (January 2021) require a condition and feasibility study and options appraisal to be undertaken for all developments proposing substantial demolition.
- 11.3 Policy CC1 (Climate change mitigation) of the Local Plan requires all proposals that involve substantial demolition to demonstrate that it is not possible to retain and improve the existing building.
- 11.4 Paragraph 9.4 of the Camden Panning Guidance Energy efficiency and adaptation (January 2021) states that, "In assessing the opportunities for retention and refurbishment developers should assess the condition of the existing building and explore future potential of the site. The New London Plan highlights the importance of retaining the value of existing buildings with the least preferable development option of recycling through demolition, although Policy D3 of the New London Plan states the 'best use of the land needs to be taken into consideration when deciding whether to retain existing buildings in a development'".
- 11.5 At *paragraphs* 9.5 and 9.6, the CPG provides a hierarchy based on the condition of an existing building and feasibility of re-use as follows:
  - 1. Refit
  - 2. Refurbish
  - 3. Substantial refurbishment and extension
  - 4. Reclaim and recycle
- 11.6 As part of this study, a structural report has been produced to establish the condition of the existing building and the works required to upgrade

the existing structure. In addition, an audit detailing each building element has been produced.

- 11.7 The existing property is located within a predominantly residential area with a dwindling demand for commercial premises. The building was formerly used as a doctor's surgery with residential accommodation at basement level. The doctor's surgery relocated to nearby premises in 2016.
- 11.8 To date, four schemes involving the creation of residential units at the site have been submitted to the London Borough of Camden under references: 2017/0357/P, 2022/0127/P 2022/5022/PRE and 2023/5113/P. Application ref: 2017/0357/P was granted planning approval but was not implemented. An identical scheme (ref: 2022/0127/P) has recently been recommended for approval.
- 11.9 In granting planning approval, the London Borough of Camden confirmed that in view of the building's history, poor structural and physical condition and local market conditions, conversion to residential usage was the only viable option for bringing the property back into long term usage.
- 11.10 As part of this study, overlay and demolition plans have been produced to establish the amount of existing structure that could be retained under each of the schemes listed above. This information has then been used to assess alternative development options.
- 11.11 This study has found that the extent of reconstructive works required to implement each of the schemes listed above is broadly similar. The principal differences being the extent to which the side and front elevations could be retained, the removal of the wall beneath the rear elevation and rear retaining wall at basement level under schemes ref: 2022/5022/PRE and 2023/5113/P and the removal of the side retaining wall at basement level under scheme ref: 2022/5022/PRE.
- 11.12 Whilst applications ref: 2022/5022/PRE and 2023/5113/P are closest in design terms, applications ref: 2017/0357/P, 2022/0127/P and 2023/5113/P are most similar in terms of the amount of existing structure that could be retained. The principal differences being the degree to which the side elevation would need to be rebuilt under

application ref: 2023/5113/P and the extent to which the rear retaining wall and wall beneath the rear elevation at basement level could be retained.

- 11.13 The amount of reconstructive works required is largely driven by the condition of the existing building, the alterations required to bring the development into compliance with statutory standards, the creation of a new third floor and the proposed alterations to the building layout, with associated changes to elevations. As detailed, many of these works would be required regardless of the development option selected.
- 11.14 Policy D3 of the London Plan seeks to ensure that, "development is of the most appropriate form and land use for the site".
- 11.15 The form of the proposed development is broadly set by its surroundings. The site is positioned at the end of a terrace of similar building, of a similar scale. To optimise site capacity, an increase in the size of the building on the site is proposed in the form of a new third floor roof extension on the main building, a new first floor at the rear and an extension of the basement area. These changes are in line with the buildings neighbouring the site and for the reasons set out in this study, will significantly improve the quality of accommodation that can be provided.
- 11.16 Planning permission for an additional floor on the main building and rear extension were previously granted approval under application ref: 2017/0357/P and have recently been recommended for approval under application ref: 2022/0127/P. They can therefore be considered a sensitive form of development that optimise site capacity in accordance with Policy D3 of the London Plan.
- 11.17 Planning application ref: 2023/5113/P builds on the proposals contained within applications ref: 2017/0357/P and 2022/0127/P and will provide a better quality and quantum of accommodation for the reasons outlined.
- 11.18 The above ground scale of the development proposed under application ref: 2023/5113/P is smaller than that approved under planning application ref: 2017/0357/P. The proposed basement extension is small in scale and the potential damage to neighbouring

properties as a result of these works has been assessed to be "Negligible" to "Very Slight".

- 11.19 As detailed, the extension of the basement proposed under application ref: 2023/5113/P will have little impact on the amount of existing structure that needs to be demolished due to the works required at the property regardless of the development option selected. These works include, but are not limited to, the underpinning of all retained structure at basement level, the replacement of the basement slab and the demolition and reconstruction of the existing rear extension.
- 11.20 Policy D3 of the London Plans states, "The best use of the land needs to be taken into consideration when deciding whether to retain existing buildings in a development".
- 11.21 For the reasons detailed above, the proposed development will provide the most appropriate form and land use for the site. The scale of the proposed development is smaller above ground level than that previously approved under planning application ref: 2017/0357/P and recently recommended for approval under planning application ref: 2022/0127/P. However, the scheme will provide a better quantum and quality of accommodation.
- 11.22 For the reasons outlined in this study, alternative development options involving a reduced scope of works would be less optimal.
- 11.23 A detailed assessment of the works required to implement the proposed scheme has been undertaken. It has shown that the amount of demolition required to implement a scheme of this scale, involving the creation of residential units at the site, is broadly similar regardless of the development option selected. This is due to the condition of the existing building and alterations required to bring the development into compliance with statutory standards and requirements.
- 11.24 In terms of application ref: 2023/5113/P, the elements of existing building structure that could be retained are the following:
  - Part of the side elevation of the building\*
  - Part of the front elevation of the building\*\*

- Side and front retaining walls at basement level
- Part of the walls forming the vaults to the front of the property

\*Works to temporarily support these elements will be complicated for and will cause localised damage. These elements will need to be repaired and upgraded to current standards.

\*\* As set out in the structural report, these elements are in a poor state of repair and will need to be partially rebuilt/repaired

- 11.25 An assessment of the works required to implement the proposals contained within planning applications ref: 2017/0357/P and 2022/0127/P has shown that the amount of existing structure that could be retained is broadly similar to application ref: 2023/5113/P. The principal differences being the extent to which the side elevation could be retained and the removal of the wall beneath the rear elevation and rear retaining wall at basement level under scheme ref: 2023/5113/P.
- 11.26 The existing main building and rear extension have been affected by subsidence. An Insurance claim relating to the subsidence of the main building was successfully made in 1990. A further claim relating to the subsidence of the rear extension was successfully made in 2012 (Further details are provided at Appendix F).
- 11.27 In both cases, the presence of Plane trees adjacent to the site was determined to be the cause of the movement. As detailed in the structural report, significant cracking was noted within the structure during the inspection of the building, with evidence of movement associated with subsidence observed.
- 11.28 As a result of this damage and to safeguard against future movement, the existing rear extension will need to be demolished and rebuilt (Structural Report paragraphs 4.2, 5.5, 7.1 & 7.2). Noting, that this structure was constructed in 1993 and so was less than 19 years old when structural movement occurred.
- 11.29 To safeguard against future movement in the main building, any retained structure will need to be underpinned to a sufficient depth (Structural Report paragraphs 5.2, 7.2 & 7.13).

- 11.30 As a result of the previous insurance claims that were made and history of subsidence, it is no longer possible to insure the property against subsidence on standard terms. This issue is not limited to the existing building in its current format and will affect converted flats at the property.
- 11.31 In considering the scope of any development planned at the site, the ability of future owners to secure insurance on the building on standard terms needs to be taken into account. Any development option resulting in an inability to obtain full cover will risk being blighted, potentially causing significant problems for future owners, and their ability to raise mortgages, and for the developer when they come to sell. Any development option that does not address this issue could reasonably be considered unviable.
- 11.32 To ensure that a property on the site is an insurable risk on standard terms, it has to be a new building (See CCI Brokerage letter at Appendix C). Any development of the site will need to address this issue.
- 11.33 The implementation of the proposed scheme will result in the demolition of a large proportion of the existing building fabric, based on a reasonable assessment of the alterations required and the information provided in the structural report. Elements of structure that are retained will need to be repaired and upgraded to meet current standards. For the reasons set out above, any scheme of this form involving the creation of residential units at the site, will require a similar level of destructive works.
- 11.34 Regardless of the development option selected, significant structural works will be required at the property for the reasons set out in the structural report which concludes, "It is our view that a retention and repair approach would require and result in largely new structural refurbishment anyway, but that piecemeal construction has significant disadvantages; it is harder to control, the results are often of varied quality and works to temporarily support structure will be complicated and inefficient. Under the current proposals, the building needs to be largely reconstructed. If left in its current configuration, significant structural repair and upgrading works would still be required".
- 11.35 The existing and proposed buildings are of a similar style and incorporate similar materials, meaning that many materials salvaged from the existing building could be reused in the new development.
- 11.36 Elements that could be retained, such as part of the existing front elevation are in a poor condition and of poor appearance, having been partially rebuilt in the past, and are already showing signs of structural distress such as evident cracking and bulging. Works to temporarily support these structures will be complicated and will result in further damage, requiring localised rebuilding that will further degrade the appearance of the building.
- 11.37 Given the small amount of structure that could be retained and other significant factors affecting the site outlined above, reconstruction is considered the most appropriate option. It will safeguard the future of the development and provide a better quality scheme, that will improve the street scene and meet the higher standards required for newbuild properties.

# 12.0 Appendix A

#### **Structural Report**

# 13.0 Appendix B

#### **Construction Audit**

# 14.0 Appendix C

#### **CCI Brokerage Letter**

# 15.0 Appendix D

#### **Overlay & Demolition Drawings**

# 16.0 Appendix E

#### Planning Application Ref: 2017/0357/P

# 17.0 Appendix F

#### **Insurance Claims**